

Members' Library Service Request Form

Date of Document	15/01/18
Originator	Paolo Vestri
Originator's Ref (if any)	
Document Title	Comments submitted in on-line Budget Consultation, December 2017

Please indicate if access to the document is to be "unrestricted" or "restricted", with regard to the terms of the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985.

Unrestricted	Restricted	

If the document is "restricted", please state on what grounds (click on grey area for dropdown menu):

For Publication			

Additional information:

Authorised By	1 and Sent	
Designation		
Date	10/1/18.	

For Office Use Only:	
Library Reference	
Date Received	
Bulletin	

ALL QUALITATIVE RESPONSES TO THE 2017 BUDGET CONSULTATION

A total of 618 comments were made by respondents to the on-line 2017 Budget Consultation. The comments made by residents and East Lothian Council have been separated out, although it should be noted that some ELC staff are also residents.

The breakdown of comments detailed in this report are as follows:

1. (1 – 156)	Comments on Priorities Question (Residents)
--------------	---

- 2. (157 188) Comments on Priorities Question (East Lothian Council staff)
- 3. (189 450) Comments on Options in 'Hard Choices' Question/ Any other comments (Residents)
- 4. (451 590) Comments on Options in 'Hard Choices' Question/ Any other comments (ELC Staff)
- 5. (591 618) Comments on Options in 'Hard Choices' Question / Any other comments (Respondents who did not identify as resident or ELC Staff)

1. COMMENTS ON PRIORITIES QUESTION (RESIDENTS)

	Please use the box below to share any comments you have - Please use the box below to share any comments you have
1	A pretty ridiculous question - it's like asking parents which child they want to keep. Just because I might put schools as #1 it doesn't mean I think protecting children from harm and support for families is NOT vital too. If this is a 'consultation' so you can then close e.g. libraries by saying nobody prioritised them, it'll be an incredibly sad and backwards move.
2	A very emotive list to choose from, of course children should be protected but there seems to be adequate services so far and a lot of money already put into these services
3	All these services are important but imaginative way in which they are delivered could provide savings and efficiencies.
	Can sport & physical activity and other recreational type activities play a role more in young people and older adults and reduce costs in the essential services for the long term; health prevention
4	All are equally important in a caring society.
5	All of the above are critical. Investing in schools and early years should also support protecting families and preventing homelessness, with the attainment focus being on building supportive relationships within (&for) school communities.
	Waste and recycling is also critical - building more job creation into recycling can help other social /economic areas too
6	All of the above are essential to a healthy, diverse, functioning society. To be asked to choose which of these are most important is asking the wrong question, and ignoring the key issues of why the council is not being adequately resourced to begin with.

	The roads in East Lothian are already terrible. The resources for East Lothian schools are already inadequate, and put children at risk. Parent councils are already paying for some school staff via their own community raised funds (i.e. Yester School lunchtime supervisors). In other schools, the ratio of supervision is currently 1 adult to 100 children aged 4-7 years. Some schools have zero play resources, and while the drafting of a play policy is a welcome addition, without extra resources to implement this, it is without benefit for many schools.
	The cost to enter leisure centres and swimming pools is already prohibitive for many families.
	I am unable to select five categories in good conscience from the list above.
	If the long term strategy for the UK does not involve investing in its people by way of the provision of good public services, then the long-term trajectory of UK as a society and as an economy is alarming.
7	All of the above are important to people and will depend on where they live and how they use/need the service so it is not useful to have one result that fits all.
8	All of the services listed in question 1 above are worthy of as much funding as can be managed. None should be cut. Centralising school services by shutting small rural schools would sound a death knell to the local community. Many families just would not move into the area if there was not a local village school. My husband and I chose to move to the Stenton area from Edinburgh because of the existence of Stenton school. Many parents and children prefer a small village school over a large one as they provide a different style of teaching, where all pupils across the year groups can get to know each other and learn how to get along with children of all ages. Teachers and pupils also can get to know each other extremely well in the small school environment. We have had quite a few children come to Stenton School from other schools where they were having problems with bullying. The welcoming and caring nature of our school transformed those pupils experiences, and allowed them to blossom in the small school environment. Quite simply, there is nowhere for a bully to hide in a small school and any potential problem can be picked up and dealt with quickly. The local community has always had a strong relationship with the school - many people with no kids or older kids will still attend the very popular Nativity, school play and numerous other fairs and coffee mornings which the school and village council organise together. This can be a genuine lifeline for many older members of the community. Please do not close Stenton Primary - it is a great school and the local community and indeed the rest of East Lothian, would be all the poorer if it was to close.
9	All of these are priorities.
10	All of those services are important!!
11	All services are required as items such as parks and open spaces will help with the longer term mental health and wellbeing - as will community centres allowing many to get out and see others
	Do not treat the problems after they have developed only, but place measures that help prevent such issues growing out of control longer term at the top of the priority list.
	This includes leisure facilities, cultural and art activities, as they are the key longer term to a better quality of life but if the basic infrastructure is not there quality of life is eroded away!

12	All services listed are important, but transport has major cost implications, short and long term, that impact on other areas, and should therefore be carefully reviewed in terms of impact on Health, Air quality, education, transport costs, congestion, housing, planning, and infrastructure. Revenue generation and cost savings should both be prioritised.
	Tax revenue should also be reviewed. The wealth exists to support better public services. It is beneficial for everyone in the long term that the whole population is better provided for through educating and health, therefore taxation also requires to be reviewed.
	Finally, efficiency of existing services should be better planned and managed in order to utilise available funds more effectively.
13	All these service are important. Concerned that choice is for top 5 and what is "important" A further explanation perhaps of question would be useful
14	All veterans who live in Kitchener Crescent in Londniddry show have permit car badge, no parents to drop off kids in crescent but to use car park at football park. Veteran houses are for disability service men and council must show support
15	All of these services are important.
16	As a group protecting children from harm and supporting families shouldn't be the same. Whilst wanting to protect children, I'm not always sure that the money on supporting families is spent in the best ways.
17	As a resident of a small community in Stenton we are very reliant on our village school to bring our community together. It is an important & valued asset to the village for not only the young families but also the older generations who take great pride in seeing their children's children enjoy the same level of learning as they did. I'm concerned my children's education is once again at the forefront of budget cuts after the Stenton Parents were assured by Fiona Robertson only less than a few months ago whilst recruiting our new head teacher that East Lothian Council take pride in being 'committed to keeping rural schools open". I feel deeply disappointed in the councils proposals to disadvantage any children in terms of education whether restricting music tuition or closing down an entire school. Our children are the forefront of our future surely we should be doing all we can to nurture learning instead of restricting opportunity!
18	As Council Services contract every assistance should be given to communities to take up control of local service provision. There is a dysfunctional TSI in East Lothian. Community Learning and Development have a direct role in strengthening communities and building confidence. Empowered communities could assess changing needs and accept control of some local services. Communities could run libraries, tend gardens and community allotments, create garden shares, community learning hubs, village halls - but this has to be thought through - the communities would need to have the resources for energy costs, building maintenance. Their purpose should be to deliver services not use all monies to repair the roof. Be realistic - all premises which are nearing the end of their design life should be demolished and sites cleared.
	Waste and recycling services could be re-jigged to a less frequent pick up service. Rubbish only emptied every four weeks, food every two. Garden waste can be stored for 36 hours and its bulk is reduced by 60%. People tidy their gardens the day before their bin gets emptied - hence the bulk.
	Continue with process of planting wild flowers rather than 'tended gardens'. Cutting cycles could be extended - East Lothian's farm lands are devoid of insect life, pesticide and productivity have taken care of them. Leave the green spaces with longer grass to compensate. Only cut

football pitches/sports grounds/greatly increase the rough on golf courses/leave a greater margin of long grass on road verges - just cut sufficient for sight-lines for pedestrians, cyclists, car drivers.
I ticked the subsidised public transport box as Priority 2 but this is for the rural bus routes which serve isolated communities not for every adult over 50 to have a free bus pass.
Can we turn off street lights at 02.00 am? Would that create an energy saving. Everyone now has a flashlight on their smartphone for emergencies.
There are museums in East Lothian which are very rarely visited. Some are place based - such as Prestongrange. But others hold various collections. Could they be rationalised? Is there a central store which would hold all materials then there could be interest over a programme of fresh exhibits/new displays.
Services to protect adults and children are statutory provision. The Council has to do so and demand will rise further as the years go by. Could East Lothian use capital budgets to create a learning programme for carers of both children and adults - work further with QMU. Value carers by paying living wage, designing worthwhile training resulting in a respected, progressive educational framework resulting in better staff retention, satisfaction and service delivery.
Business can look after itself. It rarely hands money back to the state, why should local government support businesses - there are national agencies who are funded to do this work.
The LOIP does not make great reference to health. Enjoyleisure runs sports centres well. There are queues for gyms in the evening. Not quite sure what purpose Meadowmill serves. Could the local Community Sports Hub run that facility?
As much money as possible needs to be invested in our schools to educate & help the future generations
As with all local authorities senior management reviews and consolidation of roles and responsibilities will help reduce the burden on the local population.
Care in the Community is essential if hospitals and care homes are not to be overloaded. It is already seriously underfunded and needs to be bolstered and not cut.
Children, the elderly and the homeless, in that exact order, are the most vulnerable and in most need of extra money from this budget.
The quality of education, facilities and number of staff in East Lothian schools in particular has taken a nose dive over the past few years and this must be addressed. It is both unacceptable and inexcusable that schools in East Lothian are having to ask parents to buy dictionaries for the classrooms; repeatedly begging parents to help with everyday learning activities such as reading groups because they cannot afford teaching assistants; and are incapable of improving problematic situations with certain children because of the 'presumption of mainstreaming', which is not backed up by any significant additional budget from either the local council or the Scottish Government. This presumption is entirely based on cost-cutting measures as far as I can tell, and does no-one any good. Not the 'troubled' children, nor the teachers, and especially not the rest of the class who have their lessons disrupted daily, hourly, and even more regularly. Everyone suffers.

23	Choosing only 5 from the above is unfair, ranking 1 to 13 should be allowed.
24	Close all the tiny schools and send the children to larger more diverse schools
25	Closure of rural schools where the intake numbers often vary hugely from year to year is extremely short sighted
26	Communities need schools- we can't close schools if the communities surrounding the schools are expanding.
27	Community centres and libraries provide a valuable centre of a community and allow it to support the more vulnerable members of society. Without services like libraries many people wouldn't have access to information and internet required for job applications and self help etc.
	Schools also help people build a community and are hugely important to allowing smaller communities to flourish and attract people and associate money to the locations.
28	Considering the large amount of new housing currently being built in the county any school closures are short sighted. Established local schools are the back bone of local communities and redesign of catchments would be sensible.
29	Creating a robust strong economy is important to provide jobs which would raise standard of living in the county and tourism is most important element of local economy providing much needed local jobs with flexible arrangements
30	Don't shut the village schools
31	Education along with Health & Social Care should be the Councils main priority services.
32	Education and social care are most important, business support is needed to support the economy. Things like pet projects (core paths) to be used by very few are frivolous in the current climate
33	Education in rural schools is so important as well as being park of the community
34	Education is very important to me. Schools are too big and small schools should be priority. My son is in a small school with learning support which was cut in his last year at primary school due to budgets. This is unacceptable. He needs this support to learn.
35	Due to the large number of family homes east Lothian has committed to building in and around east Lothian villages, cuts to transport or closing schools would be disastrous for future generations living in the county.
36	Dunbar - street lighting. Light pollution. In a low crime area, unnecessary number of street lights. Particularly wasteful use of power on Kellie Road which has woodland along most of its length. Typical town street: Church Street, where the street lights are too close together and too high so they shine directly into second-floor windows. Street lights pointing downwards at the height of the old gas lamps would be ideal.
	20 mph speed limit necessary throughout Dunbar but methods to reduce speeding on town roads essential. Efforts to get speed bumps, road narrowing have proved fruitless over the years and we suffer from speeding drivers.
	Light on the steps leading down from Old Kirk Close to Church Street. This time of year it is dangerous and one is likely to step on dog faeces unless one carries a torch.

	Cycle path from cement works to Skateraw - brilliant BUT path is already beginning to break up and needs maintained. Cycle path from the roundabout to the cement works was upgraded a few years ago but badly needs resurfacing.
	Re-surfacing of Countess Road. There are large gaps in the road surface on both sides which are particularly dangerous for cyclists. Injury to lead to large compensation claims to the council
	Spott roundabout. dangerous for cyclists and pedestrians crossing here. Vision obscured by keep left signs and traffic comes from the east often at high speed. Additionally, a path for pedestrians and cyclists up to Spott village would be a good safety measure. It is a dangerous road with increasing traffic.
	Weed spraying in the town. Surely council must be aware this is a mid-20th century attitude to weeds with toxins running down into the ground water. Workmen with a hoe and a wheelie can do the job safely and more efficiently at less cost.
	Grass cutting of roadside verges. A number of councils now rake up the cut grass to allow wild flowers to flourish. Soggy, wet deposits of wet grass are detrimental to biodiversity.
	Council have already wasted vast amounts of money on parking machines, signs, traffic wardens at seaside locations. Scrap the charges!
	More houses opposite Deer Park Cemetery? This is not for local people and there is not the infrastructure to cater for a continued influx of population in the town. There is minimal amount of social housing, which is needed. The nature of the town is being destroyed by large housing estates surrounding the centre
	Reduce inflated salaries of senior permanent council staff.
37	Education should be encouraged all children who want to learn in a small environment should be safe to do so
38	Education should be the top priority for all councils nationwide. Child protection followed by other community services that cannot be self-funded should be the next highest priority.
39	education, education and education
40	Education, social care and infrastructure are core services that should be protected by any council in Scotland. Education and community support has traditionally been strong in East Lothian and should remain a priority.
41	Encourage a more diverse income stream (perhaps managed by the Council (with support from professional fundraisers/development directors to provide what we have traditionally expected from 'public services,' - part funded by users, part funded by Trusts & Foundations, part funded by Lottery, CSR campaigns. Consider privately run services. Consider user funding (at point of use - so you opt in to school services when you need them, elderly services when you need them etc).
42	Everything listed above is equally important it is disgusting that the Council is asking these loaded questions. Obviously it sits well with conscience to say that their actions are guided with public opinion and collective responsibility rather than good and wise governance.
43	I have many issues which worry meroads, recycling etc.

My main concern is the threatened closure of Stenton Primary School. I live in Biel Estate. I cannot stress enough that the school is the heart and soul of the community. Of course the teaching has always been excellent and the children are so happy and secure in the environment. Where would you want your child to go, if you lived in Stenton? Dunbar school is already bursting at the seams.
From the school the children learn about gardening, singing, acting which then leads on to the horticultural society, the local choir, the local footlights. These things are the life line of the whole Stenton community. Closing the school would be a total disaster for the children and the future survival of our very special community in which the children flourish and the next generation.
Green bins are not collected enough. Especially when you have children in nappies. Maybe you could provide a separate bin for disposable nappies as it is disgusting having them lying in the green bin for 2 weeks. Also recycling boxes are a nuisance especially in windy weather the blue covers do not stop stuff from blowing out. I think you should provide proper bins for recycling as I notice some people who live rurally seem to already have them. How can we be expected to recycle everything when there is never enough room in one box to last two weeks and it's hard to carry them to the pavement when you have more than 1 box.
HYBRID SERVICE PROVISION While it is easy to separate costs according to the categories above, many of these are not mutually exclusive and a more holistic approach to service provision (e.g. locating community and education centres / libraries alongside recycling / reuse / repair facilities to increase awareness and education in all areas simultaneously could deliver positive outcomes, more efficiently.
LONG TERM BENEFITS OF STRATEGIC SERVICES PRIORITISATION By focusing on early years education and health and fitness facilities, greatest benefits can be achieved in the longer term as a healthier, better educated population will be a relatively lesser burden on the state in terms of welfare, health and criminal justice services. However, this needs to be joined up with reinforcing a sense of communal responsibility, which must include maintaining the provision of local schools, particularly including smaller rural schools, well maintained and accessible leisure and sports facilities, community hubs (libraries, community halls / centres, etc.), and avoiding mass education for cost reasons, at the expense of community and individual engagement and commitment.
NATIONAL SERVICE Can a local authority pioneer a potentially nationwide scheme to introduce a civic national service in order to engage young people with key aspects of the functioning of society? This would simultaneously provide vocational training to participants, while also helping to deliver services that otherwise require full separate funding.
I am the Chair of First Step and strongly urge the Council to continue funding for the project. I would like First Step to be given the opportunity to deliver more front line services to support young children and families.
We have been using Prestongrange as a "nature-based" classroom and would strongly support increasing the opportunities available at Prestongrange, allowing groups to use it for income-generation purposes. I think it is vitally important for community-based groups to become more independent to allow them to fill the service provision gap.

47	I am very concerned to hear that two village schools are being considered for closing. Rural schools are vital to communities and are at the heart of village life and rural communities. Families would not want to live here without the school and it would be hugely disruptive and upsetting for the children in the school. The school is the key to the community and without it, the impact would be felt by the whole community and not just the children.
48	I believe it is vital in small communities for a school to remain open regardless of what is deemed necessary to save money. If the means testing of free extra musical education would save rural schools this is an easy choice. it's almost embarrassingly obvious.
49	I don't think there is a need for crossing patrols at traffic lights. this dos not teach children how to use the lights as they do it for them
50	I feel strongly that we have to invest in children in the early years providing them with the very best quality learning. Outdoor learning should be at the heart of this.
	Services to protect children from harm should be priority and community centres which could be used to operate other services from.
	Subsidised transport and support for the elderly should be targeted to reach the most vulnerable and needy.
51	I feel that access to local schools for rural communities is vital and that these should be protected.
	I also feel that although I can only select 5 options above I feel each of the other options are equally important and should not be cut. Instead austerity politics should be cut and people should pay for the services we want to have.
52	I feel that local smaller primary schools are vitally important to maintain.
53	I feel that we should invest in schools and the early years to help generate good citizens that care more about their environment, surroundings and community.
54	I find it hard to believe that these services are in the firing line. All are needed in a community - rurally to keep youth and enterprise in the countryside you need schools and sports centres. But also you need culture and for our grandparents to be protected. All of these services are needed by each generation to create a protected and viable community. There needs to be another way. You are proposing we take from the old to allow the young to exist and vice versa or perhaps take the libraries and sports centres away from the teens and everyone-I thought we valued education and health. What on earth is going on?
55	I have just looked at your website trying to find this questionnaire and firstly I would like to say WHAT THE HELL you want a FLAG hmmmmmm maybe that's top of the list what the biggest waste of tax payers money!!!!!!!??????????????????????????????
56	I have no higher words to convey how happy it make us, that my wife and I have chosen the best school for our children. The amount of activities are so varied there is never a day goes by the kids come out happy and smiling and I can't shut them up about their day. It may be a small school but the amount of amazing children that are coming out of it are pretty special and I know that numbers fluctuate but I think it would be tragic to close these amazing facilities where I know the council can save money on numerous other things which are far too many to list now.

57	I haven't ticked 'schools' - blimey, if you can't provide schools as a given without asking us to rank it, why do you all get up in a morning? I haven't ticked 'protect children' because I see this as a national priority - central funding, children's panel etc.
58	I heard there is a proposal to close Stenton and Humbie primary schools. I don't have children and live in the Stenton area, I understand these schools will be more expensive to run than those with higher roll numbers but they are an important part of the community.
59	I think I cannot select the top 5. They are all very important and by not selecting an area I am indicating that I do not think it as important as another area.
60	I think it is essential to protect our village schools, They offer excellent teaching and a hub to villages.
61	I think it is very important to keep local schools open they are very important to there communities. Stenton school has always & will always be a great asset to children in their learning process. The larger schools have increased numbers of children with the housing increase in various areas. My other concern is the state of the country roads potholes everywhere whilst town roads & paths are frequently resurfaced country people pay there council tax as well.
62	I think it would make sense to close some of the many small schools in East Lothian - eg Humbie, East Saltoun, Athelstaneford etc.
63	I think they are all high priority.
64	I think we need to subsidise public transport in this rural part of the county
65	I understood that some of the funding for these these choices were "ringfenced" that for I haven't included them in my choices,.
66	I was previously a student at Stenton Primary School and I enjoyed the close links with the school and community, if the school were to close it would have an impact not only on the pupils but the wider community. The school offers new parents and members of the community the chance to meet and socialise with others in the village and surrounding areas. The primary school has played a key role in creating the tight knit community of the village today and without it the next generation of pupils and residents will never have the same bond that we have all experienced.
67	I would like services to improve environmental performance in East Lothian - that is concerning reduced single use plastic, reduced diesel fumes and reduced pollution. This should be the number one priority in everything the council does
68	I would like to choose all of the options available above. It is impossible to rank them in a meaningful order. All of the services are vital in our communities.
69	If more people were allocated homes who would actually be paying rent & council tax then the council wouldn't be in such a predicament.
70	If you did not waste money on stupid consultations about vanity project like your tarting up outside the old court building or the proposals for the High Street and there are other instances around East Lothian, you might have saved a bob or two.

