

## Members' Library Service Request Form

Date of Document	01/02/20
Originator	Paolo Vestri
Originator's Ref (if any)	
Document Title	Analysis of Budget Consultation Exercise: December 2019

Please indicate if access to the document is to be "unrestricted" or "restricted", with regard to the terms of the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985.

Unrestricted	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Restricted	<input type="checkbox"/>
--------------	-------------------------------------	------------	--------------------------

If the document is "restricted", please state on what grounds (click on grey area for drop-down menu):

For Publication
-----------------

Additional information:

Authorised By	Sharon Saunders
Designation	Head of Communities & Partnerships
Date	10/02/20

For Office Use Only:	
Library Reference	18/20
Date Received	11/02/20
Bulletin	Feb20

## 2019 Budget Consultation: Final analysis including whole of the Citizens Panel

An online survey, which was live from 15<sup>th</sup> December 2019 to 15<sup>th</sup> January 2020 attracted 120 responses.

At the same time the Council's Winter 2019 Citizen's Panel survey included a similar set of questions to the ones that were asked in the on-line survey. In total 616 panel members completed the survey; 475 completed the panel survey on-line and a further 141 returned the survey by post.

The tables in Appendix 1 provide the results of the general population on-line survey (120), the on-line Citizen's Panel survey (475) and the full Citizens Panel survey results (616).

Both the on-line general population survey and the Citizen's Panel surveys show large majorities in favour of inflationary increases in charges, and for rationalising assets, even if this means closing some council offices.

### ***To what extent do you agree that existing fees and charges for council services should increase in line with inflation?***

	<b><i>On-line Survey</i></b>	<b><i>Full Citizen's Panel</i></b>
Agree	68.5%	62%
Disagree	26.3%	29%

### ***To what extent do you agree that the council should rationalise its assets even if this means closing some council offices?***

	<b><i>On-line Survey</i></b>	<b><i>Full Citizen's Panel</i></b>
Agree	82.2%	62%
Disagree	16.9%	27%

There are smaller, but still clear majorities in favour of charging for discretionary services.

### ***To what extent do you agree the council should introduce charges for discretionary services, rather than stop them completely?***

	<b><i>On-line Survey</i></b>	<b><i>Full Citizen's Panel</i></b>
Agree	55.1%	56%
Disagree	38.1%	31%

Both surveys had a large majority against stopping the provision of discretionary services.

### ***To what extent do you agree the council should stop providing discretionary services?***

	<b><i>On-line Survey</i></b>	<b><i>Full Citizen's Panel</i></b>
Agree	24.5%	18%
Disagree	63.6%	65%

The one area where there were diverging views between the general population on-line survey and the Citizen’s Panel was in relation to whether the council should reduce the frequency of discretionary services rather than stopping them completely.

The general population on-line survey had a small majority on favour of this option whereas the Citizen’s Panel was evenly split with no majority either for or against this option.

<b><i>To what extent do you agree the council should reduce the frequency of discretionary services, rather than stop them completely?</i></b>		
	<b><i>On-line Survey</i></b>	<b><i>Full Citizen’s Panel</i></b>
Agree	53.5%	42%
Disagree	32.2%	40%

Both surveys included a question about the public’s willingness to pay higher Council Tax giving four options – increases of 2%, 4%, 6% and 8%.

The on-line survey and the Citizen’s Panel asked this question in a slightly different format so they are not directly comparable.

The on-line survey showed that two fifths (42%) of respondents would support a 2% rise, just over a fifth (22%) would support a 4% rise. 10% would support a 6% and 10% would support an 8% rise. If we assume that those supporting a 6% or 8% rise would support a 4% rise, then over two fifths (44%) would support a 4% rise.

Three quarters (75%) of the Citizen’s Panel said they would be prepared to support a 2% rise in Council Tax, 37% a 4% rise, and 17% and 15% either a 6% or 8% rise.

	<b><i>On-line Survey</i></b>	<b><i>Citizen’s Panel</i></b>
Support 2% increase in Council Tax	42%	75%
Support at least a 4% increase in Council Tax	44%	37%

Finally, the on-line survey asked respondents to comment on the top priorities identified in previous consultations and suggest any other areas that should be a council priority, and also asked for comments about how the council could do things differently, to increase income or save money.