71	I'm really concerned by the possibly of losing school crossing staff. They are vital to our kids safety, and also in giving them some independence in getting to school without parents as they grow up. We live in a town where the traffic in the mornings is too fast and busy to consider letting kids cross roads without adult supervision. Our kids need more crossing patrol staff, not have them removed.
72	I'm sorry but I really don't think this is a sensible way to have a conversation about council spend. A number of these are statutory and so must be provided by you, others not. A sensible discussion would look at how generic community named services like libraries and schools contribute short medium and long term to improved quality of life and preventing homelessness. I am not going to rate in this way I do not think it's helpful.
73	In times of economic pressure museums/arts/cultural/heritage activities and events are a luxury and should not be prioritised. If people want these activities then they should have to pay substantially more for them. The same could also be said for swimming pools/leisure centres. Libraries are important but opening hours could be reduced and they should include more arts/cultural/heritage events.
	Community/village halls are important but they are not used every day of the week for 52 weeks of the year. Perhaps some need to be shared between villages/libraries etc.
74	Investment into improving children and adults lives is essential and must be a priority especially where there is inequality
75	It is difficult to choose just 5 areas of concern, all are important.
76	It is imperative that rural schools are kept open. They are at the heart of our small villages and keep them vibrant. The primary schools of Dunbar, West Barns and East Linton are all at near capacity. With the planned new house buildings in Dunbar/West Barns. and East Linton they will reach that capacity. Stenton Primary, is a wonderful school. The numbers will rise when the children and babies reach the school age. Money has already been saved with the appointment of a shared Head Teacher. Money could be saved by extending the travel limit from two to three miles in the county. Why not widen the catchment area as another possibility???
	The Council need to appoint more Carers for the Community if they want the elderly and frail to remain in their own homes.
77	It is not really possible to order these in priority because we cannot do without certain essential services. We must educate and protect our children and provide basic services for homeless and vulnerable people. However, we also need efficient waste and recycling services and maintenance of roads.
	If possible we need good leisure facilities and libraries, plus museums and cultural events plus support for business ventures to keep our local economy working. Equally if we dispense with subsidised public transport then many people will be isolated and communities cut off for those without transport of their own.
78	It is problematic that you cannot give items on this list equal waiting. I do not consider protecting vulnerable children and vulnerable frail elderly adults to be weighted differently, however, I could not give them equal priority. In addition, I could not rate many things I consider important because of the restriction of five things. I recognise East Lothian Council has difficult decisions to make. However, I hope it is very careful in the way it reports the results of this survey. It does not reflect how important people think the items on the lists are, it reflects the items people feel are most important when forced to choose.

79	It is so difficult to pick just 5. These are all important elements of any decent community!
80	It is vital for villages to keep their schools and village Hall/community centres as it is the life line for these communities. Otherwise they become ghost villages.
81	It seems impossible to compare some of these services. They're so different and yet essential!
82	It's almost impossible to prioritise these services! All are very important - most vital.
83	Local schools are a vital part of small villages and communities. Even if they are not full. They're should be a bigger push from council's to encourage people to send there children to them.
84	Looking after our young and old people should be a top priority for all councils
85	Maintaining children in local schools is essential to life rural communities and the wellbeing of the children. If schools close that impacts on hard working families time and increases road use and pollution to educate them in larger conurbations.
	Tourism is vital to East Lothian's economy so keeping the open spaces at their current high-level together with the arts and cultural centres is also very important.
86	Maintaining village schools is a very high priority - small villages will become less attractive places to live if the current village schools are not maintained, and the future of the villages will be in doubt.
87	Many senior citizens could not afford the full train fare from N Berwick to Edinburgh and to take the bus would be uncomfortable and no toilets. Also senior citizens rely on our excellent library service
88	Most of these questions are not really gradeable in good governance, surely! Some questions missing from this survey
	Invest in tax avoidance prevention
	Increase Council tax by 5% maintaining support for the worst off
	Increase age of bus concession to 67
	Introduce a land tax for land owners except primary food producers, eg farmers
	Increase national income tax by 2p for the lowest going up by increments: 4,8,16,32
	Higher Tax on toxic products and activities such as alcohol, gambling, tobacco, other recreational drugs (legalise the less harmful ones first), air fares.
	These sort of economics create wealth and welfare and help reduce the degradation of the planet (note Norway)
	If the greedy wealthy clear out of this country with their unshared wealth and businesses, let them go. They are not contributing enough to be worth the space they take. Their public donations (often undercover) are usually made to partisan political parties and this contributes to bolstering in-fighting and corruption between the parties who should be focussed on what needs to be done for the country.

89	My biggest worry is regarding the closure of schools and cuts the education. These should be the last places cuts should be found. I am personally shocked and disappointed to even thinking of cuts to schools and especially closing rural schools. Especially knowing children are being turned away from our local school facing the decision.
90	My children went to Stenton primary. They received an excellent education and the backup option for the Stenton kids now would be the huge Dunbar Grammar. Smaller schools are much more personal and I can't see how you can squeeze any more kids into Dunbar anyway! please don't close Stenton
91	My view would be that services for children and families, including education, and for the older population are the most vital things society can provide for its citizens. Cultural and heritage activities, parks and gardens while valuable services should not be a priority at times of austerity.
92	NB is going slowly downhill with infrastructure suffering through lack of funds. Perhaps not priority in overall scheme of things but poor seating in Lodge, scruffy chain "fencing" around putting green (in places a trip hazard). Loss of murals and tiled display at the harbour etc. Council do excellent job on horticulture and important that it is maintained.
93	Not nearly sufficient options to this question. I would have prioritised all options if given the chance.
94	Obviously all the services are important and savings should only be made where feasible/possible. Care must be taken to ensure the most vulnerable of our communities (children and old people) - who are likely not filling in this consultation - are not disadvantaged by the outcome of the consultation.
95	Our vulnerable people should be prioritised but I also feel that Libraries can act as Community hubs
96	Our whole planet depends on effective ways to minimise human impact on the environment. This has to be the first priority for the council.
	Early years has to be the most effective way to impact the full gamut of social problems. The return in investment in pre-school and primary school children is potential enormous. It has to be a very high priority. That includes keeping children safe.
	Care of the elderly and vulnerable adults to keep them out of hospital is safer and cheaper than our cultural dependence on NHS services.
97	Outdoor education may seem a small and insignificant part of the education system. However as a now adult who not long ago went through school in East Lothian, many of my best memories and most valuable learning experiences as a child came via the outdoor education department. They teach young people about the environment in which they live and how best to use and enjoy it without causing harm. I can't imagine a world without outdoor education.
98	Parking In the Musselburgh Mansfield area is absolutely shocking for the residents that live in it! Make it one way. diagonal parking would fit more cars in and allow for emergency services to get through
99	People's wellbeing being physical or mental have to take priority this includes education.
100	Please put the money into things for the children. They are our future.

101	Prestonpans has the Town Hall, Community Centre and Penny Pity of which lie empty for most of the week. We also have various church halls and school halls for community use. Both the Primary and Infant schools will soon be over crowded.
	Demolish the Community Centre and build a combined school on the site using the land at the back as sports fields. The cost of the project could be covered by selling both school sites to private developers. This would also save a head teacher's salary as only one be required and reduce running costs of three buildings into one.
	Furthermore move Council services into the Library and then Aldhammer House could be sold or converted to council housing which again would reduce running costs and create income/
102	Priority should always be given to the very young, very old and vulnerable people in our community
103	Providing local access to quality schools for all is vital in my opinion.
104	Providing transport to high schools is important as roads are national speed limit and no pedestrian crossing in some areas
105	Road safety is a big concern. Dunbar is great in that most children can currently walk or cycle to school safely. This should always be a priority.
106	Rural Schools like Humbie are essential to rural communities. They support not only the children and young people in the area but the wider community. This is evidenced in the last few months alone with Humbies PTA firework drawing many individuals from the wider community and the winter market again providing an opportunity for many local businesses to sell their wares to the local and wider community. This survey is an impossible task, I appreciate it is a challenging task for the council to make cuts but I think the impact of a successful community school such as Humbie needs to be taken into account in real life rather than just on paper.
107	Save money by stop paying for taxis for children to go to schools out with catchment areas for families on benefit.
108	School closures in our villages is unacceptable.
109	Schools and particularly rural schools are the lifeblood of communities and vital. Closing rural schools will kill communities.
110	Schools are the life of a village and I was under the impression that the primary's in East Lothian are at breaking point with not enough space either indoors or in the playground- this is definitely a concern of the parents at East Linton.
111	Schools must now share in cost cutting. Education has been ring-fenced to the detriment of other services which have been cut to the bone and beyond.
112	Since many of these are statutory obligations on the Council, rating them seems pointless, as does only allowing 5 choices.
113	Small village schools are not just about teaching children they are also an essential part of the communities they reside in. It is not just about the education element it's about keeping rural villages alive and encouraging new families to join the community.
114	So difficult to choose only 5
115	So difficult to decide - I don't envy the elected members and officials their task.

116	Stop playing petty politics and get real about using the powers you have - raise the council tax to raise revenue, stop wasting money on pointless 'initiatives' (still waiting for any impact of the "close working relationship" with Scotrail) and work with the (democratically elected) Scottish Government instead of trying to undermine everything they do. In short - take up your responsibility to the people of East Lothian
117	Stop subsidising events. Stop organising events at a huge cost.
	Stop paying your road/street/garden workers to stand about doing nothing. More productive work would mean you needed less staff making a large saving. I presume this could be done across the board if everyone worked more productively to tighter timed targets rather than dragging everything out.
	Don't raise council tax, so much of East Lothian is living in poverty why do you want to add to it? Cut money from the top rather than the bottom. Are such large salaries really justified? Are bonuses?
	Cancel the plan for Haddington High Street! This has wasted so much money already before it has even started. The reduction of parking spaces will reduce footfall to the centre of town. This will result in more local businesses closing and yet again more local jobs being lost. Increase Haddington town centre parking! All long stay parking is currently taken up by mainly council staff! How is this encouraging people into a town which desperately needs the footfall?
118	Supporting genuine homelessness, not supporting those who already have a house to have a second. Or housing someone who has not taken care of a previous tenancy.
119	Sustainable travel such as cycling should be a high priority as well. New cycles paths and segregated cycle lanes should be implemented to encourage more people to cycle and NOT drive.
120	The above choices are chosen with the view that school investment should help with the future, all vulnerable people should be looked after and open spaces should help people stay healthy & active.
121	The above is a pretty shabby way of making people make choices that would not apply during any discussion of the issues. Listing things this way is a cheap and shabby way of getting to the heart of the issues.
122	The above list is critically flawed. All of the options should be able to be numbered. All of the options are important. Therefore consultation respondents should be able to assign a precise priority to all 12 options.
123	The children represent our future. It is of paramount priority to care for with kindness and educate them creatively so they can reach their full potential. So they will eventually lead this country to a better future.
124	The closure of small community schools puts huge stresses on family life not only for travel expenses but nursery/ child care cover costs. Rethink your plan in closing these, it's hard to return to work when you have to commit to more expenses but struggle to find the money to pay for it.
125	The council also spends on third sector activity. This needs a serious review in some cases if frontline services are being de-prioritised due to third sector support. E.g. VEL, CEO on close to £60k salary. There are a group of people in East Lothian, in VEL and others, who have grant dependent careers to the point of it being unhealthy for the county and at times this also causes imbalances and unfairness in the local

	economies. This is not best use of limited council funds. In general, inefficiencies and public sector 'light touch' monitoring needs to be reviewed in order that limited council funds are spent as efficiently as possible.
126	The countryside ranger service is important, both for the health and wellbeing of local people, but also to keep the coast and countryside in a healthy state for tourists, who bring money into the area.
127	The future of East Lothian communities, and the opportunities given to the next generation are both underpinned by good Schooling. It is vital that the poor management of our finances does not impact the education of our children. Small, rural communities need local primary schools, and I am shocked to hear of the possible closure of rural schools. With the expanding population of East Lothian, it is extremely short-sighted to consider closing schools just because development and expansion is focused on the main towns of Dunbar, Haddington and North Berwick. We need creative thinking to better distribute growing numbers, and so re-shaping school catchment areas to build rural community networks should be given top priority.
128	The growth in housing in East Lothian is not being matched with infrastructure improvements. Access to primary care is already very difficult. With banks closing and transport limited, risks are greater for older, vulnerable citizens Disabled people and families are suffering from welfare cuts. The council must protect adult social care and child protection.
129	The most vulnerable people in our society need to be protected by council and all alike. Normal healthy people understand what is going on, these people don't and to take services away from them would destroy theirs and the ones who care for them, lives. If charges are also introduced, it could drive some towards poverty.
130	The proposal to close certain schools because they are less than 50% subscribed is short-sighted. Where would these children go? Schools in Dunbar are apparently bursting at the seams.
	The use and cost of taxis to take children to school is absurd and must be extremely expensive and a nice little earner for the taxi companies. Everyone has a car in rural areas, parents could make other arrangements or make sure their children make it to a bus stop to take the school bus.
	Finally having to make 5 preferences in the above survey is sadly short-sighted. Placing the importance of each amenity would have been more sensible.
	The collection of green waste is unnecessary, the council should be encouraging the use of compost bins. Most people have gardens for recycling; those that don't can take their green waste to the local household waste facility. That's how it is down south. Collecting green waste is a luxury!
131	The Scottish government should be fully funding those services it has delegate to Councils, if its mandatory then they should pay for it; and leave the Council to fund local priorities not national ones.
132	The situation with the recycling boxes really needs to change. We desperately need proper bins. On a windy day like last week, I collect 2 full bin bags of rubbish out of my garden that didn't belong to me as the recycling boxes had blown about the street. I have a household of 7 with a standard green bin. I take all my recycling (up to 5 big bags full a fortnight) to Wallyford as those boxes are useless.

133	The use of small local primary schools is fundamental for our local community and without them our village will not survive.
134	The young need to be protected and educated to the highest standards that we can give, they are the future of our county. We also need to keep the public areas looking good including waste management.
135	There should be more than 5 choices, councils need to deal with more than 5 aspect of life
136	There should be no further cuts to education and schools in East Lothian. Services in this area are already falling below standard and extra staffing is needed across all areas particularly additional needs students who need support. This would also relieve pressure and time from class teachers who would then be able to teach all students rather than the whole class being distracted from who are needing extra help
137	These selections may be different if we had a better understanding of which are statutory obligations and which are not.
	Although we have selected maintenance of roads etc as a priority, money could be saved on lighting, in many areas there are too many lights.
138	They are all important.
139	They are ALL important.
140	Think the Council needs to bear in mind that the Council Tax is supposed to keep these services functioning.
141	This is a false set of choices. All of these are fundamental to civilised living. The population pays to be provided with services. The councils must provide these. My solution would be to keep the service delivery people who have direct contact with the public.
	Keep the facilities. Cut back on the bureaucrats. Replace management interaction with on line infrastructure. Hire pensioners like me. My rates are half what you are paying consultants. Alternatively, tell people "you want this? Then pay more"
142	This is a very biased survey. All services are equally important to the community.it is unrealistic to choose only 5 out of ten vital services.
143	This is a very silly survey. Of course protecting children from harm should be your priority. But you've got it on a list with subsidised public transport! What an utter waste of everyone's time.
144	This is not a good question - some of these services (at least 5) are statutory so have to be prioritised. The answers you get may therefore be misleading and in my view (as a professional social science researcher) should be disregarded.
145	This is the absolute stupidest survey that I have ever seen - are you crazy? This is not asked fairly. Top 5 - UTTERLY RIDICULOUS ELC. A high school person would create a better survey and ask real questions
146	This list is rather pre-determined. Overall the services that are at the heart of the community, which are difficult to assess for impact and where KPI and outcomes can be vague may be missed. The heart of the community needs to be supported this in turn has a positive effect on many of the other agendas with more measurable indicators.

147	Very difficult to choose between these options - all are needed at some level! Some affect lots of people (waste, roads) but others tiny minorities (vulnerable adults, children) - but they are no less important to those people - it is almost impossible to rank these on a single scale
	Public transport is very important for daily lives of many commuters like me - but rail travel here is not great and has declined in recent years due to infrastructure problems and overcrowding - but not aware that it is subsidised?
148	Very difficult to choose only 5 as all of these are so important to our communities
149	Very important to keep the local Village Schools open
150	We believe the main priority is funding for schools. Our daughter is in a primary 4 class at Law primary in which there are several disruptive children and the teachers are not in control. The school needs financial support in order to provide necessary infrastructure and help for these children, as they are not progressing and other children in the class are not able to learn in a suitable environment.
151	We should ensure every child is safe and well, has opportunities to be the best he/she can become and to develop social and civic responsibility.
	We should protect and respect those less able to manage independence.
	Children are the future successes or failures. We should help them succeed. They are the carers in years to come. Caring is fundamental to a well ordered and happy society. Carers should be valued and respected at a much higher financial level than at present.
	By focussing on people we can encourage and achieve better civic attitudes, contributions and responses.
152	With the massive increase in housing/population in East Lothian (with planning application declines being overturned by the Government all too often) more Central Government support is required to avoid the creation of an area unable to adequately meet the needs of the people. In fact the outcome here may well be the deterioration of what we have had in the quality of life in this County. Ongoing mismanagement by an incompetent Central Government all too frequently passing the buck to someone else whether it be Local
	Authority or Westminster.
153	Worried that volunteers will no longer be able to help in the parks so the budget needs to reflect this.
154	Would have preferred to list all these services in order - not just top 5
155	You need to make clear that many of these are statutory services! Identity what is extra for social care, education etc.
156	You should be putting pressure on the Scottish Government rather than on the people of East Lothian to make crucial decisions about where to cut money - not on!!

2. COMMENTS ON PRIORITIES QUESTION (EAST LOTHIAN COUNCIL STAFF)

157	All of these services are of course important but as a parent of three primary school age children, my choices reflect our own family priorities.
158	All services above are essential except for libraries in my view.
159	All these services are important. How can a person decide whether the welfare of a frail and vulnerable adult is more important than that of protecting our children and providing quality education? Neither is more Important than the other.
160	Almost all of the above services are of the upmost importance to local communities which makes it extremely hard to select the 'top 5'.
161	As an employee and a resident of East Lothian I have concerns that neither former nor current rent arrears for the councils homeless properties is chased in the same manner as main stream tenancies. The amount owed for these former and current arrears must be approx. £1million pound. As a landlord we are not helping these tenants nor our own general services budget.
162	Education does not receive sufficient funding currently in comparison to other councils
163	Education indoors and Outdoors needs money increased not cut for the good of all of our future!
164	Education is one of the most important things that councils should be working on. It's an absolute disgrace that vulnerable children with learning support needs and behaviour support needs are being targeted with loss of support staff. Nurture is so important in all education years and if this support is given it can help to raise attainment and lead to better education in the future. Leading to better jobs, less poverty and positive parenting in the future.
165	Education should be our flagship investment.
166	Feel care of elderly is extremely important - think how you would like to be treated in your later days
167	I appreciate that it's very difficult for the Council to make choices about the budget but these appear to be loaded questions, skewed to force the answers sought.
168	I do believe that ring-fenced money should not appear on the above list
169	I do not think closing village schools is the answer. You are just creating more of a headache for the larger primaries which are already nearing capacity. Quite often village schools are the main part of a village and are extremely community based and are a source of "life" for the elderly people in villages. If you close the village school you will effectively close the village in the next ten years.
170	I found this very hard to find the top 5 and then decided which of the 5 were least important. All the services provided are important and if cuts are to be made a fear it will be detrimental to the vulnerable.
171	I'd be happy to pay a reasonable charge for the uplift of bulky items. It surprises me that this is still a free service.

172	Included in education is outdoor education centres and facilities as these re very important for the children.
173	Invest in the young people of East Lothian and you won't have as many problems later on. Give the schools the finances to meet the needs of every young person. Stop cutting Exceptional Needs you are failing our children.
174	It is almost impossible to prioritise services - I have ticked education, social services, waste/recycling and maintenance of roads etc as the key priorities but the other areas are also important. However, some of them could potentially be run privately - eg swimming pools/leisure centres, museums, village halls etc - though the outcome of that might be a huge increase in the costs to use these facilities.
	Homelessness is a major problem and becoming worse and solving the problem will require imaginative thinking. For instance, would those with a spare room consider sharing with someone homeless?
	Libraries provide a lifeline for many people but are not easy for all to access due to opening hours or poor transport links.
	Subsidised transport could be done on a means basis as there are many people who do not need travel cards who have them. However, increasing the specified distance from home to school for pupils would only lead to an increase in non-attendance.
175	It is difficult to prioritise. The needs of vulnerable children and adults is paramount however for the wellbeing and mental health of the whole population, the preservation of cultural activities/libraries/arts/green space and maintenance of the streets (litter/graffiti) etc is paramount
176	Most if not all of the services listed above are required by all the residents of East Lothian and are necessary!
177	It is impossible to select which is the most important service as each one is extremely valued and important and a lot of the time it depends on your personal circumstance on the selections made .
178	It's hard to decide which service is more important as all are in their own way. Perhaps other services such as garden aid could be charged for?
179	Not a great deal of point in this question as most are essential services!! Just an excuse to cut the less essential ones even although they are important.
180	Our rural School at Stenton is at the very heart of our community, and has been for almost 140 years. Do not use short term budgetary constraints to end the excellent education and community pillar provided by our School. We will resist any attempt at the closure of rural schools.
	Additionally, we were promised by the Head of Education, Ms Fiona Robertson, in June 2017 that there was 'absolutely no threat of closure to the school'. Given that this is now on the agenda, this has angered the community as a result.
181	Please do not scrap the school crossing patrol services in places where there are no traffic lights. My children are 8 and 10 and they are learning to be more independent by walking to school on their own. There are 2 roads with no near traffic lights on the way, so I cannot be sure that they get to school safely if that service is discontinued.
	Outdoor learning for children is extremely important when child obesity is reaching alarming levels, so I would strongly advocate for not discontinuing this service.

182	Schools need more money not less. Teachers are struggling to meet demands at the moment.
183	Schools play a vital role in the community, providing a hub in any town/village and go hand in hand with supporting vulnerable children.
184	The cuts made in education are going to have a serious long-term impact on the future of our young people.
185	The most important priority is to facilitate the building of community capacity. Investment in local jobs and local businesses is key, as is preserving and promoting local initiatives and facilities, such as community events, celebrations, village schools, etc. All of the rest will follow if our communities become the vibrant and attractive places they should be. Local businesses and local employment mean that young people stay in the county and contribute to its economy, populate its villages and send their children to the village schools. Other services are then protected, such as libraries, swimming pools, etc., Economic policy should steer away from macro economics, the big companies, and focus on the absolutely vital contribution that sole traders and small local companies make to the local and to the national economy.
186	These are all valuable services that we need to keep within the community and very difficult to prioritise.
187	These areas are not comparable. Comparing Education with recycling or maintenance of roads is not possible.
188	We need investment in family support, promoting positive family environments will positively influence the future people of East Lothian. Prevention rather than intervention is best for all people, not just today but also in the future.

3. COMMENTS ON OPTIONS IN 'HARD CHOICES' QUESTION / ANY OTHER COMMENTS (RESIDENTS)

Please use this box to share any comments on the options in the previous question or to tell us any other ways in which you think the Council could do things differently to increase income or save money. Please use this box to tell us any other ways in which you think the Council could do things differently to increase income or save money.	
189	Review a supply of mobile devices and computers to the Council staff - replacements are far too quick and new devices are given out far to easily. Consider repairs rather than instant replacements
	Close down rural schools which have a handful children in attendance; the cost of running such schools makes them an unaffordable luxury in this day and age
	Review procurement services, especially in Education Services. Very expensive educational materials are being purchased without obtaining competitive quotes
190	Shocked to see that the council think its acceptable to propose an increase in council tax to cover budget cuts. The budgets cuts must not be passed on directly to the council tax paying population of east lothian.
	Council must review their internal spending, salaries, bonus, pension schemes etc as these appear in excess of the average for the county. Council must also look at spending review internally before cutting services, over bureaucratic systems of work result in clear inefficiencies. Why don't we get local business people and professionals involved in helping to look at cost saving initiatives within the management of the council body?
191	£2.50 per person to attend the annual fireworks display. (People would pay a lot more to buy their own fireworks so a small entry fee seems acceptable)
	Where there are traffic lights remove the crossing guide for schools. But on dangerous main roads they are needed.
192	Look at long term cost efficiency and value given. E.g. Instead of skimming roads annually, and leaving rural communities with an average cost of £100 per year per car of additional tyre damage due to deep and dangerous potholes, fix the roads properly, and renew them every 10 years. In order to do this, adequate drainage needs to be put in, and the hardstanding needs to extend beyond the road margins. Currently, we have tarmac skimmed on top of mud. Within a week or two, the rain comes, the mud softens, the side of the road collapses, the roads get narrower, and the road condition rapidly deteriorates. It rains in Scotland, plan for it.
	Smarter planning and longer-term planning is required. For example, at East Linton, there is no school playground. However, opposite the school there is a community funded playground, which the children are unable to access due to it being outside school grounds and there being inadequate supervision. The council MUST ask the schools and community of parents what the requirements are, and work out how to integrate these. Greater community access to facilities within schools, outside of school hours would also make better use of these resources.
	Look at rationalising the zoning of rural schools. For example, there are currently approximately 12 children aged 3-8 in Whittingehame (EH41 4QA), which is closer to Stenton school than it is to East Linton. Stenton is a rural school with a very low school roll. East Linton Primary is bursting at the seams and struggling to deal with the impact of new housing developments.

	Due to council school zoning decisions, Whittingehame residents have to send their children to the underfunded over-full school at East Linton, when there is a closer alternative. Why not offer residents who are near rural schools the choice of selecting the school with the lower roll? It would reduce pressure on the village schools, at least in the short-term, giving the council more time to PLAN in advance for the impact of the new housing.
193	Small library annual fee eg 5 pounds pa instead of closing/reducing services
	Car park charges esp long stay parks
	Dog Walking Companies charge for using parks eg Permit for John Muir and other beaches/parks
194	Introduce and increase car parking charges including at railway stations.
	Resist increase in house building until guarantee of assisted funding from developer and/or central govt IN ADVANCE to help for provision of infrastructure i.e. roads, water, gas, sewage, medical centres, schools etc etc
195	Prioritise services for community facing outcomes
	Corporate staffing review and offer voluntary redundancy for staffing
196	5% increase on council tax is huge
197	A council should not be about raising income. A council is there to ensure equal opportunities for all - not matter what the background. Everything that a council does should look at reducing the poverty and attainment gap. It is preposterous that all councils are in a similar situation and having to make impossible choices.
	Please don't just be lured into looking at the cost savings of services but look at the value they provide. Many services may not be statutory but in the long term (greater than a political term!) they provide benefits to society that my yield savings to healthcare and adult social care. This is reflected in answers that prioritize education and health and wellbeing.
198	A higher percentage of the transport budget should be used for sustainable travel such as cycling. Increasing cycling in the area will benefit everybody from school children to the elderly if done properly. There needs to be much more cycling infrastructure to encourage more cycling for commuting and recreational use.
199	Actively encourage people in council buildings to help safe electricity by switching off lights when appropriate. Increase the price of lets
200	All cuts are unacceptable, restructuring council administration and reducing bureaucracy is not mentioned
201	Again would have liked to list all items in order
	Develop partnership web services - do all organisations need separate web presence - group services together. Develop web based services, but ensure issues re digital exclusion are taken into account
	Do we need a gardening service?

202	All I'd like to say is that we are grateful for the services the Council provides, given that central government always seems to be attacking Councils, and we're willing to pay a little more to ensure vulnerable and poorer people get the local support they need.
203	Allocate part of the council car park to public parking that is chargeable. Encourage car sharing schemes or public transport for council employees at John Muir House to compensate for lack of free parking.
204	Allow the community to naturally take care of each other and its elderly etc .
	Spend less time and money on safety regulations.
	Teach people how to recycle their own garden refuse.
	Spray less heavy chemicals/ poisons on parks and public places, involving instead the community to participate in taking care of things. A natural way to exercise and enjoy the outdoors without needing 'Leisure Centres'.
	Less light pollution in rural villages therefore less expense in maintaining it etc
205	Although it seems a logical thing to cut - not a life or death issue - stopping the bulky items collection leads to fly tipping and general stress in the community because of the mess, out of all proportion to the saving. I am sure you have established that already.
	I am tempted to cut the free school transport to 3 miles, difficult for 5, 6, year olds but the rest could mostly get on their bikes to the 2 mile point? Cut down on childhood obesity potentially too?!
206	As a Humbie resident, it is hard to overstate the importance of the school in supporting the community and keeping the village vibrant.
	I find it hard to understand how parking charges could raise the sum suggested. I understand that coastal parking charges haven't raise the sums predicted.
207	As a parent of a child at Stenton Primary school I am deeply upset at the proposal to close our village school. A school which has been the heart of our community for as long as any of us can remember. My son is the 5th generation of our family to attend the school and we have a very strong relationship with the community through decades of involvement mainly through school events. It would be a huge loss to our community as a we take great pride in being inclusive, bringing families together, working together to strengthen our community & taking ownership of our village hall, playpark etc. We worked exceptionally hard together on fundraising for the upkeep and expansion of the village hall, bowling club and playpark to create communal spaces for the use of the whole community.
	Personally I feel there could be cuts made in the school transportation system. If East Lothian came into line with the Scottish Governments guideline of a 3 mile distance rule there could be huge savings made. In a world where we are tackling childhood dietary problems surely the older children should be encouraged to hop on the scooters and bikes where this is possible to do so. Also why is it in the budget to have crossing supervisors positioned to press the button on the traffic lights for families! There are adults supervising their children walking to school being supervised by a crossing supervisor. Surely another review is needed!
	I'm also interested in the proposed parking charges. Could these be brought into the same pass as is purchased for the beaches with an additional fee? It is the norm for us to have to pay for parking anywhere outside East Lothian . Why are we not capitalising on the abundance

	of visitors we receive to our towns? It is the norm everywhere else so I can't see how it will have such a detrimental effect on our high streets and for our local businesses.
	It had been said on numerous occasions by Fiona Robertson at recent meetings regarding the shared headship between Stenton & Innerwick that East Lothian Council is committed to preserving, supporting & ultimately keeping small rural schools open. Please don't let us down! These children are our future and shouldn't be denied the privilege of being educated in the wonderful community that we have worked so tirelessly to create for them.
208	As a professional horticulturist it drives me daft the amount of money and man hrs that are being wasted swapping these flower beds over every year. Scotland ha such an amazing and diverse plant species that a can give all year round colour. I hate to think of the heating bills for these tenter plants used in the summer bedding which are over winter under glass's. A specially selected variety of hardy Scottish plants that would only needed tended once a year could half the labour and materials, and who knows how much you would save money you would shutting the glasshouse.
209	As a public sector employee it has to be recognised that no increase in pay and proposed increases in living costs creates yet more pressure on the average family to cope with the cost of living. I would be happy to agree to a 3% increase in council tax if this was met with a similar salary increase.
210	As pensioners on a fixed income which has not risen by more than 3% in the last 7 years it is quiet unreasonable to pay more for declining services. The council need to attract more businesses into the area to increase revenue. To save money the council need to improve efficiency of all its services and to reduce the salaries of the top officials.
211	Austerity is pointless and needless programme of destruction that the UK government is forcing on us all. I am sorry that you will need to make these hard decisions.
212	Better boundaries for acceptance of what schools children attend,
	Closer monitoring of Council vehicle use when on emergency shift work
	Better use of office space and disposal of empty or almost empty buildings
213	Bring Council employees pension provision into lie with the private sector
	Allow private sector companies to bid against council depts. to supply services, ensuring a level playing field during the tendering process.
	Sell or rent out all council property that is vacant, at commercial rent/value.
	All Council Depts. to have a SWOT analysis carried out by an independent auditor. (Ask retired business managers to carry it out. Paid expenses only, as a service to the community they live in)
	Think the 6c Plan 1 Cash flow 2 Costs

	3 Customer 4 Concept
	5 Culture
	6 Crises
214	By increasing Council charges there would be additional money to spend on actual front line services. By charging for parking elsewhere outwith Coastal car parks would allow money to be directed to the road network.
215	Canvass the Governments of both the UK and Scotland to increase funding to cover all necessary council services.
216	Car parking in Haddington. Can't most council workers walk to work?
217	CATCHMENT AREAS The linking of education provision and school investment to financial support from house building within the Development Plan is restricting the flexibility that smaller schools should be allowed in terms of providing education for children of families within their local community, rather than according to rigid and often inappropriate catchment demarcations. The current situation restricts smaller / rural schools from accepting pupils genuinely local to them, who then have to travel further (at cost to the Council) to a larger school, also resulting in some schools falling far below their potential capacity, while other schools are struggling to cope with numbers within catchment.
	TRANSPORT A more intelligent and radical approach to transport infrastructure planning that prioritises cycling, clean energy and mass transport over individual car / taxi usage will contribute significantly and positively to cost savings (and revenue generation), health and fitness. Road and segregated cycling infrastructure seems very poor when housing developments are being agreed, both in terms of home-school or home-work trips. The integration of cycling infrastructure between and within towns and villages, as well as most noticeably with the rail network, is a massive missed opportunity to reduce the burden on the roads and the cost of school transportation. Is there an opportunity for pupils to be offered a bike rather than a seat on a bus, given that this is likely to be an overall cost saving (assuming safe routes to and from school are available)? The use of buses and taxis should be carefully reviewed, including the type of vehicles in order to move away from diesel and towards cleaner fuel sources.
	WASTE East Lothian to implement a more radical approach to waste management, including extending the ban on plastic bags to plastic bottles, increasing penalties and levies on fast food outlets e.g. McDonalds who, based on my own observations are indirectly but still very much responsible for much of the visible littering in the county. As part of the community and education side of waste and environmental awareness, perhaps waste collections could be consolidated further to common bins rather than all households having individual bins, along with a further review of collection types and frequencies. This could also include greater involvement in food / garden waste > compost > communal green spaces / parks management.
	SCHOOL MEALS While early years primary school meals are free and aiming to provide children with a healthy diet, they seem to include a dessert every day, which is contradictory (all the latest research suggests sugar to be the greatest risk to health), misleading (surely schools should be where a

	healthy diet is reinforced if this is the stated aim) and also an unnecessary expense. Similarly, providing any kind of bottled / canned drink is creating more waste to be recycled or dumped, which is environmentally irresponsible and costly to the council.
218	Certain council services appear to work very hard in some departments, whereas others do not in comparison (e.g. some of the general field personnel seem to spend a lot of time in van cabs reading the paper). Might be worth a review of internal standards between certain depts. My taxes seem to be paying for some long tea breaks.
219	Certain street lights turned off between 2 and 4 am. Fix potholes earlier to save larger bills long term.
220	Charge developers more for building houses, and/or get them to contribute to providing supporting local facilities for the additional population they bring in.
	I saw a huge amount of money spent levelling a piece of grass at Anchor Green in NB last year, a massively unnecessary spend when the schools don't have enough money for paper and pencils, this sort of spending has to stop.
221	Charge for all town parking with meters. Charge for garden and bulky lifts. Remove free bus pass for people under 66. Stamp out benefits fraud. Charge for garden cutting for disabled. Only pay staff sick pay if off for more than a week to stop abuse of sick pay. Charge public £1 entrance fee to use recycling centres. Stop paying for events ie bonfires, Xmas lights etc. Employ more parking warden to raise money.
222	Charge for council employees to park their cars in the middle of Haddington Ensure that as part of the planning process for house extensions, that the council tax band is reviewed bearing in mind the greater value / living capacity of the extended home and back date 5 years
223	Charge for on street car parking in the county
224	Charges for bulky waste uplift leads to fly-tipping as past experience shows.
	Over 60's have a bus pass and not all of us can get to a station. People can get a senior railcard for use on the train. Lots of villages run their own halls already so hand the rest over. Continue with the partnership funding though, cheap at the price! Outdoor learning crucial if you want to get kids more active.
225	Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014. Section 80 of this act inserts a legal "Presumption against rural school closure". This would cost more than you'd save in legal costs
	Telling the Scottish government that unless they want this country to ground to a halt it's going to get worse if they don't fund their promises!!! ie free school meals and 52 weeks of nursery's costs we as a county are going to be brought to the ground!!!
	Look at sickness with in the council and also management and where there are 7 managers looking over 4 staff?
	East Lothian has so much to offer with new businesses popping up these should be supported, we live in an amazing place, beautiful surroundings, walks, beaches!!

226	Closing rural schools which operate at less than 50% capacity seems a sensible cost saving measure and as a parent I would be happy for my child to attend a larger school as a result if this option was exercised. Indeed I believe that it may in fact be beneficial to their education and development to ensure that the children are educated with an appropriate sized peer group.
227	Considerably reduce staff overtime, particularly at weekends. Why clean the streets on Sunday mornings - do it on a Monday with no overtime, and continue the review of all other overtime using similar criteria.
	Charge ELC staff a fee for the use of the staff car park at the Council Buildings. It would be easy to administer - just charge for the issue of the existing car park passes.
	Remove all charges for parking at the beach. It does not bring in enough money to cover the costs of running the scheme and will make going to the beach more likely.
	No subsidised meals/junkets for Councillors and staff. They should pay the full price.
228	Considering someone gets actually paid to make up this list in a survey, where you don't allow people to put what they think and what you want them to say with out extra options , there's a saving right there, it's almost as comical as midlothian council. Maybe if you kept council tax payments up to date and didn't get in to debt? That might be a good start but to pick on the smallest group of
	people while focusing on larger options is obviously going to get false results?
229	Could garden waste be once per month? Not sure many people fill their bin every fortnight and you can easily store garden waste.
	Making residents may small payments on a regular basis is an annoyance and does not respect people's time - e.g. school lunches can only be topped up by £50 and filling in a form with a long card number, so much easier if a more flexible system could be found. This presumably applies to school bus fares too - asking people to fill in forms to make small payments fails to recognise the drain on their time! I even had to travel from Longniddry to Aberlady for some trivial detail about a school Smartcard, taking time off work for something that could surely be done electronically?
230	Could you not use more volunteers? When someone leaves their position if you could get a volunteer to do that work would that not save on wages
231	Council should look at different ways of providing affordable housing by passing on land to housing associations. Present system does not work.
	Economic development section delivers very little and has never delivered much. It is not required in its present form.
	Radically transform planning service – it's not fit for purpose at present. There is a need for change from the base up.
	Put all council services in one place and get rid of multiple sites, it's not working.
	There is a need for city regions or the amalgamation of local authorities. It is not sensible or effective have more than 30 separate Local Authorities in Scotland. Transformation is essential in order to deliver necessary infrastructure. In advance of local government reorganisation consideration should be given to combining departments with other local authorities and to outsourcing.

	Area partnerships are neither delivering nor are they necessary.
	Twinning is not justified in times of austerity.
	No senior officers should get overtime payments or car allowances.
232	Council tax should go up more for those who are able to afford it. Households with two cars are using the roads twice as much as those with one so should pay more to have roads fixed.
233	Cut money from the top not the bottom.
	Stop wasting money on meaningless projects.
234	Cut public services and utilize public funds on necessities only.
235	Cut waste. Nothing worse than council staff blatantly standing around doing nothing. Also council should look to try and generate other revenue streams - even if it means thinking out the box. Why not charge second homes 5 times the council tax charge?
236	Definitely reduce your office space and introduce working from home. Definitely ensure your systems are self service.
	Definitely ensure the village schools are kept open. They provide a massively important service to this area, including breakfast clubs and after school care. People in these villages pay a lot of money to live in them, and the fantastic schools are a huge reason for that. Also, they are paramount to the communities.
237	Do not close rural schools, keep helping socially vulnerable families and children. Maintain parks and develop community halls and events to raise money for use in the community. Do not stop spending on outdoor education which is all crucial to our children's development. I agree ar increase in council tax would help but by getting rid of some of the council beurocracy would save a fortune for everyone and may mean loss or jobs but not to a detriment to absolutely everyone in East Lothian. That would have the most minimal impact.
238	Don't kill off the funding for things that make East Lothian a great place to live or that bring people here to visit, just to meet statutory requirements.
239	East Linton NEEDS a railservice! I cant see how all the people in the new houses to be added will get into town. The A1 is already incredibly busy, it adds a huge carbon footprint to drive and its impossible to park at the Dunbar or Drem station after early morning (and please dont charge its just too complicated and adds more time to the journey).
	I DONT understand at all why the building permits to build more east linton houses is not linked to a contribution to the station by the developers. My friends dont understand it either.
240	If you still manage Hillend Ski Centre, do it properly or pass it to people who can
241	Encourage more high end restaurants and more modern pubs / wine bars in the area to attract higher spenders to the area.
242	Enforce illegal parking.

243	Estates need to be considered many public owned buildings have gone to ruin and provide no source of rental income. Assets aren't marketed or advertised well to generate any income including libraries, community centres, museums, housing stock and other offices. Overhaul of this department to focus on income generation would outstrip any savings made by reducing events, removing crossing patrols or rural schools closures
244	even considering closing rural schools will destroy the community which brings so much to east Lothian,
	my suggestion is to bring in a 3rd party who is willing to help look at the council figures and see if there are any spaces, one I can suggest is getting rid of the preferred suppliers list as many thing can be purchased cheaper elsewhere,
245	Exchange budget in areas that support sweets etc to support healthier options.
	Also, how ridiculous would it be to review the East Loth area in terms of use of electricity in shops and in shops. I'm sure it's within business right, but it just seems like a huge waste of money, and maybe the money they save by 're-wiring' (pun) the way they do their lights to be put towards the community. Try forcing them to save money, just seems like the best option.
247	Focus on statutory requirements, stop spending on non statutory activities.
248	From experience, adult services are not always provided strictly according to criteria and are not always essential, as identified when charges are applied and the service is no longer 'required' by the service user. Foregoing full DLA (or equivalent) for social care services should be considered rather than the current means testing as this benefit is provided in recognition that the recipient has care needs. The 'innovative' use of SDS needs stricter guidelines and free carer respite not provided unless to alleviate a crisis situation.
	Transport provided to those who are in receipt of mobility allowance or a mobility car should not be provided and certainly not free of charge.
	Bin collections should be reviewed. My green and brown bins do not require fortnightly pick-ups but my recycling is often overflowing and the boxes are too small.
	Reduce senior manager levels, service planners, consultants and use the experience of and provide sufficient front line service providers In all areas.
	Review the provision of hospitality services for events and/or introduce charges for things like 'working' lunches.
	Provide in house services as a default.
249	From my limited experience of the council it seems to be highly over manned and inefficient and as a result an organisation focused more on serving itself than the community. As such I believe that there could be massive cost savings made by the council itself by outsourcing and reducing manning in inefficient areas.
	From what I understand the size of ELC is massive compared to equivalent council's down south. That said I believe that the primary role of the council should be to ensure a good basic education for all throughout the county (including rural areas), provision of good roads (though this could be outsourced), provision and management of waste collection/recycling (but again this could be out sourced more efficiently) and provision of care for the vulnerable (not so easy to out source.)