The full set of comments are presented in Appendices 2 and 3.

**Appendix 1: Comparison of full results from the On-line Survey and the Citizen Panel**

**Q1. To what extent do you agree that existing fees and charges for council services should increase in line with inflation?**

	<b>On-line Survey (120) %</b>	<b>On-line Citizens Panel (475) %</b>	<b>Full Citizen's Panel (616) %</b>
Strongly Agree	27.1	16.6	15
Tend to Agree	41.5	48.5	47
Tend to Disagree	10.2	18.5	20
Strongly Disagree	16.1	9.5	9
Don't Know/ blank	5.1	6.9	9
Agree	68.5	65.1	62
Disagree	26.3	28.0	29

**Q2. To what extent do you agree the council should stop providing discretionary services?**

	<b>On-line Survey (120) %</b>	<b>On-line Citizens Panel (475) %</b>	<b>Full Citizen's Panel (616) %</b>
Strongly Agree	7.6	2.9	3
Tend to Agree	16.9	15.8	15
Tend to Disagree	32.2	37.0	34
Strongly Disagree	31.4	29.8	31
Don't Know/ blank	11.9	14.5	16
Agree	24.5	18.7	18
Disagree	63.6	66.8	65

**Q3. To what extent do you agree the council should introduce charges for discretionary services, rather than stop them completely?**

	<b>On-line Survey (120) %</b>	<b>Online Citizens Panel (475) %</b>	<b>Full Citizen's Panel (616) %</b>
Strongly Agree	9.3	5.3	7
Tend to Agree	45.8	50.8	49
Tend to Disagree	18.6	18.7	18
Strongly Disagree	19.5	12.2	13
Don't Know/ blank	6.8	13.0	16
Agree	55.1	56.1	56
Disagree	38.1	30.9	31

**Q4. To what extent do you agree the council should reduce the frequency of discretionary services, rather than stop them completely?**

	<b>On-line Survey (120) %</b>	<b>Online Citizens Panel (475) %</b>	<b>Full Citizen's Panel (616) %</b>
Strongly Agree	9.3	3.2	4
Tend to Agree	44.1	37.2	38
Tend to Disagree	17.8	25.0	26
Strongly Disagree	14.4	14.9	14
Don't Know/ blank	14.4	19.8	19
Agree	53.5	40.4	42
Disagree	32.2	39.9	40

**Q5. To what extent do you agree that the council should rationalise its assets even if this means closing some council offices?**

	<b>On-line Survey (120) %</b>	<b>Online Citizens Panel (475) %</b>	<b>Full Citizen's Panel (616) %</b>
Strongly Agree	28.0	16.4	18
Tend to Agree	54.2	46.4	44
Tend to Disagree	12.7	18.9	19
Strongly Disagree	4.2	7.7	8
Don't Know/ blank	0.8	10.7	11
Agree	82.2	62.8	62
Disagree	16.9	26.5	27

**Q6. Would you be prepared to support a council tax increase in 2020 of...**

	<b>On-line Survey (120) %</b>	<b>Online Citizens Panel (475) %</b>			<b>Full Citizen's Panel (616) %</b>		
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>D/K</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>D/K</b>
2%	42%	69.5	19.7	10.7	68	22	10
4%	22%	30.3	50.2	19.5	29	50	20
6%	11%	12.8	64.1	23.1	13	63	24
8%	11%	12.2	67.4	20.4	12	67	22
Don't Know/ blank	14%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

## Appendix 2: Comments from On-line Survey on Council Priorities

### Do you agree with the top priorities identified in previous consultations?\* Let us know if there are other areas you think are a priority

\* previous consultations have shown that the following services are public priorities:

- Schools and early years
- Services to protect children from harm and to support families
- Support for vulnerable adults, including frail/elderly people to allow them to remain in their own home
- Maintenance of roads, pavement and lighting
- Waste and recycling services

Responding to the Climate Emergency was the only issue that was raised by more than three of the respondents who made suggestions.