250	Fully believe that central council facilities in Haddington could be better utilised. In the wider community would be happy to see more means testing for benefits - possibly tiered bus subsidies for pensioners.
251	Get rid of traffic wardens and ridiculous parking charging system for coastal car parks for residents. Then increase charges in the summer months for tourists visiting. Remove from car parks with very poor facilities / very remote (e.g barns ness) - these seem crazy to maintain.
	Work more with communities to support them to deliver social groups for children / elderly and for maintenance of village halls etc.
	Brown bin collection every month in winter, 2 weekly in summer. Bigger recycling bins, so can collect less frequently?
252	Get rid of your current preferred supplier list for schools and other areas of council business. I used to work for a school in the authority, and currently sit on the Parent Council of another one. Time and again I've been involved in purchasing things for a school only to come up against a ridiculous policy that only serves the preferred suppliers. A quick comparison online can show that the majority of times items are far cheaper than what you are allowed to buy through the council's suppliers. I appreciate that some purchases carry risk, especially online, but permission of a little more risk could save a significant amount of money. Some areas, such as IT, could still be ringfenced to some degree, but letting areas such as schools manage their own purchasing budgets and tenders could mean they get a lot more for their money, and thus need less.
	I'm also seriously concerned about the suggestion of school closures. This would be a very shortsighted decision that could cost communities far more than funding. I am personally connected to the Humbie Primary School, which is at the very heart of our community. If you do choose to go down this route be warned: we will fight tooth and nail to keep that school open. It is a central part of our community identity, and closing it would damage us irreparably. Furthermore, with the likely construction of a new housing development our school role is set to grow significantly. Try to close us and you will face a legal battle.
253	get the dog wardens out and get the dog owners fined for the dog fouling
	also pollution charging entering towns by car and prevent congestion and hefty
	parking charging
	making sure that staff are trained to do their jobs and correct mistakes and not fob people off to another department because they cannot be bothered
	sending letters to old addresses because the staff fail to update the data base
	on the spot fines for littering especially lunch break - school kids out to the shops and carry outs getting chucked about
	any persons in breach of their tenancy should lose their housing on the spot and council should not have to pay court charges for asbos etc
	council should visit schools and make children aware of what it costs to clean up after them litter vandalism and educate them of the losses to them when the money cannot be used to enhance their community.
254	Give parking tickets to all illegal parking in Longniddry not for veterans but for everyone else, traffic cops for speeding in East Lothian
L	

255	Give wheelie bins for recycling and empty every 4 weeks instead of every 2.
256	Housing is already a substantial cost. Increasing council tax just makes this worse and will result in financial hardship and more people needing to access help.
257	How can you put rents and council tax up by 5% when living wage is 1% where do we get the money
258	How much have you made from new housing via council tax etc. This has to be a serious amount of money that should contribute to the pot.
	Focus is required on efficiency and productivity to produce savings. Cut out waste. Do you have someone applying common sense to ensure funds are not wasted. Example - You must have spent considerable funds on the footpath out of North Berwick and the one out of Gullane by the golf courses. Done properly this should last many years. However the weeds are growing through already and this will need done again in the short term. You could argue that if you had done nothing the paths would have been in a similar condition.
259	I agree that small rural schools should be closed. I would prefer this option in order to ensure adult and social care services were protected.
260	I am appalled that there is a proposal to close two rural primary schools when the Council states that two further primary schools are required.
261	I am out and about a lot and see council staff sitting in the council vans with the engines running while they are sitting inside for up to and well over an hour and this is early morning 9-11am - not lunchtime also a lot of standing around talking and not working. it's very obvious that there is no managers keeping check on their staff and how they manage their time and the fuel usage.
	The biffa waste collection vehicle stood beside my house last week with the engine running parked for 30 mins and the van that is used to collect the black bags from the bins was parked behind the biffa van and all the council men were having a chat and food in the middle of the road and chatting. Also the grass cutting staff waste a lot of time sitting in the van looking over the forth at 9.30am for well over and hour. this is a waste if council money and this is what the public see and what else is not being monitored ?
	A relative of mine moved council flat and the council completely messed up her council tax account and charging her for additional rent of her benefit money she did not owe and then sent correspondence to her previous address and did not support her with the gas prepaid meter card as promised. Housing officer still has not got back in touch well over 2 weeks after requesting to do so. Seems a complete shambles were staff don't have much training or a clue. The key for the previous property was handed in as demanded by the council and a receipt obtained and then 4 days later the council was badgering my relative saying she never handed the key into the brunton hall and will charge her! We have the receipt from the Brunton Hall and made the housing officer aware of that fact and still we have not had a response or an apology
262	I am sure that many of your working practices are inhibited by wasteful Trades Union dogma which results in an inefficient operational environment that would not be tolerated in the private sector.
263	I am very concerned about the proposed closer of our Local school. It has been under threat before. The projected numbers for next years intake is almost double. I feel that the small but excellent school is vital to our village life.
	Savings can be made in many other ways eg. refuse collection could be fortnightly. The road repairs are good but never last.
	Efficiency measures are always going to be controversial.

264	I believe introducing car parking charges, handing village halls over to the community and looking at reducing non essential services such as garden waste disposal (while still having a place people can take it themselves) are more acceptable options for budget targets. Even considering taking away much needed rural school, which not only provide for the pupils there but also the communities they serve, has to be the MOST unacceptable option and one I believe will be fought against the hardest.
265	I believe that we are very fortune in East Lothian to have such a great tourism industry. I believe the council could be more efficient in capitalising on the huge numbers of visitors we are lucky to welcome. Through local events & festivals, parking charges for visitors & improved transport links we could be increasing the footfall yearly.
	I hope that the proposed cuts to rural schools are quickly overlooked as a viable option. It would seem that our small, long developed, self sufficient community is being penalised in favour of the mass houses being build in around us. Communities which consist of several family generations could instantly lose their identity & community purpose. Communities that pull together & help each other. Strive for the best possible life for their residents by our own hard work, fundraising & commitment to each other. I hope you honour your 'commitment to supporting & keeping rural schools open'.
266	I can't afford for my council tax to increase any. How about those at the top of the council stop claiming silly expenses and using public money to go away on business trips staying in fancy hotels. Charging for a special uplift will result in a rise in fly tipping, stopping the school crossing guards will lead to a rise in rates involving children. I agree that budgets are tight but look a bit closer to home before cutting services that are needed. The council has too many managers and not enough people who are willing to get their hands dirty. Also the amount that is spent on getting agency staff into cover shifts is huge, what is wrong with the managers mucking in and covering a shift. They are quick enough to tell employees how to do the job but won't do it themselves.
267	I feel it's vitally important to ensure funding to partner organisations continue. Local charities' and services work with local people in a face to face capacity and have a good understanding of how to be creative and responsive to the needs of the public within tight budgets. These local organisations are well placed and connected to make maximum impact and within out continued and committed support from the council, run the risk of not being there when people need them.
268	I feel strongly that the budget for ELOES should not be reduced - children in general are spending less time outdoors and losing touch with the natural world which in turn is affecting their health and the well being benefits of being outside and learning about our environment are so well documented.
269	I feel very strongly about the proposal to close rural schools. As a teacher and a parent in the community, I feel no larger school can offer the same unique opportunity for children to learn and develop as is offered in a rural school. The younger children learning from their older classmates, the older children learning to support the younger classmates, the sense of community with all the children learning together, the benefits are endless. Only a small rural school can offer the opportunity for every child to fully learn at their own pace whether that be above/below or indeed at their expected level with no pressure to perform differently.
	If the school were to be closed, surely the cost of transporting those children to/from the larger school would have an impact on any savings attempted to be made by closing the school. Just because a rural school may be operating at a lower capacity in one school year, does not mean it will be the following year. I think the number of children planning to attend in the future years must also be considered.

270	I had a conversation with a member of ELC staff which described the process in getting a new light bulb in a school. The school can't just let the janitor buy one and fit it, an exercise which would only cost the school the price of the bulb. Instead ELC property department have to be called out. The whole process involving calls, job allocation, the time of an electrician etc seems a huge waste of public funds. it is shocking to
	think this could be happening across the county when the funds could be better spent on priorities.
	Heating in public buildings could be reduced? Several buildings I visit seem to have a heater/radiator blasting out heat beside an open door serving no purpose. Other offices have no control over the heating and working conditions can be unpleasant because of the excessive heating levels. The office I work in has windows wide open daily.
	Protecting and continuing the Early Years work in the county will have a direct saving in the long term.
271	I have chosen number 3 on some options as certain areas can save,
	To close stenton and humbie is awful as stenton makes the village and would think humbie is the same?
272	I have just looked at your website trying to find this questionnaire and firstly I would like to say WHAT THE HELL you want a FLAG hmmmmmm maybe that's top of the list what the biggest waste of tax payers money!?
273	I have not completed the questionnaire as I consider some of the questions confusing and I have limited knowledge of what other costs would be incurred by some of the possible actions. There also appears to be little "joined up thinking" e.g a site in Humbie has been zoned for 20 new houses yet someone has suggested the school might be closed.
	Humbie PS plays a very important part in our community along with our village hall (managed by a Trust NOT ELC). We also have a thriving village shop/cafe/business centre and it is important that ELC continues to support its rural communities.
	I note that parking charges might be an option - perhaps ELC should consider charging its staff for the use of the car park at John Muir House in the same way that Queen Margaret University charges its staff for use of the car park.
274	I have selected in a previous option that I view that closure of small rural schools is an acceptable option. In my view it is financially unsustainable to be spending significant funds on buildings and staffing for very small schools when that money could be invested in better services elsewhere. The payment of a Head's salary for a school with low numbers is not a good use of money. I appreciate that this is an unpopular view and that those who live in small villages with small schools feel this benefits their child's education however again with austerity is this something we can really afford to continue?
275	I might pay more tax if I knew how it was going to be spent - BEFOREHAND.
	Why not cut transport to school for those that live less than 3 miles to school - they could walk/bike - those that live further afield don't have that option. Arguably they need the transport more - and if you're going to close rural schools they'll presumably have further to travel - the combination you offer seems the worst of both worlds.
	If you cut this kind of thing you need to offer better public transport services/local free parking/more care share schemes - FIRST. This needs to reach all parts of the community not just those in the larger towns/villages.

	Get those living in council housing to look after their own properties - get the council to stop trimming their hedges and picking up leaves / mending stuff. Make it a condition of getting housing. We could all get out and shovel snow etc - we'd meet more neighbours.
276	I spent some time a number of years ago working with the Active Schools Team and during that time I also had some experience working alongside the Outdoor Learning Team. This small team fulfill a role that is not replaceable. The benefits of outdoor learning are well documented and range from health and wellbeing, encouraging a healthy active lifestyle, learning new skills, building resilience as well as improving attainment through delivering lessons in various contexts. Delivering the service that the outdoor learning team does for the budget that is used is actually great value. This level of service could not be delivered by outsourcing and would be a great loss to the residents of East Lothian especially the young people. I would please encourage the council to consider this as an essential service that should remain in place.
277	I think closing the rural schools is ludicrous, there is so much pressure on existing primaries- Haddington, East Linton, North Berwick, Dunbar to name a few all with additional housing being introduced therefore adding pressures on school infrastructures. The small community schools are so important to rural communities and removing their school would have such a negative impact on not only education but also economics of the areas.
278	I think it is time for Councils to stand together to fight the Tory Govt cuts, is there really any basis for them. Bank managers and staff walk away with massive bonuses from public tax money and large corporations pay little in tax yet the public are left with terrible reductions in services.
279	I think school crossing patrol at lunchtimes could be looked at. I also think manning at local community centre could be looked at to make better use of the community centres. Providing bus services for secondary school kids living within 3 miles should be charged for and kids encouraged to walk/ cycle.
280	I think that some Councils need to use joint strategies with other Councils to continue funding services but more efficiently. Already have had Council Tax increase as well as the additional increase of £300.00 as there seems to be some misguided idea that if you happen to live in a larger house you should pay more. 2 people living in a larger house have less impact on Council services than 4 people or more living in a smaller house. The sums just don't add up and people are becoming increasingly frustrated.
281	I think that the current situation is wholly unacceptable. We should not be having to make these kind of choices in a so-called "first world" country. This needs to be fed back to the Scottish and UK Governments!
282	I think this whole survey has been designed to confuse and I think the Council should be looking more into the way money is wasted within the Council instead of how money can be saved by reducing important services which benefit children and local communities.
283	I think you should be encouraging growth and economy in our rural areas. If the station at East Linton had been reopened this would bring more people, more services, more children going to Stenton. There is very little in the way of services in these areas and growth brought by good transport links would breathe new life into the area.
	We are a couple who work full time and don't have children, we generally don't use public services other than waste collection, the doctor and roads. It would be good for us to see some of the money being used to improve train travel.

289	I was in a high school for a course the other week. The heating was on and it was too hot so they opened the windows to let the heat out! A few weeks later I was there again, on the same course and it was FREEZING and the janitor had to bring in heaters! Please can heating be regulated locally depending on usage / activity.
290	I would be against any threat to the provision of outdoor education in East Lothian. The experiences provided to children and young people in East Lothian are very important and have proven benefits for physical and mental well being. I extend this from simple numeracy and literacy in the playground to those lucky enough to explore the County on foot, bike and canoe. This helps create citizens who adopt a more healthy lifestyle, using active travel and caring more about their surroundings in the County. These are not just my own thoughts, the findings are well documented and a fear would be that without this provision we would see our youth becoming less active and detached from the amazing countryside that East Lothian has and must protect.
291	I would happily pay more council tax knowing the money is going to local services. The UK cuts to disabled people and welfare to families is shameful, and it even more shameful that the burden is being passed to local authorities. I am sure people would be happy to pay higher parking charges. The council needs to focus on trying to grow the local economy but also protecting its more vulnerable citizens.
292	I would happily pay more tax for better services. The tiny primary schools in places like Humbie are a huge drain on resources while not providing an adequate education for the children who would be far better off integrating into the larger schools. This is better preparation for high school and later life as well as saving money. Reduce the benefits paid to council workers for long term sickness. Benefits should be more in like with private sector.
293	I would support council tax going up by 1%. My wages in public sector have been frozen and capped for so long it has been a real terms pay cut.
294	Identify buildings on brownfield or agricultural sites which are unoccupied and in need of renovation. Purchase them, or come to an agreement with landowners to upgrade the building so that the council can rent them out to small businesses, subsidised according to the business financial needs. The initial outlay would generate income from rent, and provide the much needed premises for local businesses.
295	If charges for attending day centres for disabled people is being proposed why not charge children for attending schools. There are at least 10000 children of school age, charge £1 pw, equates to around 500.000k per year and charge for transport as well. Based against what is being proposed for disabled people who might be asked to pay 5 x as much. Easy hit on disabled people.
296	If the projected income for parking charging is really as much as 5 million pounds, it would be absurd not to introduce this, regardless of the likely public protest or the political cost to the current, individual councillors. I sincerely hope all councillors have the courage to back this as the preferred measure. This measure will not only generate income, but will also reduce the strain on numerous other council cost centres, including the disproportionately high roads and transport budget, and will increase the commercial viability of public transport interconnect routes within East Lothian.

	Retaining a zero-charge ticketed period, perhaps 30-45 minutes, in the town centres, would help mitigate the perceived issue of shoppers being deterred. Monthly payment option parking passes, as well as annual should be offered, at same price. Discounted passes could be offered to drivers on a low income and perhaps also to any East Lothian residents who live in rural locations outside of a main town centre.
	The council should also be charging its own staff to park at John Muir House, to encourage more council employees to use public transport to travel into Haddington.
	In terms of the roads and transport budget, spending on road resurfacing should be minimised. Maintaining a road surface that enables drivers to travel faster, because of a smoother driving experience should be right at the bottom of the list of priorities for council spending. The priority should be firstly the safety and then the amenity and convenience for pedestrians and cycle users, within urban centres.
297	If there were a formal consultation on school catchment areas and the catchment for Stenton was changed to include the local area children of whittinghame and Spott then the school would not be below capacity. It would also take the pressure off the taxi service to schools as parents would be more inclined to walk or drive if more local - the other schools East Linton Dunbar and West Barns are overfilling- we have space we have local children being taxied to schools further away because the catchment for Stenton is so tiny - widen it!
298	I'm concerned the council is overly keen on residential developments which end up causing more strain on services. Developers must bear more of these costs or planning approval should be rejected.
299	I'm strongly against increasing the rate of Council Tax for those people who pay it. Are we doing enough to make sure that everyone who should be paying Council Tax is actually paying it. Every time there is an increase to the Council Tax rate more people will fall into the 'can't pay' category, and I would think that an excessive 10% increase would push a lot of people into this, or move a problem elsewhere - food banks, etc.
300	Improve staff morale. If "hot desking" is there for a good reason, enforce it otherwise it is a two tier system and causes great conflict. Stop producing the Newsletter delivered to households as it is boring.
301	In North Berwick gardeners etc do a great job but I wonder if a few hours less would do any harm?
302	In order to save money the council need to evaluate and investigate the scale of the issues faced in east Lothian like those listed on question 3. The need to identify those that are the biggest issues in the area and prioritise them over others, re-distribute the funds into the areas that need priority like education (due to the growing number of pupils going through primary schools currently) and safety. An example of money being better placed would be the money being used for a railway stop in east Linton when there is one barely 10 minutes away in Dunbar, yet schools are being closed. As education should be a priority and the railway station is not a necessity for East Linton the council could save money by investing these funds elsewhere.
	East Lothian Council could additionally save money by transferring all hard copies/documents to direct debit or e-billing unless requested by a member of the community that they require a hard copy.
303	In question 2, fifteen examples are given and the evaluation says that choice number6 is most acceptable surely you mean "more acceptable" as one would need 15 evaluation points to get to the most acceptable. Is this another example of flawed survey?

310	Invest in preventative services rather than firefighting at the front line eg social services and police tasks could be greatly reduced by providing youth services or for example free golf.
309	Invest in 'paid for' events throughout the county. Get communities/businesses involved, but make people feel like they are getting something for their money. Force businesses in places like Haddington to maintain frontage. The way to get people into the towns & spend money is to make them attractive. Given the influx of population, there is no reason why somewhere like Haddington shouldn't become a real destination for shopping, eating, etc. However, it needs to be a more attractive place to visit.
308	Introduce town parking charges
307	Introduce Pay-and-display parking charges throughout Haddington (including in the Council's staff car parks) - this would generate revenue and solve the congestion problem in the town (which the Council seems unable to address) by conventional means.
	Please do not cut transport to schools or pedestrian crossing guides as cuts to these services will put our children's safety at risk
	Maintain children's parks properly so that the same issue is not having to be repaired again & again costing more money
	Make better use of council buildings - the libraries in Tranent & Haddington are good examples of how the buildings can be shared
	Look at council spending on their own jobs & expenses and make savings
306	Introduce better paper & glass recycling bins - have a proper bin rather than the boxes
	streamlined so ELC staff are not standing about doing nothing (and getting paid for it). Prime examples are the roads department. Having watched the ELC staff doing work to the road and pavement in Haddington High Street there was more standing and sitting about than Work being done. If this had been a private contractor the work could have been completed within a week yet ELC took more than 3 weeks cause disruption to residents, shoppers and businesses. If Work was more organised and less sitting about done it would save money and allow other work to get done in a more timely matter making East Lothian better as a whole. Of course this would also save on the overtime payments when it comes to the end of a job and the workers then need to come out at the weekend to finish it or is that the reason for the slow working in the first place?
	ELC should look at making cuts within it own organisation first and foremost. There are staffing cuts which could be made. Services could be
305	Increasing the Council Tax would simply put families into further poverty. The wages are not increasing enough to support a raise! There are fa too many families struggling to get by in East Lothian without ELC adding to this further. All that would happen would be the families would find themselves plunged further into debt.
304	In review of transport provision distance should not be the only tool. If no public transport and a potentially dangerous walk or dangerous A1 crossing transport should be provided but perhaps by taxi card allowance to allow some saving + personal flexibility.
	Are you trying to distort the results by poor questions? What is the point in not allowing the respondent to prioritise all choices in all questions? This is a seriously misleading consultation product .You should employ a trained statistician to produce your surveys.

311	Investigate the possibility of shared services with neighbouring Authorities (Edinburgh/Midlothian) to ease the financial burden of providing
	duplicated services in Lothian.
312	It appears to be common for council staff to work Sundays (at premium rates) on routine work which could be carried out during normal working hours e.g. repairing and laying paths on River Esk banks; and refreshing the area outside the Musselburgh CAB offices this work progress was slow during the week, but accelerated during the Sunday work.
313	It is difficult to decide what is the most important, all areas have their importance to the people who use them. The most vulnerable are the ones that need services.
314	It is paramount that partnership funding should continue. The services provided by ELC partners are invaluable and give communities support and opportunities not otherwise available through the local authority. Partnership funding should be explained as a part of this consultation as most people may not know what this is.
315	It is simply outrageous that rural school closures are being considered. This coming only a few months after the Head of Education (in person) specifically assured the community of Stenton (at two public meetings) that the school was not subject to any considerations of closure. This during a laughable process of landing the school with a shared headship that the community did not want.
316	It would be necessary to introduce some of these changes with care so that people who cannot afford to pay for services were not disadvantaged. If free transport was removed from secondary children living between 2 and 3 miles from school there would need to be discretion depending on the journey. Where walking along an unlit rural road is involved this is not acceptable.
	I am a regular user of the train service into Edinburgh from Drem. I would be willing for this subsidy to be removed as it would cost only about £1 more per journey to use my senior railcard. I would be totally opposed to the ending of the bus subsidy as many elderly people would be very isolated.
	It is difficult in East Lothian as there are a lot of elderly people but there are quite a number who can afford to pay for adult care services. However, the admin costs of means testing may be too great to make this a viable option and it is important to keep the service available for those who cannot afford to pay.
317	It's important to me that services to vulnerable people are protected and that any increase in charges or taxation are progressive and/or means-tested.
318	Keep wages at reasonable level of council management workers.
319	Last year council tax increased up to 15%. This year, all of the questions in this survey allude to cutting services further, unless people are willing to accept an increase well above inflation again, to maintain existing services.
	The council needs to look at it's spend priorities. For example, a significant sum is being proposed for rail infrastructure at East Linton and yet the council is contemplating closing a school a few miles away.
320	Less managers on high salaries. More investment in the workers and staff that make things happen on the ground.

321	Less red tape. Less administrators and more people doing the work
322	Look at energy saving initiatives within the council buildings eg. no need for lights 24 hours a day. reduce heating by 1 degree saves expenditure.
	Provision of complimentary lunches at ELC events is unnecessary and a cost saving could be made by retracting this service e.g breakfast and lunches
	Make charges for ELC staff car parks.
	Van share schemes should be introduced - all council vans seem to have just one person in each van
	Ban overtime at weekends e. g street cleaning on a Sunday
323	Look at internal efficiencies. Raise council tax at a fair and affordable level. Claw back some of the money from additional council tax scottish government introduced last year that goes who knows where. Get the house building companies that are cramming East Lothian full of houses to cough up some of the profits to pay for supporting public resources.
324	Look at the staffing levels in the council buildings. Stop personal calls. Stop paying ridiculous travel expenses for your employees. Stop milking the system for every penny you can. You can save money without drastic cuts.
325	Look at the wages at the top of the tree-!
326	Make a large parking lot maybe a. Small charge for people to park there.
327	Money could be saved with Car Park & Footpath lighting within school grounds at nights & weekends. I am not talking about security perimeter lighting but lighting remote from schools i.e. Sanderson Wynd Car Park & footpaths within the school burning all night.
	Reduce the number of ELC vans when upgrading houses. Each workman does not require a large Transit type van. Sen materials in one van & use people carrier for others. Save on van capital costs & running costs, Environment with less pollution and less problems with parking around houses being worked on.
328	Money wasted on road repairs with sub-standard materials which last no length of time. This is incredibly common. More consultation with local people would highlight concerns and also perhaps bring money-saving suggestions. Less but far better road signage. Get rid of beach car park charges and concentrate on wardens in Towns.
329	MORE ALLOCATION OF HOMES TO LOCAL PEOPLE WHO WILL PAY RENT & COUNCIL TAX
330	More community recycling centres to save door to door collection.
	An evaluation of all council employees in managerial roles to ensure value for money is being achieved. Less chiefs more Indians who then better able to look after the most vulnerable in our communities.
	To protect rural schools and the communities they keep alive.

331	More effectively monitor illegal parking & dog fouling (when not picking up) and issue fines. Scale back on some events ie. bonfire night (the firework display duration & noise this year was too lengthy & loud; could be traumatic for animals).
332	More parking enforcement around primary schools (esp Windygoul) would raise considerable income and dramatically increase child safety.
	Think about how much we want to charge for the disruption caused by events like the marathon and the open to be sure it's financially worth it.
333	More should be done to "promote buildings" like the Brunton hall for functions and conferences. The council owns some lovely buildings and money could be made from renting out even library buildings for small or large functions, small businesses etc. Not enough is being done to make ELC make money with the facilities they have and uses these wisely.
334	Most definitely reduce the funding for the administration of the council itself.
335	Musical tuition should remain free in schools
336	Must review number of management and associated costs. Stop doing work which does not have a direct positive impact on service users
337	My children attend Law Primary which is massively stretched and underfunded when it comes to teachers/class sizes and lack of ASN and classroom assistants. The school is huge now, the funding must be increased to address the rapid growth of the town, many of the years are full to busting. I help in the school and I'm frankly shocked at what I see in there. The facilities in the original part of the school are tired and lacking and overcrowding and hygiene is an issue. The P4 class my son is in has incredibly disruptive and often violent children in it and there is no funding to alleviate the pressure on the teacher. My child is suffering, along with many of his peers, as a result. Not just his education, but his day to day safety, are of huge concern to me. There is a misconception surrounding North Berwick and it's 'wealth' that desperately needs tackled and dealt with before the community slides further. The school is a prime example of this. I am literally begging you to support further funding for teachers and support staff at Law, ad it is an accident waiting to happen at the moment and this is no environment for a child to learn in.
338	Not sure if you have looked at the number of contracts the council have and see if there are any saving to be had there. I'm sure there may be some savings there which obviously accrue over time
339	Not waste money on recycling boxes as they are easily broken or lost due to wind which means replacing regularly also the lids don't last very long. Giving us wheely bins instead would reduce this cost and may also cut down collections to 1 in 3 weeks.
340	On a daily basis I see guys working in various locations around North Berwick cutting down long grass, trees, hoovering up leaves which if left would die back and remain as habitat for flora and fauna.
	Every year for North Berwick in Bloom great swathes of habitat in the Lodge are cut down to "prettify" it? The trees along Coo's Green cut down? The meadow grass mown and now looks like a hay field?
	Charge for parking but have residents tickets and spaces. If you drive into Edinburgh city centre you expect to pay for the privilege. Why not North Berwick? We holidayed in Cornwall and paid EVERYWHERE!

341	On the question of school crossing services, when I was at school in England, many years ago, the sixth formers provided this service on a voluntary basis. While this may not be possible, surely adults might be willing to volunteer. The cost of administration would, presumably not be the £250,000 quoted.
	If closing a village school, has the cost of busing pupils to an alternative been taken into account?
	The possible alteration to garden waste uplift would seem to fly in the face of the Council's recycling targets, and it is understood that the waste is composted and the compost used, so this benefit would be lost. It is difficult to assess whether a charge would be reasonable, but I understand Edinburgh are proposing £25 p.a., which might be acceptable.
	The article in the Courier advertising this consultation process was opposite another explaining how the Council is spending time and effort on designing a flag for the county. This seems remarkably pointless in the present economic climate
342	Outdoor Learning raises attainment and improves the health and wellbeing of our young people. Access to greenspaces has mental and physical health benefits to the wider population. We should be encouraging OL and promoting the community benefits of our greenspaces if we want to reduce costs in the long term - higher attainment leads to greater post school choices and better mental and physical health leads to fewer demands on care and health services.
343	Outsource some departments - eg Finance Functions, HR & some administration.
344	People are already being screwed over enough, so I can't support any council tax increase - this shouldn't be about central taxation squeeze, so we'll tax at the local level. That just hurts those that can least afford it.
345	People simply cannot afford any further increases on their monthly spend. A 10% council tax increase would push people into debt and increase demand on public services so the simplistic argument presented that increasing tax would benefit local services is ill-thought through. If it the system was graded so that only people living in the most expensive houses (e.g. value over £500,000) pay more council tax that may be more acceptable.
346	Perhaps Council tax bands could be increased so that those who are able to afford it can make higher payments in order to improve local services.
347	Please do not touch schools. There are many other ways to save money- look at frivolous things provided by the council such as Core paths, Invest in childcare for all not just larger schools to enable more people to work and pay tax. Discourage schemes that are only for workless households and make them open to all as they will increase taxes paid.
348	Please don't close Stenton primary school, Dunbar primary is already huge. My children had an excellent education in Stenton primary.
	Secondly, East Linton needs a railway station. I sure hope the developers of all the new houses have to contribute to it! Driving makes the A1 even more busy and has a high carbon footprint. Presently, taking the train is hard because parking in Drem and Dunbar is very limited and its too complicated and slow to drive back to Dunbar before going into Edinburgh
349	Please focus on education and care of the elderly for increased spending.

	Make savings through reductions in council admin cost and expensive office space.
	Devolve more decision making to local communities.
350	Please protect the most vulnerable in society. Any fees to be introduced must be means tested e.g. music tuition.
351	Positively discriminate in communities. Those who need more get more. Those who need less get less. Let's make East Lothian an equitable place to live be - a place to be proud of.
352	Possible levy on farming vehicles using public roads (increases wear and tear to verges dramatically every winter).
	Levy on Macdonald's at Dunbar and other fast food outlets to help towards clearing up the ensuing litter.
353	Prepared to pay more if used wisely. Not convinced it is
354	Primarily setting up a commercial arm of the council for the provision of external, innovative, entrepreneurial commercially interesting services. Pest control, fencing, home maintenance, drainage, pathways, etc to name but a few options.
	Community halls - offer up some of this space during working hours for rental pop-up office space for homeworkers. The provision of relatively cheap office hubs for individual homeworkers to group together would be a better environment for the workers, provide an income for the council and reduce commuting requirements.
	Beach parking charges - remove them, they are costing money. Better to make parking free to attract more people and offer up 2-3 commercial bays for rental in the main car parks (providing an immediate council income) so that local food producers can go to the car parks and offer hot food, etc. This would in turn attract more people to the beaches which is better for everyone.
355	Properties where I live in North Berwick are much higher than elsewhere in the county, which isn't necessarily reflective of income. Eg we were able to buy our house due to a sum of inheritance money. Our mortgage is actually less than the average rent in the town. We are on a high council tax band (long overdue for reviewing) but struggle to afford to pay all of our bills. The cost of living is high, and especially in such a "wealthy" town were certain things seem to command a premium just because of the postcode - but the reality it there are plenty of families trying to survive here on average incomes. Anything more than 3% increase is unjustifiable - our wages aren't going up by that, how can the council expect people to survive?!!!
356	Put in more effort to collect unpaid Council Tax by issuing Charge For payment to all not paying - you really cannot ever justify increasing the rate for those that do pay when there are so many that don't. So get the arrears sorted first it's not fair to those that do pay.
	Illegal parking not only on pavements but in places like Musselburgh High St is awful and you never see any Parking Attendants. Start ticketing for pavement parking, double parking and illegal parking.
357	Raising the council tax, to the people on low income within the county would put them under more stress, which most of them will be under stress already being on universal credits where people are getting in to debt.

358	Rather specifically, I think ELC could recoup some revenue from opening the John Muir House car park to be used as pay and display and open to the public all week. The income from this could fund shuttle buses for ELC staff from outlying towns or (as in all other jobs) staff could pay for public transport to get to work. This would increase spending in Haddington high street and be beneficial for the whole community
359	Rationalisation of staff numbers and management numbers needed across the entire council.
360	Reduce bureaucracy and ridiculously high pay awards for senior staff.
	Organise residents for street tidying, litter picking and verge control through community councils
	Give community councils more control and decision making instead of just "talking shops"
	Charge individual households for verge cutting outside their homes
	Switch off non-essential lighting after 11pm in the winter
	Introduce minimal charging for OAPs on local buses.
	Cut non-essential staff.
	Cut down on paper work
	Introduce more staff working from home
361	Reduce grass cutting, tree felling and hedge cutting. More traffic wardens needed, and start handing out tickets for double parking, parking on double yellow lines outside school, i.e.: Campie primary school morning and evening. Would make money on tickets issued for council funds. We should a very rich council as we have a Racecourse, how much do we make each year from this? Maybe we should charge more for lease.
362	Reduce parks and gardens service, do flower beds need to be replanted 3-4 times per year?
	Lobby central govt for increased budgets, the shrinking of the sate helps nobody
363	Reduce Senior Management costs
364	Reduce the amount of management within the Council and increase staff on the ground level to provide the services. Too top heavy!
365	Reduce unnecessary people employed by the council. i.e HR
	Monitor productivity - introduce a scheme increase productivity.
	Lobby SNP central government to carry out their manifesto pledge to change the council tax system. A more balanced system of taxation is required based on the residents ability to pay rather than the value of their property. This may encourage a better acceptance on imposing tax increases. Also the imposition of council tax should be applicable to all bands not just the top four. This again is a political issue and outwith the Council civil service remit.
	Devolve social and recreation service funding to business and community funding.

	What is the revenue from the metal, plastic and waste paper collected for recycling this appears to be absent from the balance sheet. compost the material collected as garden waste and sell it.
	Is there still a smoking cessation officer employed by the council? If so stop this nonsense now. This would also apply to any similar cradle to grave type service being funded by the local authority.
366	Regards the choices of which cuts would be most unacceptable, school crossing services seem to be greatly over provided and parents could play a greater role in ensuring children get to and from school in safety. A review of council property seems sensible but I suspect there is a greater need to actually cut services particularly transport subsidies for taxis, trains and school buses. Many using these services are more than able to pay.
367	Relax the planning system. It seems to me that East Lothian creates work for itself by over complicating and prolonging the planning process beyond what is reasonable. East Lothian has a reputation for being difficult in this regard and wonder if money could be saved by simplifying the process and relaxing the conditions.
368	Remove free school dinners for all P1-P3 children unless a need is demonstrated i.e. low income. Especially packed lunches on Fridays.
369	 Revenue Introduce more areas with parking charges. Increase rates for out of town shopping centres or propose car parking charges to encourage people to use more local services. Increase parking charges across the county. Merge council office facilities etc and sell unused properties. Improve the systems at Enjoy Leisure to allow for better and clearer booking Introduce online booking to reduce staff time and increase usage through providing better visibility on the use of facilities and introduce demand based pricing. ie expensive sports hall being unused during the day so charge less to encourage small enterprises such as mother and toddler groups to use them. Open up school halls and other school facilities to wider community use through online booking. Provide food that is remotely edible and fresh in enjoy leisure facilities to drive increased consumption and therefore revenue.
	Costs - Merge council facilities and reduce property costs - Stop wasting money on coastal car park 'traffic management' measures - Don't ever again waste money on a consultation over what is effectively no more than a name change for a Nursery School Improve council IT systems to drive more online interaction, particularly potential revenue generating things like sports centres- which are chronically underused due to the difficulty in booking, lack of visibility on current bookings and the almost complete absence of online information on classes and how to books halls, courts etc Introduce larger green bin style bins of recycling, speeding up rounds and reducing the need for as many recycling pick ups
370	Review council tax banding on houses with extensions at the time of building. Not just at first sale to new occupants. Some newly large houses are paying less than smaller ones.

371	Review number of East Lothian vans sitting outside residential addresses in Haddington and Dunbar and probably other locations. Consider fuel/van costings and any potential benefit in kind tax issues - we have to!
372	Review of council staff job descriptions, especially senior management.
	Properly implemented health & social care partnership working to increase communication and reduce duplication.
373	Review the employment of playground and classroom assistants as a large number would be unemployable elsewhere, and cause more issues than they solve, although there are some that are very good they are in the minority.
374	Review the garden waste collection: this doesn't need to continue at the same frequency through the winter. Most weeks through this time we don't even need the collection.
375	Review the tasks performed and ensure that workers perform for the wages paid. Stop wasting council tax payers money needlessly
376	Rural communities are the most vulnerable to some of these changes and in particular the closure of schools below 50% capacity would have a devastating impact on rural communities. In most cases the school is the focus of community life and it's closure would almost certainly result in greater costs to the council in future to deal with the social problems that would result from closures
377	Rural school students must not close.
378	Rural schools are the beating heart of the communities that they serve and their positive impact reaches way beyond those the children and parents that are connected to the school. The schools are shining examples of what education should be, an inspiration and example to other schools. Closing these would have a significant negative effect on the local and wider community and I would urge you to remove this option from your list.
379	Rural schools face enough challenges without the risk of closure also.
	The need for partnership working actually alleviates the pressures on the council for additional work.
380	Save money before trying to raise the council tax. If the council had more money (from council tax rises) it would still waste money.
381	School crossing patrols should be kept on roads where there is no traffic light/crossing system. If there is a 'green man' crossing, there should not be a patrol.
	If village halls are to be given other 'to the community', it has to be recognised by the Council that volunteers can not and should not provide a service to replace what the Council provides. It is unfair to expect volunteers to do this and is not sustainable.
382	School transport used to be available for those further than 2 miles from school. is this still the case? Too many of the "disabled" are obese, is there not a criteria where self inflicted disability such as morbid obesity should not qualify persons for disability benefits in transport by taxi?
383	Schools close at midday on a Friday, so why are free school meals issued? Surely after school closure that is then parental responsibility, an immediate saving can be had be ditching these meals, a large portion of which are binned anyway because they are low quality.

384	Even the thought of suggesting closing rural schools will cost an enormous amount of money as Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014. Section 80 of this act inserts a legal "Presumption against rural school closure" will cost in legal fees as it will be a fight!!! You'd need to use a third eye to watch the councils next move against small rural schools instead you should be learning from them!!
	I do suggest you get banish the preferred supplier list and let the schools do buying from the cheapest option as I'm sure there is a nice wee bundle getting spend there.
385	Review street lighting usage - smart lighting, solar?
	Charge for refreshments at council meetings and events
	Rationalise the number of council departments and managers
	Share staff and expertise with other councils
	Cut the number of council vehicles
	Sell surplus assets
	Consider introducing cafes in libraries
386	Stenton Primary school has been an important part of the social fabric of Stenton local community for almost 140 years and its closure would have a detrimental impact on the village and the sense of community that is so strongly held here. It plays a vibrant and vital role in the community, consistently turning out pupils who are well rounded, polite, bright and engaged. While I acknowledge that pupil numbers have fallen recently, I remember a time not that long ago (when my daughter was a pupil) when the school was near capacity. I believe that time will come again; indeed I believe the next P1 intake will be 7.
	With the huge number of houses being built in neighbouring Dunbar, West Barns and East Linton, their primary schools will soon be bulging at the seams. I suspect a number of parents living in these towns would be very interested in sending their children to a local rural school with a reputation for good education and social inclusion. I ask the Council to continue to support and promote our rural schools; they are at the heart of our villages; playing a very special part in our rural communities.
387	Still a perception that senior management get paid too much to do too little. Or that there is too many of them.
388	Stop building houses on viable farmland
389	stop paying for bigwigs parties etc reduce useless expenses
390	Stop providing free lunch for school children on a Friday as they finish at lunchtime anyway and most of it is dropped in the street. Perhaps the school week should be 4 days but longer days. The school buildings could be closed on a Friday saving costs from employing staff and maintenance of building costs.
	Remove the Educational Psychology Department as they provide no benefits other than repeating what lots of partner agencies have already said.

	Turn off street lights between 2-4am.
	Gritters are often out when the weather is actually not that bad so closer attention should be paid to the weather forecast.
	Stop providing funding for events that use East Lothian but provide no benefit other than to clog up our roads/parking areas. Or if this is to continue start charging more.
	How much money is being used to design an East Lothian flag?
391	Stop providing free meals for all p1-3 children. Huge possible saving.
392	Stop rehousing people who abuse the houses they get or the housing system
393	Stop replacing perfectly good bus shelters every year. Don't pay expenses to council staff. Normal every day workers don't get their lunches bought for them so why should council staff? Same goes for MPs etc. Stop giving them allowances for this and that. She should be paying their own way just like any other worker does
394	Stop supporting vanity projects and save funds that way. Stop changing road structure limits without need. Stop the amount of meetings with forums that add massive costs to basic council works.
395	Stop wasting money maintaining gardens of those who are capable or have family who are capable of doing it. Sort out the housing waiting list in a more timely and efficient manner - there is a 2 bedroom bungalow adapted for disabled residents that has been empty and cleared out since August with no sign of anyone moving in. There's no one who wants it? Really?! Meanwhile you spend a fortune on temporary accommodation. Its utter madness and a waste of precious funds.
396	the aviary in North Berwick Lodge is an awful thing to have in this day and age - cruel and unnecessary. Also, less annual bedding - replace flowerbeds with fruit trees and shrubs.
397	The budget must be looked at as an entire pot. There are some areas (for example homelessness) where , if provisions are cut back on, money will be used from other council budgets (often at a higher rate).
	Are there areas of cuts that other LA's have made that have shown to result in less impact than expected?
	Health and Social care integration is key to successful future partnership working. Is there access to any health funding to come to the LA as a result of upcoming housing and health data linkage findings?
398	The car park at John Muir House in Haddington could introduce parking charges. Many other employees in the private sector pay to park while they attend work. Car park charging at John Muir house would generate several million pounds per annum whilst encouraging the workforce to use public transport. Generate additional revenue and take single use cars off our roads.
399	The challenge is to demonstrate that within East Lothian is a caring authority that supports early intervention and looks after the most vulnerable in our society.

400	The council could make commitments to low emission vehicles. with this commitment, it could partner with other organisations to secure infrastructure grants and significantly reduce its running costs
401	The council remains incredibly inefficient in many processes it would appear, think there is still much that could be done to streamline.
402	The council should be applying long term thinking to this short term problem. There are plenty of opportunities for the council to be progressive in making money not just taking money. Council tax rises are an easy option - I am sure most people are prepared to pay a bit more even if the system is grossly unfair but start looking nationally at a progressive and fit for purpose land tax so that people know the end is in sight. The generation and supply of renewable energy - the options for the Cockenzie site are just two ways to become more sustainable financially. The council has a duty to make decisions that have a short and long term benefit to the people of East Lothian not just to satisfy petty party politics.
	The long term impact of closing rural schools, and any other reduction in the quality of the education of our children, will be detrimental to all other aspects of our society in the long run. Unhappy children make unhappy citizens. They are the ones who will be making choices about your future when you are old(er).
403	The council should review its remuneration policy on its top earners. The UK Government pay the PM less than many Council CEO's. If there were less 'decision makers' and 'consultants'. no doubt we would not notice. Take for example the wisdom in planning a second secondary school for Musselburgh, and now it is delayed (for 2 years at least and then????). there are plenty of waste areas i.e. short term budgeting and The most significant is why have two centres of education excellence (secondary school) when it is logical that providing education from the one centre offers cost savings (only one Head etc). Instead of paying two cost centres have only one (one Musselburgh Grammar school). Pay off the PFI and gain the long-term advantage of one site.
404	The Council should review parking charges at the beaches, you should not be allowed to purchase a ticket to park at Gullane Bents and then use the same ticket to park at North Berwick. No other council allows you to transfer tickets in this way. You drive from one beach to another you pay again.
	On street parking charges should be introduced from 8 am to 6 pm in all of our larger towns, this may also have the secondary benefit of reducing the number of people who drive their kids to school.
405	The Council Tax increases would require to be a guaranteed ring- fenced investment that would be used for local services.
406	The Council Tax has only just been raised to 3 per cent after years of being frozen. I think it was foolish to freeze this for so long as services have to be paid for.
407	The idea that families can be asked to pay another 3% council tax after the appalling rise in 2017 is deeply disturbing. The council tax freeze was a terrible SNP policy and this financial retribution that has followed its lifting is too much. I have been horrified by the increase in my council tax this year and another increase of this kind will have a substantial impact on my ability to support my family.