1	I think we should have wheelie bins for glass and paper recycling like Midlothian have then the rubbish wouldn't blow over the roads as happens with the boxes.
2	Burial grounds, street cleaning grounds maintenance, roads street lighting.
3	Primary one deferral funding for Aug - Dec birthdays. This would be a drop in the ocean and East Lothian is currently the worst at approving funding in Scotland!
4	More support for home owners too
5	Planning Economic growth
6	New social housing in Haddington
7	I agree that early yrs, education & social care need to be the top priorities
8	Libraries- Libraries contribute to education and literacy, community cohesion, health and wellbeing. These should be seen as important as education. Libraries support and underpin the delivery of a wide range of local agendas. They are inclusive places and are vital to communities. They are places for people to socialise, to combat loneliness, warm, safe places, somewhere to get access to computers to write cvs, apply for jobs, complete benefits form and get advice or signposting onto vital services, get access to free resources, and on top of all this, they make reading fun: something people will do with family and friends.
9	Funding for nursery placements for children born August to December who have a deferred school entry is a priority for me
10	Stronger links need to be developed across council departments to support all those living and working in East Lothian. Road and pavement repairs are not tackled quickly and robustly enough. Lifelong learning needs to be made a priority with strong links between our schools and libraries.
11	Employment. Attracting firms to East Lothian to provide local employment.
12	Priority 1 should be Support for vulnerable adults, including frail/elderly people to allow them to remain in their own home
13	Agree with all the above. Public Transport (improving and subsidising) needs to be in there

14	<p>1) Schools and early years 2) Services to protect children from harm and to support families 3) Support for vulnerable adults, including frail/elderly people to allow them to remain in their own home</p> <p>Are more important than roads and lighting.</p> <p>Waste and recycling are a rather small part of the £10k per family. Are these really a priority, except that we generate too much, which the Council strictly does little to discourage. Free</p>
15	pickups for large items seems unnecessary.
16	Yes agree but also very important to allow free access to poor and disadvantaged voters who need to be able to go to places and walk and run without paying restrictive charges for unasked for parking facilities. Let people have free access to wild land and shores to walk animal companions and reduce stress. Saving on care requirements.
17	Dealing with anti-social behaviour
18	I agree but young adults mental health should be a specific priority.
19	Climate change and the natural environment.
20	<p>Services for children and adults with additional support needs, Safe spaces for play and protecting natural environments Climate change and the infrastructure that supports it Keeping children and adults safe from harms including domestic abuse services</p>
21	Yes broadly agree. Council should revert to original remit of providing clean environment, educating (not just children) and supporting those most vulnerable and leave economic development to private sector and market forces.
22	<p>Agree - also wish to see 1) refugees and refugee children as a priority 2) climate emergency measures prominently addressed</p>
23	There are too many LED lights and they are causing glare into homes and impact on sleep. Have a dark night policy and don't have so many lights
24	We are in a climate emergency, and this is not reflected in your budget document. Thinking on climate change should be embedded in every service and has real potential to improve peoples quality of life and wellbeing, from improved energy efficiency in public buildings and council housing, to improved active and public transport and amenity spaces.
25	Services for disabled people outside mon-fri 9-5
26	Protecting children from harm and support for vulnerable adults should be provided centrally not locally.
27	Climate Change and ecological emergency
28	I believe that the waste and recycling services as they currently are are adequate and so I wouldn't consider it a priority as such. I do believe that significant thought, energy and funds should go into high street area regeneration projects. It is now becoming more well understood that a thriving high street has far reaching benefits for the community it serves and in turn can pick up the slack where the council can't e.g supporting community projects and charities