408	The proposal for increase in council tax is alarming and also rather misleading. It states that the increase was limited to 3% but some households have already been hit with MUCH higher increases. To suggest a future possible rise of 5% and possibly 10% on top of this is extremely unfair and , in fact, irresponsible of any council to threaten this.
	Eventually this could lead to an increase in people claiming rebates and might not raise as much income as expected.
	Perhaps the council should review top end salaries and remember that some folks still earn only around £7.50 an hour!
409	The proposed closure of Stenton Primary School will have a massive detrimental effect on a scattered rural community. The school is a vibrant, inclusive and engaging hub for the whole of the village and especially for those families and community members in outlying areas.
410	The question about raising Council Tax is misleading since some households have already had to pay MUCH more than 3% A further large rise could well mean more applications for rebates rather than more income.
411	The roads and pavements near me are a disgrace. My disabled daughter attends mainstream school but does not receive the help she needs, the bin service is an absolute joke, the public areas are a mess.
412	The schools in ELC are like miniature warzones, yet the parks and public spaces are maintained like the gardens of a royal palace. Perhaps a slight exaggeration but there is clearly an imbalance here. The council should encourage more community involvement and responsibility for maintaining public spaces, spend less money on outdoor / maintenance / gardening contractors and divert the funds towards education and child services.
413	The Scottish Government already increased Council Tax charges last year for houses in higher bands. Ask them for that funding back but dont unfairly penalise us again for living in a decent house!
	If you reviewed your services and didn't have to do jobs 3 times until they were done to a satisfactory level then you would save a substantial amount of money!
414	The tax increase may not be popular but given the potential cut to services that might be needed it may also be more understandable. In terms of potential to increase income for the Council, the high level of new developments and the profits made by the house builders should be viewed as a potential for new sources of income for the Council. The payments by developers to pay for extensions to schools could be increased. Additionally, given the increased traffic on the roads due to the new housing, the developers could also be made to pay for road maintenance. This concept should be expanded to several areas of the Council services that will be put under strain due to the increase in population. In short, the population has to live with the strain put on local services, the house builders should bear some of this strain through increased payments to the Council.
415	There is far too much money spent on ground maintenance, planting flowers etc. Focus should be on expenditure on wellbeing, mental health issues and reducing vulnerability.
416	There is no space to elaborate but for example I disagreed with the council tax increase because the way council tax is calculated is unfair. I lived in a house provided by a social landord, but because it is in a wealthy area (house prices are high) my council tax in in a high band. Council tax needs to be looked at properly.

	You could save money by investing in developments which encourage community engagement, as opposed to the current development plans which see large swathes of fields turned into sub-standard housing with no community centres, or hubs, or community ownership. Research has shown that self-sufficient communities present a lower burden on services because they manage themselves.
	Unfortunately the only way to really increase the income or save money - ie keep all the current services running - is to change the economic system so that money is distributed more equally.
	Another potential savings in the pay scales of the higher bands. While I am sympathetic to the argument that work should be rewarded with a high wage, I understand that the CE of East Lothian Council earns in the region of £120,000 per year. Taking off tax this is reduced a fair amount, but considering the cuts we are all experiencing I am not sure it is justified.
417	There is still much that could be done in terms of reducing multiple office sites and better use of technology to reduce staff travel. Better use could be made of services, there are a number of vans that council workers use that are parked at their home, I accept the on call argument but no one is on call 24/7/365, this is using fuel and using parking spaces
418	There must be a more strategic link between areas of increasing equalities: we need training linked to employment available locally; education linked to the communities they are based in; health outcomes embedded in schools, community centres and libraries services; road policies which encourage people to not use cars; embed environmental outcomes across all policy areas now rather than wait to be told by the Scottish Govt when it becomes more expensive to retrofit.
	ELC staff are generally very parochial in how they consider their policy area and unlikely to try and join dots which could lead to services sharing responsibility. I have had senior policy managers in ELC say convincingly 'that isn't my policy area and I can't take responsibility to what they do'. This is unacceptable. They are the public face of ELC in community meetings and must present and behave in a joined up way proving efficient use of resources.
	Don't just tick a box that a community representative was asked to attend. If they don't, find out why and address the issues. Eg partnership board meetings relationships with area partnerships, community councils, community groups. There is no real partnership.
419	There should be a greater balance of funding raised by the council rather than provided by central government. At the moment raising council tax actually raises very little additional cash, and the Council Tax is outdated and unfair. I'd like ELC to do more lobbying to reform local tax and improve local autonomy. Where are ELC's ideas for better property taxes, visitor levies, etc? Pitting vital services against each other isn't a credible way to run a local authority. I would also question why ELC has creamed off a good chunk of Pupil Equity Funding for Central administration purposes when the funding should go direct to head teachers who decide how to spend it in agreement with parent councils.
420	These will be difficult decisions. The starting point must be to protect the most vulnerable people and to seek to raise income in the fairest possible way and by spreading the burden as widely and fairly as possible. We should not be providing free services to some people (eg music lessons) while increasing charges to others (eg adult social care services). We also need to look at saving money where possible and is this the right time to be lifting the cap on increases to salaries for staff? Is it really fair to expect users of adult social care services to pay more when their benefits have been frozen and in effect they will be paying for pay rises for social workers?

421	Think about internal savingssalaries, bonuses and consultancy fees could all provide significant savings I imagine. Also looking a internal costs incurred from travel, expenses, away days etc.
	Our schools are in a hell of a state - attainment is falling. Schools and education must not suffer as a result of these cuts. Let's invest in our young people and make sure life offers them opportunities.
422	This survey is a disgrace. I will not allow my statistics to add support to austerity cuts. I do not believe austerity is the way and you do not present any options i can support. Make big corporations pay all their taxes, raise taxes for the rich, then come back and we can talk about austerity cuts.
423	To reiterate, this should not be put on and the pressure taken away form ELC and especially the Scottish Government.
424	Too many high paid staff at JMH. In the education department alone between just the Head of Education and two QIO the staff bill is in the region of £200,000 this does not include the new QIM that was advertised recently. Is this good use of council funds when there is a teaching shortage?
425	Turn down the heating in Council buildings / schools. Make sure heating is appropriate for weather conditions. Ensure lights switched off when offices empty. Stop paying sick pay to staff when off unless work related illness. No other sector get full sick pay. We get statutory sick pay instead. This would save thousands of pounds annually.
426	Use community empowerment act to help communities identify and take control of key services and facilities, release unused assets for sale, encourage community partnerships for maintenance of shared gardens
427	Use John Muir House car park at weekends and charge.
	Charge/fine people for not recycling.
	Use crowd-funding.
428	Utilising staff better
429	Village schools must not be closed. These schools aren't just schools, they provide a sense of community and are vital to the survival of small villages. With schools in larger towns such as Dunbar and Haddington being full to the brim, closing small schools nearby that have capacity is madness.
430	Vital that small rural schools be kept open because without them, the community would die.
	Music tuition must continue to be given to all schoolchildren as an essential part of the school curriculum. The offer of free tuition is no less importance than other subjects and it should be offered to all regardless of a family's financial situation.
431	Vulnerable people in the community have to be the priority

432	We have seen so many cuts recently that I think it would be wrong to look at where the council can make more cuts before an inward review has taken place. All businesses are having to cut back on expenditure such as the office facilities, IT equipment and travel and implement energy saving initiatives and cost saving initiatives - the council should focus more on this. The cost of running the council is far too high.
	EL council appear to suffer from a lot of bureaucracy, streamlining processes and the implementation of cross functional teams would eliminate waste.
434	We pay too much council tax as we are pensioners and get little benefit.
435	We shouldn't be paying to host things like 'Edinburgh' marathon, Iron Man, Orange walks, etc. Not sure how much this costs the council but I assume there are costs for security, admin, etc
	For maintenance of parks, sports grounds and outdoor areas, is there an option for corporate sponsorship?
436	What a wasted opportunity to ask people for creative and constructive ideas. we will not address the massive challenge we all face by cutting services without have a good understanding of how public services help people live at home as they age, stay well and keeps families together and gives people a future. What you suggest creates divisions, what we need is solutions that make better use of the assets we have and think long term We all want to avoid problems and crisis, most of us have ideas and can help make it happen.
437	What is the budget for things like Council office Christmas Parties? I heard a rumour (which may well be inaccurate) that it was quite high. I don't want to spoil people's fun but is that necessary?
	Would it be a good idea to invest in a review of procedures within the council to try and make it more efficient?
438	What is the Council's policy on sick pay and maternity pay? It should be brought into line with other sectors - ie straight onto statutory sick pay. How many staff are on long term leave on full pay?
	The council should also remove flexi time for staff? How closely strutinised are staff working hours? In all other sectors, staff are expected to work over and above the contractual standard (eg 35 hrs) with no recompense. Why should council staff be able to take extra 2 days leave per month flexi leave when this practice simply doesn't happen in other sectors? Working practices at ELC seem incredibly inefficient and should be reviewed as a top priority.
439	While appreciating that difficult decisions have to be made due to the Westminster Government block grant cuts, reducing valuable service is for short term financial gain.
	Valuable services like Outdoor Learning, Community hubs, funding for partners have been developed over many years to meet community, residents and educational needs and have powerful long term impacts. Past LA restructures have shown that once gone they never return to the detriment of all.
	Save Money - while appreciating that streamlining is possible (chief executive office perhaps? - not an option in the choices) More emphasis from councillors and local MP's to take the case to the root of the problems (Westminster austerity Policy) and alter the bigger picture for Local

	authority funding. I've yet to hear our current MSP/MP take any action to support the authority administration at UK or Scottish Parliament level.
	I'm also concerned that the reviews have already taken in place and that the potential savings amount to the whole budgets for these services. and that the consultation may be used to rubber stamp that which is already decided.
	Council tax raising is tinkering at edges and means residents have less to spend on coastal car parking! or the services that will now have to be charged for.
	Please lets not aim for the bottom. East Lothian should be leading the way.
440	While I have answered the questions in Section 3, without knowing the potential savings that would be available for the courses of action listed make this line of questioning quite ridiculous
441	Why are social care services for adults free to pensioners yet chargeable for adults of working age?
	The taxi card system is run separately from other transport services support such as dial-a-ride/dial-a-bus or the taxi licensing system. Taxis make money in East Lothian - look seriously at a community Uber alternative for taxi card users
	Could there be duplication in service provision between Enjoy and Community Learning. One party looks after pavilions and the other looks after small halls. How many could be closed and a small subsidy given to local Church Halls for the same purpose?
	Communities without a church hall, pub, hotel or other community faciity should not loose local Halls. Mapping of community and council assets is needed.
442	Why are you saying services have to be cut - charge for parking and increase council tax.
	Leave schools the elderly and our sports centres alone.
443	With reference to council tax. Time, effort and money should be spent in ensuring every household in East Lothian is registered as many are not registering when taking over ownership/tenancy of a property. Why should we pay even more whilst others are not and yet they use the same services???
444	With schools bursting and house building expanding across East Lothian I feel it lacks any forward thinking to close a school in the centre of a building boom - the children in the schools across the county are already overcrowded and closing a rural school within spitting distance from communities that are expanding seems mad. Instead of closing it- use it to take the load off the other schools - allow kids from outside catchment to attend!! It shows a lack of forward thinking. Charge for parking in Haddington, Dunbar, North Berwick
445	With the mentioning of garden waste definitely reduce garden collection during October and March, even once a month
446	Within the planning process any residential development that increases the size of a house (e.g. 2 to 4 bedroom), should automatically have a council tax rebranding. Far too many houses in East Lothian have been developed and the existing council tax banding does not reflect the enlarged house size. I'm sure re categorising property at the point of completion will make the system more reflective of the house type.

	Continue to dispose of non-core assets and services e.g. property.
	Stop the development of new houses in the area - this will only stretch existing resources further.
447	Work smart, drop your political allegiances and look out for us
448	Working in partnership with community groups, charities, CIC's to run services - such as childcare, services for elderly, village halls etc - who can often run things more cheaply than the council. However, these services would need to be fairly funded to meet obligations such as national minimum wages, auto-enrolment etc.
449	Would be happy to increase Council Tax if money guaranteed to be put back into local services and this data must be released for public viewing.
450	Your questions about council tax would appear to suggest another massive increase is imminent and without much warning. 2017/18 saw our council tax increase by just under 20%. We are a young family and due to the shortage of affordable housing in East Lothian, had to take out a very large mortgage. The only way we can afford this is because we rely on family to look after our children whilst we work. We have to run two cars because we live in a rural area. Just having had a baby, our income has been significantly reduced. On the surface we may be considered affluent, but the cost of living for a young family is huge and we really are being squeezed. The thought of a further increase - a frightening 3% or a terrifying 10% - could force us to default. It's that serious. The Scottish Government has a lot to answer for in freezing council tax for so long, but you cannot recover all of it at once.
	I cannot take my children for casual walks in coastal areas because I cannot afford the parking charges. As one of your attendants pointed out, 'it's only £2'. Those £2s add up. I cannot afford £40 for a permit. Not only am I paying thousands in council tax, I am limited as to where I can walk in the county! It's utter madness.
	Talk about social mobility and then penalise when we finally try and scrape out a living for ourselves and a nice family home.

4. COMMENTS ON OPTIONS IN 'HARD CHOICES' QUESTION / ANY OTHER COMMENTS (EAST LOTHIAN COUNCIL STAFF)

Please use this box to share any comments on the options in the previous question or to tell us any other ways in which you think the Council could do things differently to increase income or save money. Please use this box to tell us any other ways in which you think the Council could do things differently to increase income or save money.	
451	As a parent of 2 children who benefit from home- school transport (over 3 miles away), I would be more than happy to pay a small charge each year towards this. I realise transport is a huge cost to the council. I would far rather pay a small charge than see crucial services be cut.
	Happy to pay 5% more on council tax, but couldn't afford 10. I think 10% would be counter-productive, as CTax team would have to chase non- payers.
	Anyone who regularly parks in EL towns would agree that traffic wardens could get more revenue than at present.
	EL council must be one of few employers to pay 6 months' full pay for sickness. I know the rules were changed recently, specifically relating to phased returns. However, this must be a huge cost - especially when some employees regard it as an entitlement.
452	Sell St Joseph's building.
	Do away with the Star Awards. Although this event has sponsorship it still costs the Council some amount of money.
	All Council staff including Senior Officials should buy their own newspapers, tea, coffee etc. This includes catering facilities for internal meetings.
453	Allow advertising on Council vehicles, bus shelters, buildings.
	Use volunteer groups to provide and or assist with essential services (Litter picking, footway gritting, home help, education, museums, libraries)
	Do not accept cheques or cash and move to self service payments/card payments.
	Live chat response to service requests, this would improve customer experience and reduce times that staff deal with queries.
	All Council vans/cars/ lorries to be parked at depot, unless on call or required. Lot of public monies are being wasted to facilitate an employee getting to and form work. If needed for there job yes, but, if not then they should park at there depot.
454	A lot of managers in some departments. No need for as many managers and senior staff.
455	As a teacher in the local community I am extremely concerned that there are schools sitting with PT's and class teachers with only a few children in their classes/schools. I believe that schools sitting below 50% of their roll should be closed. In large schools children and teachers face much bigger pressures (limited resources, limited support etc) it would make much more sense for this to be spread out more fairly and catchment areas to be looked at more closely. I feel that the council is struggling to enhance their schools and teachers, support staff and nursery staff feel let down by the lack of funding.

456	As an East Lothian primary teacher with no pay increase (actually due 16% increase in real terms) I cannot afford to pay more on council tax.
	The residents in East Lothian have already went to a fortnightly bin collection without a drop in council tax.
457	As long as children who are most vulnerable still receive free school meals, I feel that free meals for all children P1 -P3 is unnecessary.
458	Best of luck with this. No easy choices.
459	Bus fleets for adult services should not be run by ELC.
	Money for large new building projects should rather be spent on existing buildings eg port seton sports hall money should be spent on Port Seton Centre, which is in dire need of new windows, internal doors etc.
460	Car Parking - would be happy to pay a small charge to pay for parking. East Lothian residents are lucky that parking is free in town centres etc - it's a fact of life if you want to park in Edinburgh!
461	Challenge the introduction from the government of free child care. As a council you cannot meet these needs. You do not have enough premises and you do not have enough nursery nurses. Stop kidding yourself and take that back to the government.
462	Charge for bulky uplift should be reinstated instead of coastal parking charge have more wardens issuing tickets for on street parking and also looking at bad parking in housing streets where some park on corners. make but use of shared facilities libraries and customer service in all local offices.
463	charge for car parking on street and in car parks.
464	Charge for garden aid as other council charge for this facility provided.
	Allow Community clubs hire schools on a Saturday morning through the winter and charge a hire fee (a lot of local football clubs for youngsters look for indoor facilities over the winter).
	Charge for waste pull out facilities and certain types of special uplifts for especially metals ie fridges etc and bathroom suites etc
465	Charge for parking facilities for non council employees in car parks at Council Buildings e.g JMH, Randall, Penston, Sports Centres, Libraries, Schools.
	Charge council staff for the replacement of lost of damaged smartcards.
	Charge council staff for car parking permits at council buildings, e.g annual fee of about £20-£40 make it mandatory to have a permit to park.
	Charge for the use of electric charging stations.
	Extend the use of Pay and Display meters to include use around the county's busiest town centres, e.g Haddingtgon, Dunbar, Tranent, Musselburgh, North Berwick.
466	Charge full cost of service provision to cared for people

467	Charging additional fees for licensing especially for large events such as the Open Golf Championships and/or local galas.
	Saving money - sell a few of our offices and buildings.
468	Charging for non-essential services such as special uplifts would be invaluable income. Review council assets (especially property) and rationalise where possible.
	Reduce wastage across council offices (including energy efficiency).
	Ensure staff are working in the most efficient ways.
469	Charging for on/off street parking is a must now. Very few LA's in Mainland Scotland do not charge for parking. This will be unpopular but necessary. This will also help with the horrendous situations occurring daily in all town centres in the County where gridlock is a frequent occurrence.
	More investment in Parking Enforcement Officers will be required though to properly enforce this and to monitor the parking on surrounding residential streets, and to take action as required.
	The Car Park at JMH should either be restricted to only ELC employees and visitors by means of a barrier at each entrance/exit or should be made pay and display, with possible other land being made available somewhere in Haddington for staff to park? Barrier could be operated by ID Cards/SEC's by staff or by intercom for visitors.
	Off Street Car Parks around the County should all be made pay and display at least during 8am - 6pm Monday to Saturday.
	Council Staff should all be given SEC's now (gradually underway anyway) and with those allow for travel on Scotrail, Lothian Buses, East Coast Buses, Borders Buses, etc, when travelling for Council Purposes. Each of these travel companies are already geared up to use SEC's and this could give rise to negotiated costs /fares from the travel companies at preferential rates, reducing the travel expense bill for the Council.
	All communications with staff should be only electronic to their council email accounts (unless they do not have an email account). Whether this is HR, Payroll, Line Management, Council Services etc. Far too much expense is incurred in needless pieces of paper flying around and the associated postage costs.
	Similarly any communications from Schools to parents should only be electronic, where at all possible. Where siblings are in the same schools, only one set of information should be imparted where possible.
	Regular transport between Council Offices and other key locations should be set up to reduce the reliance on car transport.#
	Reorganisation of the location of staff and teams within the Council should be considered to move teams with little or no public contact (ie. Finance, IT, HR, Payroll, etc) to offices where there is little or no public access (Penston & Randall Houses).
	Pressure should be placed on Lothian Buses/East Coast Buses to further improve services and reduce costs to passengers, especially east of Tranent where fares are still ridiculously high. Other operators should be encouraged to expand routes and provide more direct competition.
470	Close very small rural schools

	Cut grass less often
	High school students under 3 miles can walk to school
	Charge for music tuition unless you are on working tax credit
	Put out to tender more maintenance jobs- council employees seem to be less efficient, not sure if this will cost less though
471	Combine more services, streamline staff costs
472	p1 - s6 education, early years, free music lessons are most important and must not be reduced in any way.
	Reducing/ paying for bulky uplift will only result in fly tipping which will end up costing more.
	Free public transport for the elderly must not be stopped otherwise they will not be able to afford to get out and about. Elderly people often go out because they can't afford to heat their homes.
	Stop putting anti-social people in new homes so that they can wreck them. (personal experience of this in neighbouring street)
	Stop food waste in schools.
	Stop wasting unused EU subsidised milk in schools.
	Reduce street lighting e.g. switch off every 2nd/ 3rd light on a clear night
473	Not spending money on projects no one wants and consultations no one has asked for e.g the vision for Haddington town centre which seems unpopular and pricey, the large statue at Dunbar, the merging of primary schools which councillors have assured is not a cost saving measure (why do it then?)
474	Consider more outsourcing of services - particularly where these services would still be delivered by local residents/businesses anyway. ie property maintenance with something like https://www.r3direct.co.uk/ .
	Move non-customer facing staff out of buildings in the middle of towns and consider selling those buildings. For example, the library HQ/print unit area would presumably be attractive to developers to build on with the lib HQ functions moved to an industrial unit elsewhere.
	Identify any non-statutory, non support services and stop them first.
475	Consider services which do not have to be provided by statute.
	Do we need to have Community Wardens Team?
	Are we still funding Police Scotland Liaison officers? If so, why?
476	Continue to educate re the value of recycling: Some schools are mindful and recycle whilst others don't- still throw plastic bottles away.
	Launch a new initiative to raise further awareness to all council employees and the wider community at large regarding the importance of sustainability.