28	Helping first time buyers - renting can be a massive money drain if renting privately. If they can be helped to stay in the area and buy a home, the money saved can be spent in the community, on leisure (sports centres, shopping locally), which would benefit the council.
30	The climate emergency needs to be a priority. Local services. Public transport. Well insulated council/ local authority housing (like the recent public housing in Norwich).
31	1) Maintenance and development of walking paths and traffic free cycling paths. e.g. the walking paths from Rhodes Park in North Berwick to the sea front have very poor drainage in places (which could be easily remedied on the short path across the golf course). This discourages use of the paths (and increases use of cars) as the paths are frequently ankle deep in mud.  2) Further improve recycling and reduce waste
32	Better community support for the elderly
33	Yes but also local Drs surgery's need help as too many patients
34	Yes, complete agreement. We have to find a way to invest more in schools particularly as regards staffing when so many more children than ever before are in mainstream education with additional support needs.
35	Mental health support
36	Respite for young adults with severe & complex needs once they leave child services. There is nowhere for them to go for respite. At the moment my son gets 9nights a month which stops in June. We need the respite so that we can continue to care for our son for as long as possible in a loving family home. Adult services is appalling compared to children's services in East Lothian
37	I think more focus needs to be on social care for older people working together with NHS to free up beds in hospitals by increasing staff on ECS and allowing emergency call handlers to divert falls to ECS and take on more palliative or temp care packages.
38	Housing and Antisocial behaviour.
39	As a non-parent I have no interest in schools and early years and I always disagree with having to pay the same as parents so that their children can benefit, if you have children you should pay more.
40	Housing and homelessness
41	Essentially yes but transport infrastructure and a review of planning should be included along with supporting communities to work in partnership
42	The maintenance of roads is a priority and reduce speeding in built up areas too
43	My priorities would be: Roads maintenance and parking Waste management Stop paying council tax for unemployed people
44	Transport for adults with learning disabilities and physical disabilities
45	Housing for homeless families should be more a priority than waste/recycling



**Appendix 3: Comments from On-line Survey on other ways the council could do things differently to increase income or save money**

	<b>Comment/ Suggestion</b>	<b>Response/ Action</b>
1	The heating in schools needs to be reviewed. The school I work in so hot all the windows are open and people walk about in tee shirts.	Comment passed on to the relevant services to consider
2	Private work in new housing developments in East Lothian	Not sure what this is suggesting
3	Review how many management positions.  Clamp down on wasteful external consultations regarding our towns	Council staffing is reviewed regularly  Place making/ planning for our town centres is increasingly important given the growth across East Lothian. Many of these exercises are funded by Scottish Government or other agencies
4	Charge for garden waste collections  Introduce tourist tax  Continue to reduce emissions - more electric vehicles in fleet  Rationalise buildings - make increased use of school facilities at evening and weekends	Currently being considered  The council has not yet formally considered whether it would introduce a Tourist Tax  The council has a programme to replace fossil fuel vehicles with electric vehicles  The council is reviewing its assets with a view to rationalising both its office estate and public use buildings
5	Time and motion study on council employees.  Paying companies for consultation fees without consulting with residents and businesses first.  Not borrowing money to make repairs to housing stock this should come from rent income.  Train staff on recycling to stack boxes as they find them instead of throwing them about the	The council undertakes service reviews to ensure services are effective and efficient  The council does not always have the capacity to undertake consultations itself and sometimes it is felt that external consultants can provide either expertise or an independent view of consultations with residents and businesses  Rent income is used to pay for the cost of borrowing to invest in new housing stock and modernisation of existing stock  Comment passed on to Waste services to consider

	<p>place and they won't have to be replaced so often.</p> <p>Introduce a small parking fee for council staff who get exclusive use of Brewery Park.</p>	<p>The council is reviewing parking at Brewery Park but is not considering introducing a workplace place parking tax</p>
6	<p>Increase income through:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• a tourist tax on hotel rooms per night</li> <li>• by leasing out unused property for new purposes.</li> </ul> <p>Make efficiencies by using buildings for multiple services</p> <p>Move more services online where possible.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• See 4 above</li> <li>• The council does attempt to lease out or sell vacant property</li> </ul> <p>The council is exploring shared use of its properties where possible (e.g. the Haddington police station is moving to John Muir House)</p> <p>The council is committed to moving services online. A new Online Customer Portal is being launched soon</p>
7	<p>Don't waste money on the likes of a county flag, naming of new villages (end result was very predictable)</p>	<p>The consultation on the county flag and name of the new town were virtually cost free apart from staff resource required to support these community consultations</p>
8	<p>Lose council cars, ensure councillors travel across the authority on public transport. Will show commitment to environmental policies but will also allow them to see the lack of provision in public transportation across the authority</p>	<p>The council only has one council car for use by councillors and it is used only in exceptional circumstances</p>
9	<p>Amend the Council tax band. Increase the amount of bands and re-value properties correctly.</p>	<p>The council does not have responsibility for setting Council Tax bands or carrying out property re-valuations</p>
10	<p>Not erecting unnecessary metal fences.</p>	<p>Not clear what metal fences this is referring to</p>
11	<p>Stop printing menus for every primary school pupil. Menus are online so paper copy not required for everyone.</p>	<p>Comment passed on to Education service to consider</p>
12	<p>Engage the public more to become Friends Of... local parks and areas like the amazing success shown by the volunteer groups helping the Countryside Ranger Service. This would help reduce maintenance, litter collection etc</p>	<p>The council is reviewing its volunteering policy</p>