	Try to encourage "good quality" shops to invest in our high streets.
	Restrict betting shops and discount stores on the High Streets thus encouraging more people to visit East Lothian-Luca's ice cream is visited by thousands of people outwith the county because of it's exceptional reputation.
477	Continue to maintain "green" spaces but cut back on floral displays.
478	Continue to share services with other local councils and bulk buy to save money. Less upper management
479	Council run maintenance of buildings reviewed and private companies sought.
	More efficient service by employing e.g joiners who can drive. Cut down the number of white ELC vans on the roads.
480	Council Tax on second homes - be radical. Not enough homes yet so many holiday lets.
	Volunteering. Many people want to help, but approach is not coherent.
481	Council tax should be means tested not on house prices! Especially in east lothian where the top band is anything over £212,000 - try buying a house in east lothian for less than that!! Means I pay the same as those in huge mansions on huge salaries!
	Also teachers have just received a 2% pay increase and inflation is 3% so actually a cut!
	But the fat cats still get their huge salaries and bonuses and loads of people are sitting in free/very cheap council houses claiming hundreds because its easier than getting a job.
482	Councillors expenses should be cut. Forget about a new East Lothian flag, another waste of money. Social work expenditure should be reviewed. Allocate couples houses, it would be good to see them being treated fairly as most would pay rent. At the moment what I see is single mothers getting houses, rent being paid then the partners move in. They lie because they know they won't get a house. I know of single mums who are given temporary accommodation and they don't live in it. Someone should be checking they are living in it. Hard working young couple are being discriminated against.
483	Creative partnerships with the third with an interest in investing in the capacity of communities
484	Curtail nice to have such as County Rangers. Volunteers could take on these roles. Further limit opening times of Council Buildings saving on heat and light and potentially staff costs.
	Council tax is unfair as it does not take account of earnings, I'd like to see a local income tax based on income so everyone pays the same % of their income.
	On street parking charges should be introduced in EL towns (modest fee Eg £1 per hour) this may also increase income for local business's.
485	Cut Local Councillor expenses budget's
486	Cuts to education are putting the most vulnerable of our children at higher risk and is placing pupils in settings that aren't suitable and with poor staffing levels where children are role modelling violent behaviours that they would not have been exposed to previously. I am greatly

	concerned by the impact of the future of our young people especially the risk of cuts where children with life limiting conditions are being cut which means they have little education or experiences that build quality of life beyond basic health needs being met again. The strain and stress on staff is not sustainable. Their will be a significant increase in population and children coming to the area over the years ahead and a significant rise of children with serious health and learning difficulties from more complex backgrounds and not with the same levels of family
	support and networks around them to support. If we don't have the staff to intervene we will cause more issues for all our futures. Please protect staffing levels and where possible INCREASE staffing NOT CUT to meet a growing demand.
487	Distribute more leadership to the services - less at the centre
488	Do away with STAR awards.
	Rationalise council estate and empty buildings develop for commercial space.
	Focus more on key core services
489	Do away with the 2 Depute Chief Executive posts and the Head of EL H&SCP
	Do a targeted VERS
	Bring the outsourced contracts back in house
	Look at HR & Payroll sharing with other councils
	Look at the Council doing more private work
490	Education is crucial,. especially in terms of reducing the attainment gap between the least and most well off members of the community
491	Education must be held paramount. The decline in funding is strangling the provision within our council and staff are at breaking point due to the extreme budget cuts and lack of willingness to protect one of their largest departments within the council.
492	Encourage the use of public transport by introducing parking charges. The Council Building car park has room for some 250 cars. At £1.00 per hour, 8 hours a day, 5 days a week, this could generate around £500,000 per annum, less costs. Few other workers enjoy free parking, especially in the private sector.
	The introduction of restricted and charged parking should be balanced with considerations such as footfall to local shops, the availability of public transport, disabled parking facilities, ease of access for the elderly and adults with young children, etc.
	However, if this single item could generate "up to" £5 million, as suggested on the cost saving budget options, then this is an obvious target.
493	Ensure all departments are working their contracted hours and stop Job & Finish agreements. Bin collection could be extended to assist with special uplifts / hi volume litter areas instead of finishing once they have done their routes as this happens nowhere else in the council. This would take off a lot of strain from local street sweeping squads who have to lift a lot of fly tipping in towns and rural areas
494	Equality of opportunity for children. Why list possible introduction of charges for music tuition when children involved in sport don't have to pay coaching fees, equipment costs or for strips etc. All pupils should be treated equally whether they have an artistic or sporting talent

495	For those rural schools perhaps the building could be used for community purposes, creating income to cover costs for electric, heating, insurance etc. Schools can be a vital link for many people living in rural areas creating supports that may otherwise impact upon the council.
496	Get rid of lollipop men or women where there are already road crossings in place.
	Remove free transport for young people aged over 12 years living less than three miles from school. The exercise would be beneficial and help reduce obesity.
	Scrap free travel to over 60's unless they are disabled.
	The council should get back to focussing on key priorities such as keeping roads and pavements well maintained as well as ensuring schools are well equipped and fit for purpose.
	Local businesses should be supported rather than taxed to the hilt.
497	Have Council House rents means-tested so that Council tenants who are working are paying the market rental for a property. Needs to be proactive support to Council tenants right at the beginning of their tenancy to ensure they are budgeting and more support for tenants to stop them getting in debt in the first place as a lot of staff resources now spent trying to get money in or recover debt.
	Outsource property maintenance service.
	Cease East Lothian Council's involvement in Musselburgh Racecourse - the Council needs to concentrate on public services and it is actually supporting gambling which goes against their aim of trying to reduce poverty.
	With regard to school crossing patrol attendants - they must be kept where there are unsafe crossings but there is no need for attendants where there are crossings. Council then to put crossings where they are needed so that there will be less requirement for school crossing patrol staff in the future.
	Make commitment to share services with other Councils now so that one Council could provide on behalf of another or others and have a planned programme of review.
	Have the same system of recycling nationally ie its mad to have different coloured bins/crates in different Council areas. Review bins for businesses so that only the bins required are provided. Charge for any extra crates needed for the property
	Agree arrangements on boundaries so that waste can be recycled regardless of where someone is living ie if you live nearer an East Lothian recycling site and you live in Edinburgh/Midlothian or Borders let people recycle in East Lothian and vice versathe whole point is to reduce carbon footprint.
	Provide pooled cars for all staff who regularly do a lot of mileage.
	When a Council tenancy changes - don't take out perfectly good kitchens, bathrooms and carpets.
	Have some kind of additional deposit scheme for Council tenants so that up to 3 repairs a year or whatever reasonable -there is no charge but any additional repairs are charged. If not usedcarried forward to next year and if costs are additional to the deposit tenant has to pay more.

	Review cleaning service to identify what cleaning is needed where and have specifications drawn up for each building.
	Review the amount of separate telephone lines the Council uses - is the Council paying for telephone line rental it doesn't need?
	Sell surplus furniture and equipment so that the Council isn't using office or building accommodation to keep furniture that it doesn't need.
	Have some kind of reciprocal arrangement with neighbouring Councils that staff living outwith Council area in which they work, can hotdesk from another Council property near where they live for some days, depending on the work they do.
	Review all the Estate and make decision to close underutilised buildings and either lease out, sell or give to the Community.
	Can the public services in any given area share depots?
498	I agree to the increase in Council Tax Charges only if the investment is in Adult Social Care and if there are increased charges for those who can afford it to pay for adult social care services. There needs to be significant investment in increasing and upskilling the workforce in the care sector so more people can be supported at home.
499	I am a school teacher and have seen the positive impact that the Outdoor Learning team have had on my pupils. I agree with Education Scotland that, 'The journey through education for any child in Scotland must include opportunities for a series of planned, quality outdoor learning experiences'.
500	I am not persuaded that changing the running of community and village halls in the ways proposed will actually deliver the amount of savings suggested.
501	I don't understand why ELC are approving so many houses to be built in the area - therefore increasing waste services / social work / pressure on schools. Almost every school in the area needs an extension. Too much pressure on road services and a huge lack of parking - could go on and on and on here. STOP approving so many houses in this beautiful area that is being ruined
502	I feel strongly that it is essential maintain the services that clean streets/collect litter/address anti social behaviour such as dog fouling/litter/graffiti. There is a risk that anti social behaviour increases as the condition of the streets declines. Our physical environment strongly impacts on our mental health.
	Similarly our physical environment is essential to our mental health and should be invested in.
	Perhaps garden waste could be collected once per month with the time that would be used for uplift of garden waste to be used on maintaining street cleanliness. A scheme such as that supported by "Leithers don't litter" in edinburgh could be introduced. This scheme supports residents are supported to "adopt a street". they then work with City of Edinburgh to target litter.
	There is a risk that an increase in bulk uplift charges could lead to fly tipping.
	I would support the introduction of parking charges and a congestion charge to address the pollution that is a problem in Musselburgh.
	Protect libraries. I am aware they are not a statutory function but think they play a vital role in mitigating the impact of poverty and in enhancing a person's wellbeing.

503	I feel there is a huge amount of wastage within our council across many areas. I don't feel our services should suffer or council tax be increased when East Lothian Council are wasting, for instance irresponsible printing of paper, employees being entitled to timberland and Berghuas jackets at £100 and branded steel toe cap boots exceeding £50.
	Within council properties new kitchens are being replaced when the kitchens are not at the end of their life spans. Adapted bathrooms are being removed after only being fitted a few years previously. Tradesmen's journeys are not thought through so wasting a huge amount of fuel. If East Lothian Council were to look after there own pennies, hundreds of pounds would be saved. More attention needs to be paid to where money is being wasted and not make people choose between having support for vulnerable children and adults and having a swimming pool or repaired roads or education.
	All employees have a responsibility and we all need to be told and reminded we are part of the bigger picture to save money for our community.
504	I question whether the increased revenue from an increase in Council Tax would be wisely spent by the council e.g.Patch repairs on roads and pavements are a false economy.
505	I think we should invest more time and effort into charities. If we supported them they could take a lot of the workload off are services.
	I also think personal budgets (self directed support) in social care is a strategy that would cut costs in the long run.
	Working in partnership with organisations and maybe other councils will also I think increase money. For example, shared customer service responsibilities over the phone?
506	I would like to see longer term planning of resources in public services as I know that budgets are often shared with front-line services (schools, health services, etc.) at short notice and with very little scope for joined-up planning. For example, rather than give a school department a one-off budget of £2000, with no indication of which amount can be factored in during the next session, could the same department count on an smaller but more consistent annual budget? This would save panic-buying and stockpiling of resources when money could be channelled to much more sustainable learning resources.
507	I would not support an increase in council tax until I was fully satisfied that cuts were being made in the right places. An increased budget is helpful if it is spent wisely but merely exacerbates things if it isn't.
508	I would only agree to 5% increase in council tax if there was a guarantee that the money would be ring-fenced for spending directly within the community.
509	I would be ok with the council tax increase however if there where still cuts especially to the services i use i would not be happy. Council tax increases may also put more financial pressure on those who just can't afford higher outgoings.
510	If central government was to stop wasting our existing tax money on foreign policy we would have sufficient income to meet all our home country needs. It was declared that £15.5bn was spent on foreign policy last year (more likely to have been a lot more) not to mention the hidden cost of our warmongering and interference in far off countries.

	More taxation of drivers through parking charges is unacceptable. High Street trade will suffer as people will definitely move to the retail parks. I certainly will. I have already stopped going to local beaches for this very reason.
	Cut bureaucratic administration posts in councils and that will save a packet. Reduce council worker travel costs by managing inspections and visits to be more efficient. Really, why do 4 officers go out in their own cars, when visits could be co-ordinated to be in the same area and therefore by filling one car would be much more efficient and cost effective. Many employees use travel as a means of supplementing their pay!
	Maintenance of our leisure facilities and open spaces is a must. With all the depression caused by politicians incompetence we need places to go and relax and chill.
	Education is important, but the costs are out of control. There is no need for blanket school dinner provision, school transport provision, free out of hours music tuition, free nursery provision and no need for expensive classroom assistants.
511	If staff were empowered to make decisions and be supported by management, there could well be a case for reviewing the too many Chiefs and not enough Indians situation.
512	If you want to cut your budget you can Start by looking at the ridiculous salaries of the top brass, some of which earn nearly as much as the PM, the stupid amounts of money the council wastes on conferences with other councils (ie travel, accommodation and food. Seriously have you never heard of vlogging?) And instead of putting pressure on departments to spend all their budget or they get less next year why not just give them a set budget each year and any they save gets put back into the budget pot? The council waste money in so many ways that don't affect the services.
513	In difficult times it must be all about people and we must protect the poor and vulnerable in our society. We should also be expected to pay a bit more if we can afford it.
514	In early years education it is paramount that the council continues to invest in providing teachers in every setting. Removing teachers from nurseries in order to save money would be a short termist approach. It is essential that teachers are planning, teaching and assessing our youngest children, removing teachers would result in children missing key skills in their early years. The fall out from this would be falling attainment levels as children move through the 3 to 18 curriculum. Children who have missed vital steps in their early education will require additional funding at later stages.
515	In the last year East Lothian has provided the backdrop for several major events. Does ELC make a charge for these events?
	We are extremely lucky to live in such a beautiful county and perhaps we need to be paying a little extra to do so
516	Increase parking charges and increase monies going to schools for Outdoor Education which many schools in East Lothian cannot afford transport costs to and from and those schools within walking distance of the facilities at Musselburgh, tranent climbing wall, Meadowmill, the Law etc are able to take part in these events, but schools too far away cannot afford to send their children which is not acceptable. The gap is increasing between those who have and those who do not!
517	Increase the charges for item such as dog bags, printing in libraries

	Reduce cash payments in local offices and offer online options
	Charging for parking throughout East Lothian
	Closure of buildings that are half empty to save on bills, expenses
518	Increase the number of coaches and drivers available to transport services, thus reducing the need for expensive private coach company hiring.
	Re-introduce minibuses to all Secondary schools, and encourage ELC staff and none staff to attend minibus driving courses to reduce reliance on expensive private coach company hiring.
519	Instead of full-time residential care for elderly people, could a part-time, pick and mix approach be taken.
	Fill internal vacancies from a 'pool' of existing staff with relevant qualifications and/or experience.
520	Introduce charged services which have proved popular in the private sector. For instance dog day care. This could be at a reduced rate than the private sector but still generate significant income.
	Reduce Printing costs by doing timesheets and records online and restricting access to printing to reduce unnecessary printing.
	Review the night time noise team. Is it effective and needed in conjunction with the police services already provided.
	Review emergency call outs to East Lothian council tenants. For instance vulnerable tenant get priority call outs and receive same day call outs for reasons which others would wait longer. There is no proof required of vulnerability. A person only needs to say they are disabled but there is no guidelines or evidence required to get an emergency call out which requires overtime pay to those who attend. Introducing guidelines for vulnerability and proofs required would cut down on overtime for the housing repairs team with repairs being carried out during the day for those with no proof or those who do not meet the guidelines.
	Offices currently are cleaned every day. Perhaps this could be reduced to every second day (Monday, Tuesday and Friday). The contact centre at macmerry is often a busy workplace at the weekend with cleaning only carried out on a Friday evening and again on the Monday evening. It remains relatively clean.
	Review security out of hours. It appears they work all night but after 1pm do not have many call outs. Perhaps they could be on a call out basis gaining hours when required.
	Review pool cars. For instance, those carrying equipment require vans but those who only require a car could perhaps use there own and claim mileage.
521	introduce means testing for some provisions
522	Introduce parking charges in council car parks such as that those off the High Street in Dunbar
523	Introduce penalties for residents who fail to utilise their food, paper/cardboard and plastics recycling. It is shocking to see how many residents on our street continue to use their green general waste bins only. We are a family of 5 who make use of recycling and our green waste bin is usually only half full when it goes out every fortnight. By contrast, many of the houses on our street are occupied by one person, and their

	green bins are bulging because they don't recycle anything. You could save money by making the green bin pick up every 3 weeks and that would encourage people to use their recycling bins more too. Better for Council budgets and better for our environment too.
524	Invest in appropriate resources for schools that are modern - technology.
525	Is the council fining companies who fly tip? Plenty of it happening on rural roads. Council making trips to pick up the rubbish costs money. Catch them and fine them.
526	It is very difficult to compare cuts to core services such as adult and child social work, and homelessness, against less "essential" services as libraries, music tuition and outdoor education. The spending on education and social work is huge, and services funded by smaller budgets should not suffer disproportionately. Elected members must be prepared to make hard, vote-losing choices, about changes to garden aid, bulky uplifts, etc.
	Income could be increased by parking charges, parking permits for residents, means testing entitlement to services wherever possible.
	Save money by stopping street cleansing and flower-planting, and leave communities to do this for themselves.
527	It is virtually impossible to rank cost savings etc with next to zero information and context for these services and assests. The vast majority of EL residents have little clue what most of these services do. Also poorly worded e.g. Review car parkingto what? Increase it? Decrease it? Scrap it?
528	Less managers on higher wages and more on the ground staff.
	Merger of services i.e. make use of school buildings outwith normal hours and during holidays.
529	Look at how much money is wasted within the council on staff that are unnecessary in highly paid roles and on certain training event, travel expenses etc instead of targeting vulnerable people within East Lothian that often seems to be the case.
530	Look at schools who have two deputy head teachers. I don't think this is always needed.
531	Look at schools with 2 deputy heads. This is not needed as schools have functioned perfectly well with 1 deputy head in the past. Also look at senior management in all departments - too many chiefs.
532	look into bus and taxi provisions for adults with learning disabilities and physical disabilities as many people now have disability cars and receive DLA, savings could be potentially made.
534	Lots of land is being used to build new housing developments which is a shame as it's taking away the "village" or small town feel of beautiful East Lothuan . Surely there must be a way of increasing the amount of money the building companies pay to get planning permission. This should/ could go back into improving local services.
	What about reducing brown bin collection during the winter months?
535	Make council services more efficient. Cut down on duplication of efforts, services.

	Charge those who can afford to pay but support those who can't
	Make more use of council resources and buildings for community use
	Work in partnership with other agencies to get a good deal for everyone
	If you want something you work for it, get unemployed working for the community
	Make more use of volunteers/people involved in their local communities
536	Make rural schools catchment only and close rural schools that maintain minimum numbers by out of catchment intake. For example elphinstone school has circa 70 kids most of which are transported from Tranent yet has a head a deputy head three class teachers 2 learning support and various auxiliary. Must be cost inefficient
537	Manage when street lights go off and on as they tend to come on too early at night and go off to late in the morning, this would reduce your power bill
538	Merge council facilities to one building. Provide a one stop shop. Merge facilities like customer services and libraries throughout the county. This would mean that buildings could be sold or rented out which do not have a high footfall and generate an income. This works extremely well in Tranent, Dunbar and North Berwick which all have great community atmosphere in the buildings.
	Charge for special uplifts as when charges were in place the waiting list was minimal but since the charges have been introduced waiting lists are extremely long.
539	Monitor departments more closely on their use of outside contractors that are not cost effective, properly procured eg outside contractors doing collection of parts etc when no work for them to do. Only bring them in as workflow demands. Monitor dispensation of overtime payments to staff on flexible working who stay late / come in early and exceed there hours and get paid regular overtime. Review of service Delivery.
540	More common sense to be used in managing work done by council workers. Less red tape, and more sensible people.
541	More vigilance with benefits fraud.
542	Not privatise council buildings and cleaning services to companies such as FES. Short term economic gain for long term economic pain.
543	Not the easiest thing to do or understand. If reviews of organisations are done I hope they are for the better. Outdoor learning is a valuable asset for all children considering mental health statistics at the moment.
544	Not to waste £20k of public money pandering to the tactics of Gullane-Drem path campaign to provide route for 3 middle aged cyclists to commute to Edinburgh
545	Only provide garden waste uplifts between March and October
546	Parents who can afford school meals should pay

	Have garden rubbish only collected in Summer months
	Food caddies every fortnight
547	Perhaps services need to look at what they do well, what can they share with other organisations and sell on, eg educational programmes etc
548	Perhaps the Council could re evaluate it's own buildings and sell some older buildings that are not efficient to use. Also perhaps the Council should encourage new business ie in Haddington , as relocating 200 staff out of the town had a huge financial effect on the whole town. Healthly business's bring in income for everyone.
	For the Rural schools, they are a vital part of Communities whose benefits can't be measured financially and when schools close families have no incentive to support these villages and they become full of older residents needing care. Communities need to have a even mix of age groups.
549	Perhaps the management structure at the Council could be streamlined.
	Some of the benefits like rail cards etc. perhaps can become means tested depending of course how much administration that will require.
550	Protecting the youngest and most vulnerable is our society should be the priority. Health and Social Care/Children and Families and Education.
551	Put a business manager in place in Adult Wellbeing and staff the finance team appropriately. Cutting out staff from the one area that could scrutinise and save money is just crazy. and putting in staff at grade 4 level without appropriate training and knowledge is what is leading to money being lost by the dept.
	When repairs are done to the roads, make sure that it is done with good quality materials that will last years rather than days, otherwise its a waste of time and money. The path round Gullane Golf course is great, and well used and encourages people to get out and exercise, but there is already grass and roots growing through the tarmac and it will be destroyed within a year or two. So pointless and a waste of time.
552	Put some Council owned buildings up for sale - move staff to other locations.
	Close smaller library branches where stand-alone building that could be sold.
	Stop "pat-on-the-back" corporate events such as Star Awards and CSPQ ceremonies.
	Stop providing "tea and scones" at training events and meetings - staff should bring their own refreshments; or simply provide tea and coffee.
	Look into street lighting - turn off some lights after midnight?
	Increase Council Tax across the board - not just for Band E and above.
	Look at use of Council vans - is every journey necessary and by the best route? Are any vans being "taken home" at night instead of being left on Council premises? Could mail runs/deliveries be more efficient - done in a different way?
	Look into sharing resources between services more and between Schools.
	Centralise ordering of stationery etc - the bigger the order, the bigger the discount!