13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A tourism tax</li> <li>• Car parking charges, paid residents parking schemes</li> <li>• Remove discretionary business rates relief.</li> </ul> <p>Less spending on roads and street lights (which could be turned off), better targeting of public transport subsidy (some local services seem to be very poorly used). A more imaginative approach to the impending climate crisis, before it becomes a catastrophe. Better use of section 75 agreements to create decent and durable walking and cycling and green infrastructure, as opposed to more play parks and playing fields - there is arguably very good provision (which btw are illuminated even when not in use).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tourism Tax – see 4 above</li> <li>• Car park charges and resident parking schemes – the council's Transport strategy includes a process for introducing car park charges if they are promoted / supported by local communities</li> <li>• Discretionary Rates relief – the council policy is to have discretionary rates relief for some groups such as charities</li> </ul> <p>These suggestions are already being considered by the council</p>
14	<p>I am in favour of charges for discretionary spend but it will be good if these services can be sold at cost so that they are seen to be good value for money, reflecting a high degree of efficiency from the Council.</p> <p>I am in favour of the coastal car parking charges which do represent good value.</p>	<p>The council's Charging Policy sets out the process for reviewing all charges and exploring charges for discretionary services</p> <p>Current policy is to charge for coastal car parking. Any changes to this policy would need to be approved by Council</p>
15	<p>Allow people free access to sports and well being facilities to reduce care requirements.</p>	<p>The council does not have the funding to abolish all charges for sports but it does support concessions and a Leisure pass scheme to support disadvantaged groups to participate in sports activities</p>
16	<p>Streamline management structures as much as possible</p>	<p>Management structures have been streamlined and senior management posts are reviewed as part of Efficient Workforce Management</p>
17	<p>Charge for brown bin collections in line with Edinburgh and Midlothian.</p>	<p>The council does not currently charge for brown bins. Any changes would need to be approved by Council. Budget consultations have shown that this option is not supported by the public</p>

18	Close very small schools	The Council Plan does not support the closure of schools
19	Review some of the older services such as roads and waste and see if they can be rationalised.	All services are reviewed to consider how they can be delivered more effectively and efficiently
20	There are lots of spaces which could be sensitively commercialised e.g. sports and leisure facilities such as Dunbar swimming pool.  Paid parking zone at the Brunton Theatre	The council is considering how it can be more commercial and has recently carried out a review of leisure services to identify efficiencies and commercial opportunities  The council's Transport strategy includes a process for introducing car park charges if they are promoted / supported by local communities
21	Look at the cost of contracted services to see if they are cheaper and better than in house services.	See 20 above
22	Prune back the workforce. May not be what political administration would want but reduce posts to essential front line services. Although nice to have sports development staff, EL Works, tourism staff etc - these remits also fall under other agencies including UK and Scottish Government, SportScotland, Visit Scotland etc. Duplication wastes council tax payers money and provide dubious local benefits. Consider more joint working with neighbouring authorities	See 20 above
23	Charge for car parking; introduce 20 mph hour traffic widely to reduce impact on roads; do more active promotion of public transport to reduce car use and relate all of these to addressing climate emergency  Move all meals provided in the county by social services, community centres, schools, hospitals to vegetarian and/or plant based by 2021. Millions of people live healthy lives globally on vegetarian diets. Making East Lothian a vegetarian county would be a step forward for the climate emergency aims	The Transport Strategy addresses these issues  This comment does not relate specifically to the budget situation but will be passed on to the Education and Facilities services for consideration
24	Stop making it easy for people to not look for work. Half the people claiming benefits have jobs on the side	The council does not have responsibility for 'job seekers/unemployment' benefits