553	Reduce energy bills with more renewables such as solar PV; waste to heat.
555	
	Advertising on council vans; certain open spaces.
	Encourage more people to pay for services online thus reducing costs.
	Parking charges in town centres only.
	Introduce cycle hire scheme.
554	Reduce funding to Community Councils etc. These tend to be run by small groups of like-minded individuals with little to no interest in actually listening to their local communities, instead using any funding to pursue their own pet projects.
555	Reduce the number of libraries that are poorly used
	Reduce community centres that are poorly used
	Increase council tax
	Increase rent charges
	More focus on benefit fraud and ensuring payments made
	Humbie primary school closure, mostly attended by out of area kids
	Reduce bin collections and penalties for people who don't recycle
	Charge for dog bags and recycling box covers
556	Reduce use of consultants and high end agency, by developing own staff to facilitate
	Cut back on fuel and all council vehicles should be parked in a council depot, not out on streets blocking roads.
	Cut back on expenses by developing a green travel plan
	More use of council vehicles/employees and less use of contractors
557	Reduce waste by more efficient services, more efficient website and online services
558	reduce/streamline the number of middle management that exists within the council - remove one tier.
	rationalise the number of Council Offices in the North West Area of the county - Tranent/Musselburgh/Prestonpan. Close Prestonpans, move some of the Front office functions to local libraries (Prestonpans/Port Seton)make more use of Tranent & Musselburgh as a staff base for Officers. Too many community facilities in Prestonpans: close The Town Hall.
	Reduce the number of Council Vans
	Charge for the Use of the Council Staff Car Park at Haddington, encourage staff to use Public Transport
1	

559	Reducing senior management- re-evaluate salaries of those at the top.
	Smarter, more flexible way of working e.g encourage homeworking/mobile working and hot desking- could lead to more people into fewer council buildings and selling off other buildings if appropriate.
	If someone wants to build a house (not just big house builders) in the area they should contribute to local school. I think its Perth Council that has this scheme already in place.
	Payment for additional services e.g additional bin pickup or pick up of big items (if appropriate- see below)
	Abolish council charges that cost more to collect than they generate.
	Cut number of council vehicles (if appropriate)
	Cut or reduce spending on agency staff and contractors/ consultants.
	No catering at any council meetings/ events across the board.
	Earn from private advertising- payment to the council for advertising within staff areas , in community buildings and on side of buildings etc, website space.
560	Remove free bus passes for over 60s, especially those who can afford it. Look at how procurement works within ELC and reduce some of the red tape around that. Look at Senior Management within the council and see if some of those salaries could be redeployed at the front line where staff are needed.
561	Remove specific preferred providers for ordering of school supplies and services, to providing the best value for money instead. Often the preferred suppliers are not the cheapest or best option.
562	Removing or reducing vital services for example education provision, maintenance of roads, School Crossing Service and waste services would be detrimental to East Lothian. These services are vital to help to ensure the wellbeing and safety of both residents and visitors to the county. Savings should be made by reducing or removing non-essential services for example
	Increasing or introducing fees to certain services would be a much more positive approach. An increase in Council Tax after an 8 year freeze would be acceptable to increase income.
	Reducing non essential services for example removing the concessionary rail travel card and reduce partnership funding to organisations would have a much less negative impact on the community.
563	Review of salaries for senior councillors.
564	Review of some staff terms and conditions and benefits
565	Save money by not sweeping the roads when it's wet. Don't pick up leaves till they have fell. Raise money by charging irresponsible dog owners for not picking up poo.

566	Saving money by threatening rural schools is disgraceful. Why should families living in the countryside be deprived of a local school? I am a member of Humbie community and I would be devastated if our local school was closed. Our children should not be victim to running schools like businesses where money is prioritised over children's education. Over crowding in classes due to budget cuts in schools is a massive issue: the education of pupils is certainly compromised and parents are often left paying the cost of private tuition as a result. The school role at Humbie Primary has dipped in 2017-2018 but nursery numbers show that it will recover quickly - it is devastating to think that the life of a school should be threatened so quickly. This village school demonstrates education at its finest; the children, teachers, and community involvement should be a source of pride to the council. It is a fabulous school - my son describes it as his second home - and I do not know how the community would recover from this loss.
567	Share vehicle usage between and across different departments
	Make JMH car park a pay and display facility
	Offer a 4 day working week to council employees
568	Some of the council run events are publicised in schools with glossy brochures and leaflets - many of these are put in the bin. A small change!
	As a Geography teacher, the Outdoor Education service has been invaluable to us over the 14 years I have worked in Education. They have supported us with fieldtrips for SQA assignments and with training for Duke of Edinburgh.
569	Star Awards should be presentations at in the Saltire Room's it should not be such a costly event, in times of such budget constraints.
	Special Uplifts should have a charge attached to them except for those in receipt of benefits.
	Free school meals should only be provided to families in receipt of benefits regardless of the child's age.
	A small charge should be made for library book loans and services except for those in receipt of benefits or pensioners
	Youth Outreach Services - street work should be restricted to Friday and Saturday nights (when they are most needed)
	Stop accepting cheques as a method of payment, we have online, over the phone and direct debit facilities.
	charge for caddy liners like we do dog bags
	stop free lets, there are instances where certain groups are allowed free let of halls and take advantage of it when they could be providing the council a good source of revenue.
570	Stop investment in iPads, stop schools buying iPad, stop supporting iPad. Reduce computer use within schools. Stop "Bring Your Own Device" Scheme as it is a distraction within schools. Is there any concrete evidence to show that this technology has any positive impact on literacy, numeracy or on any objectively measurable academic grades? Any evidence is, to be charitable, inconclusive.
	Also, remove funding and support for Musselburgh Racecourse. This is a commercial organisation which makes its money through the exploitation of dumb animals and the promotion of gambling. Yes, the Council should be supporting local business, that would include local

	shops, and local entrepreneurship. I would have thought with the growth of the gambling industry over the last few years would have provided the money for the Racecourse to pay for their own IT Support and not rely on subsidised support from the Council.
571	Stop putting bids out to tender - it is a well know but unspoken fact that companies charge more 'because it is the council'. These service providers need to be made fully aware of the financial state of East Lothian and be forced to bid appropriately.
572	Stop the internal Star Awards. There must be costs involved with this and not essential. There are other free ways to reward staff, just saying a personal thank you is one!
	More home working for staff? Less running costs if not having to heat, light offices etc.
573	Stop wasting money using firms for repair of public buildings that increase the costs after their initial quote. Ie: when a firm puts in a quote don't necessarily go for the cheapest quote. Get a guarantee of cost and if the works goes over time the firm should give a percentage back. more and better coating of work done within the council. Be tighter on costs.
574	Support schools/services to increase recycling rates - make it easy to do so rather than a chore.
	Build higher density housing (smaller infrastructure) and more natural spaces for residents to use.
	Review the impact of high levels of management - e.g. head of education.
575	Tax tax tax charge charge charge that's all you can think of. Get rid of excess administration and councillors and you will be able to afford services.
576	Tender for private contracts
577	The Council could begin with cutting back on unnecessary bureaucracy and shiny printed pamphlets that seem to always be circulating despite budget cuts ' East Lothian Way', etc.
	A consultation like this will be completed by a small amount of residents so it must be more accessible.
	Putting local village centres and halls into community ownership is an excellent idea.
	An overview of the overall Council staff should be undertaken, could people be retrained have multiple areas that they can operate it; gardeners that maintain parks, and local grounds could be further skilled to undertake handy man jobs, decorating etc. School staff could work between schools in specialist areas.
	As there is a discrepancy between the schools in terms of overall success and pupil attainment, why not look at the teachers/ faculties with the highest success rates and rotate them around the schools in order to share good practice and support those who need it thereby raising attainment across all schools, not just having one or two that are deemed to be the best, this should have a welcomed levelling effect throughout East Lothian communities!
578	The council needs to prioritise. For instance more support is needed in schools, especially the support for learning departments. This type of support is invaluable to the development of young people in order for them to gain an education. If we can better education and meet the

	needs of all young people (which is a requirement which at the moment is not good enough in east Lothian- GIRFEC). In comparison to other Lothian councils the funding given to these does not equate to the same and the consequences are becoming apparent.
579	The frail, elderly, children at risk must be protected at all costs, this must be covered no matter what, we want to be the best.
580	The frequent use of taxi services for school should be examined.
	Any empty housing stock should be looked at and if not suitable for use, sold off.
	Charging people in council housing property for general repairs - subsidised but have to make a contribution unless they are on full benefits.
	Increase council housing charges.
581	The loss of the outdoor education service would have a great impact on the children in East Lothian. Outdoor Education is seen as a vital part of the curriculum by Scottish Government and for it to work well schools need access to high quality staff expertise.
582	The previous council tax increase for the pupil equity fund should be kept within East Lothian.
	Street lighting turned off from midnight to 6am.
	Look at the effectiveness of the landscaping department - there seem to be a lot of breaks compared to hours worked!
	Could the taxi service for school transport provision be rationalised?
583	The Roads Department needs to be reviewed. For small road repair projects there are far too many employees sitting in lorries or standing around doing nothing. After works are finished signs are left scattered along the roadside (we have some which have been lying around for months). This can't be efficient use of resources.
	Would one large recycling bin be more economical than lots of little boxes where lids have to be replaced constantly?
584	There is a lot of ways the Council could save money that have not been listed eg reduce number of vans that are given to Council employees - it seems that every tradesman has a van and am sure they use them for their own person use as well.
	Do public grass areas have to be cut every 2 weeks - reduce to once a month.
	Mechanical street sweepers - reduce how often they are out - every single morning where I live is a bit extreme and noisy into the bargain!!
	Why is the council using buildings that they have to pay rent for?
585	There is no need for primary schools of any size to have two deputy heads.
586	Too many Chiefs and not enough Indians. Cut down on upper grades.
587	We all benefit from a well funded local authority which supports community life. I am much happier to pay more in tax to enable the local authority to invest in those service which help to maintain a vibrant community.

588 We are a young family, with a high mortgage due to East Lothian house prices and our property has been placed in a high Council Tax Band, because of utterly outdated system. We're already paying a huge proportion of our income in Council Tax (particularly after the hike in the higher bands) and would struggle financially to pay any more. It would severely impact the little disposable income we do have left to spend in the local area and I imagine many young families will be exactly the same.

589 We must protect children, vulnerable adults and the elderly to ensure they have a good quality of life with access to services they need.

Everything else could be viewed as luxury in terms of service provision.

590 Whilst we support a small increase in Council Tax we would rather see measures put in place to ensure everyone paid their Council Tax rather than once again hitting the people who do already pay it. Also perhaps you should be looking at the number of senior management within the Council and perhaps reducing the levels of senior management rather than once again planning on hitting front line services, which is always the easy get out by the council. Streamline a dozen higher management salaries rather than five dozen lower paid employees.

5. COMMENTS ON OPTIONS IN 'HARD CHOICES' QUESTION / ANY OTHER COMMENTS (OTHER RESPONDENTS)

could	Please use this box to share any comments on the options in the previous question or to tell us any other ways in which you think the Council could do things differently to increase income or save money. Please use this box to tell us any other ways in which you think the Council could do things differently to increase income or save money.		
591	A progressive local income tax instead of a council tax, which taxes people based on their income brackets.		
	(Also if you start to strip away at our public services any further, expect a general strike.)		
592	Allow schools more freedom of where they buy consumables from, often the prices on PECOS are far higher than available from other suppliers. This would allow funds to go so much further.		
593	Allow staff to source cheapest resources within schools outwith procurement list (which is often more expensive and wastes considerable finance resources in schools).		
	Make effective use of the additional council tax income from the 10,000 houses being built in EL for those very houses. Ensure the building contracts incorporate the necessary services to support the houses the builders are creating from their end. They will profit enormously - they should be obligated to reinvest a certain proportion in the area. Landowners, should be obligated to support services on a percentage basis.		
594	An emergency service should be an emergency service re out of hours. Only dire emergencies should be carried out at the weekend.		
	A 7 day week should apply to all depts. Mon- Sun and from 7am - 9pm all single time reducing overtime		
	Supervisors/managers should have a min % re staff as there seems to be a lot of TOP HEAVY depts.		
	Sell council units lying empty i.e old rent off, Dunbar. St Joesephs school, Tranent, Alderston House, Haddington etc		
	Spend less time and money on star awards and disciplinaries (which can up to 9/10mths) at a huge cost to taxpayer when the majority can be dealt with at management level.		
595	Charge customers for duplicate letters. Customer Services currently prints off duplicate letters such as council tax for customers to use as proof of address etc and does not charge for this.		
	Look at the mileage that Grade 8 and above's claim, are all these meetings/journeys necessary!!		
	Too many different levels of management.		
596	Charge people over the phone who demand OOH services. Also, ensure systems are updated with all tenants details where there are disabled people or children under 1 living in a property as I have often seen on social media where people say 'phone the council and say your child is disabled or under 1 and they will get someone out'. All people living in a property should be shown on our system with a DOB.		
	Brown bins need only be collected once per month in the winter season.		

	Support young children in schools. Early intervention is key to a child's development and if given the support in early years the child has a better chance of progressing in life and not requiring continuous support from the council for the rest of their life
597	Employ COMMON SENSE in ALL dealings, it works out cheaper. Stop wasting money being inefficient and incompetent. Stop employing and paying people who don't do their jobs properly.
	Put in place the checking of maintenance/repair jobs carried out by outside contractors to see they are completed properly to a decent standard, preventing jobs being re-done and paid for again, companies are being paid a lot of money for sub-standard work.
	Don't charge people for enjoying this beautiful county, that's not attractive. The fields (what's left of them) and countryside, the beaches and shorelines, the trees, the sea, the wildlife, the big skies and stunning views should be preserved at all costs., especially for the people who already live here. These things ARE East Lothian.
598	Funding for STAR awards could be used differently.
599	Get office premises cost effective and more efficient.
	Encourage private business to support events (they would happily invest in advertising at the popular events East Lothian hosts).
	Co-ordinate road works with private company maintenance schedules.
	Invest more in recycling and recoup revenue by selling by-product to external companies.
	Put VAT on private school places and charge them FULL business rates.
600	Get rid of machines to collect street rubbish. They miss an awful lot of it and he does not stop to get the bits his machine cannot reach. There is also a second man picking up little bits of paper but leave the terrible cigarette buts at bus stops. My scaffy of years past did a much better job left no leaves at all at Eskside West between both bridges at number 29 where huge amount of leaves lie and block drains.
	Tell Musselburgh Community Council to stop wasting thousands of pounds blowing money up at 5th Nov. Mend our roads and pavements instead.
	Make our pavements safer for wheelchairs to get down and up onto the roads. Needs urgent attention. Thanks.
601	I oppose a review of outdoor learning for young people in East Lothian. An outdoor education and the consequent active lifestyle that it enables is proven to help mental health, physical well-being and academic learning. Cuts to these kinds of services would be a short-term source of revenue, which may result in large expenditures in NHS treatments for diabetes, mental health services and avoidable academic underachievement.
	It makes both economic and social sense to invest in outdoor learning for the young people of East Lothian, the 'Garden County'!
602	I see so much money being wasted on poorly repaired roads that have to be mended again shortly after; pavements being resurfaced then dug up for some electrical work only to be resurfaced again, ill thought out investment in short term solutions for primary school buildings which then are rethought and re built such a waste of resources. Council employees flinging wheely bins down with such force the wheels break off so they have to be replaced I've seen the same with recycling boxes. You seem to have infinite resources to replace all these things but send

	out an appalling questionnaire like this forcing local people to choose between care for the homeless, or investment in primary schools, local services and the wonderful provision of dedicated outdoor learning teams. It makes me furious. These services are ALL VITAL.
603	I would agree that rural schools such as Humbie would benefit from being transferred to Saltoun, A lot of small schools link up for activities as a result of not having sufficient numbers to participate and it would save the Council money on keeping such small schools open. The children at such small schools have an unfair advantage on teacher-pupil time and resources such as instrumental selection. It would also prepare the children better for going to High School if they were at a bigger Primary.
	I also think that large community recycling bins would be better than the individual household bins which tend to end up all over the street on a windy day after the collection. The household collection could be reduced as a result. This would work for plastic and paper but perhaps not for food waste.
604	Improve communication between various branches of the council. Systems that 'talk' to one another so that information can be shared more easily.
605	Increase productivity by council workers.
	Increase stock control measures across all employees including outworkers like electricians, plumbers, plasterers, you'd save a fortune.
	Sell some of the large garden areas with the council houses which you are not keeping tidy and the elderly residents cannot keep. Be a responsible landlord.
606	Instrumental tuition within schools gives all children a chance to develop their musical abilities particularly those from non musical families who would not think to seek out private tuition whatever their means. Means testing would be ok but currently the service is very limited. Why not consider expanding it and offering free places to the children who do very well on testing (as now) and means tested places at a commercial rate to those children who are currently not offered tuition. This would both bring in funding and expand the level of musical participation in schools.
607	Introduce on street parking charges like in Edinburgh.
	Charge extra money for Permits as some seem really low compared to other authorities
	Road Construction Consents currently incur no charges to developers which happens Nationwide. Considering developers need to pay for planning permission and building warrants then this would be a step in the right direction given the number of sites that are being developed.
608	Keep in mind that savings shouldn't increase costs, i.e. charging for bulky refuse uplift may = increased costs though fly tipping.
	Protecting education provision is key, means testing music funding is preferable to closing rural schools.
	Support for economic development is key, more businesses = more rates, more employment etc.
	Over 60s receive free bus travel, they don't need free rail travel (could be means tested).

Parking charges stand out as a good revenue stream. Most towns in the uk charge for parking, including for residents. Parking charges could be used to improve the transport infrastructure and make it easier to use the town.
Levying higher charges on aggressive housing development across the county particularly for strategic infrastructure which is severely lacking.
Stop allowing so much housing development which puts increased pressure on services.
Look at stopping free school meals for all P1-P3 pupils. Parents on a low income should still be able to apply for free school meals.
Only give free school meals to those on low incomes not all p1-3.
Extend parking charges to town centres (even a nominal fee would increase revenue and reduce congestion)
Please, please do not cut disability services or ASN provision in any way, shape or form. Families are struggling now and need more help, not less.
Real focus should be on those that are on reduced incomes with rent arrears and council tax arrears be made to recoup what they owe. Too many band E and above are paying the price for poorly managed rent income and council tax services.
We are the squeezed middle, with the perception of a good quality standard of living but in reality we have to pay for the following: Mortgage; Increased Council Tax; Child Care; Non subsidised travel; Non subsidised school dinner / uniform; Non subsidised after school activities for our children
It appears that raising council tax is only an effective measure if everybody pays their fair share. It is clearly apparent in East Lothian that most don't.
Review the way Council tax is charged. It is wholly unfair for me, as a single parent, working part time due to childcare issue, to have a discount of only 25% compared to - next door neighbour with 3 full-time working adults in the same type of house.
Scrap car parking charges.
Scrap childcare funding for 2 year olds for those receiving certain benefits - I don't see why this is necessary or fair.
Closely monitor hours claimed by professional carers for the disabled as I have reason to suspect some disabled people are not getting their allocated hours.
Stop sending out bus passes annually for those over 60. When you have reached 60 you don't need a card every year as you will always qualify moving forward. One card when you reach 60 should suffice - no need to replace annually.
Charge council employees for car parking - a modest sum for a permit.
Stop handing out free tea, biscuits and coffee at school and council events - charge people for it.
Thank you for the opportunity to take part in the consultation on the East Lothian budget for 2017-18. Dunbar Primary Parent Council recognises that the council has difficult financial decisions to take. We note that a review of the school crossing patrols has been identified as one way in which the council could make savings. We would like to highlight that in Dunbar, which has the largest primary school in Scotland,

pupils are encouraged to walk to school on their own. Having the school split over two sites means many families have little choice but to send older children to school by themselves as parents cannot walk to two different places at once. The presence of a crossing patrol, for example near the busy Belhaven Road and at Kellie Road where there is no form of pedestrian crossing, is appreciated by parents. Dunbar Primary Parent Council would like to express their support for the additional level of safety for children provided by the school crossing patrols. We hope the council does not have to reduce this service. If a review is taken forward, we sincerely hope the implications of reducing or removing crossing patrol cover is considered location-by-location, road by road. Nobody would want to regret the loss of this service at any school in the region.

618 You could increase funding through organising car parking space in North Berwick better. Everyone parks for free in the roads. Manage the car pas better. Ticket street parking / only 1 hr free or maybe at weekends when there is loads more traffic everyone should pay. Help control traffic too.