25	Less lights	The council has a programme to upgrade all lights to LED which is more energy efficient
26	Improving the energy efficiency of buildings and installing the maximum energy generation on every property has potential to help with this.	This is in line with the council's existing policy to reduce energy consumption and consider solar panels where appropriate/ financially viable
27	Please consider cutting out the pointless sweeping of gutters! The chap comes along on Thursdays, often when there's is nothing to sweep up! He also does the same section twice to fill his time. He does not do the difficult bits leading to drains. This is a waste of time and money.	Comment passed on to the relevant services to consider
28	Ensure all areas are operating as efficiently as they can eg opening hours for buildings, unnecessary heating and lighting for buildings, selling off council buildings no longer required,  Stopping initiatives that have costs attached such as ELC flag competition, consultation of the name of new town	See 20 and 27 above  See 8 above
29	A lot of efficiency is to be had through the provision of services digitally which is already known.  It is well known that there is a use it or lose it culture for councils which doesn't always encourage the right mentality for those working in the public sector. Perhaps rather than each department being encouraged to spend their entire budget, regardless of need and requirement, the council creates a pot where any savings made can be allocated to improvement projects or ones where the public get to vote on?	The council is committed to moving services online where possible and a new Online Customer Portal is being launched soon  All council departments are encouraged to come in within budget.  The council has a cost reduction fund which has been built up from previous budget underspends/ reserves which is used to invest in initiatives that will achieve efficiencies and budget savings
30	Employees - time management courses and more support for employees, emotionally and to maintain work-life balance. Employees could be taught to work more efficiently. Additionally, if support was provided for emotional wellbeing and personal development, employees would be more happy and happy people are more efficient, work harder and work smarter (less likely to burnout, which can lead to costly sick leave and loss of productivity for employers.) There are studies that a 4 day work week (for 5 days pay) results in increased productivity and	The council has a Healthy Working Lives initiative, including staff support programmes and resilience training, aimed at increasing staff wellbeing and resilience with a view to reducing staff absence

	<p>happiness for workers. Obviously some services require 9-5 Monday to Friday but not all and this model of working hours does not suit everyone and I feel condensed hours should be considered for a wider range of roles.</p> <p>Becoming more paperless, where appropriate. using the postal service which costs a lot compared to email, as well as less money spent on physical resources, like paper and stationery.</p> <p>Teaching employees and people in the community to live more energy efficiently and less wastefully.</p>	<p>See 30 above</p> <p>This is a key part of the Climate Change Strategy and Action Plan</p>
31	<p>Increase prosecutions for fly tipping.</p> <p>Phase out recycling boxes replace with bins to prevent them blowing away on windy days and the constant need to replace the plastic covers.</p>	<p>The council prosecutes fly tippers when it has sufficient evidence to secure a conviction</p> <p>Options appraisal has shown that the recycling boxes are the preferred option</p>
32	<p>Encourage developers and land owners to create new and maintain existing paths</p> <p>Clarify what can and can't be recycled and where, and make it easier for everyone to recycle more.</p>	<p>We do encourage this, but have limited powers to 'force' developers</p> <p>Information is provided to householders on what can and cannot be recycled</p>
33	<p>Heads of council departments can take a pay cut in line with all other workers</p>	<p>Levels of pay are determined through national negotiation and agreements. Council workers have not had pay cuts. Council pay increased by 3% in 2019 and is due to increase by 2% in 2020 in line with national agreements</p>
34	<p>Increase rent for unemployed</p> <p>Reduce hand outs to single mums especially with more than one child</p>	<p>Housing benefits and social security benefits levels and entitlements are determined by the UK and Scottish Governments</p>
35	<p>Utilise fleet services in a productive efficient way</p> <p>Reduce private taxi hire for individuals who have mobility cars. Pay your own way for transport to the service the council is delivering</p>	<p>This is already council policy and practice</p> <p>The council has reviewed transport for care clients and reduced the cost</p>
36	<p>Stop paying director high wages</p>	<p>Levels of pay are determined through national negotiation and agreements</p>