

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE

TUESDAY 1 NOVEMBER 2022 VIA A DIGITAL MEETING FACILITY

Committee Members Present:

Councillor N Hampshire (Convener) Councillor C Cassini Councillor D Collins Councillor A Forrest Councillor C McGinn Councillor S McIntosh Councillor K McLeod Councillor J McMillan Councillor C Yorkston

Other Councillors Present:

None

Council Officials Present:

Mr K Dingwall, Service Manager – Planning Ms E Taylor, Team Manager – Planning Delivery Ms M Sullivan, Head of Development Mr J Baker, Service Manager – Economic Development Mr D Irving, Senior Planner Mr N Millar, Planner Mr C Kiely, Planner Mr C Grilli, Service Manager – Governance Ms M Haddow, Transportation Planning Officer Mr G McLeod, Transportation Planning Officer Ms P Gray, Communications Adviser Jon Canty, Transportation Planning Officer Marshall Greenshields, Senior Roads Officer

Clerk:

Ms B Crichton

Visitors Present/Addressing the Committee:

Item 2: Mr D Anderson, Ms B Lewis, and Mr M Scott Item 3: Ms C Davie, Ms V Scott, and Mr J Scott Item 4: Mr P Pritchett, Ms J Waddell, Mr G Laing, Ms J Bell, and Mr K Ross Item 5: Mr P Pritchett, Ms J Bell, Mr D Wilson, Mr A Hay, Mr J Opfer, and Mr S Geddes

Apologies:

Councillor L Allan Councillor J Findlay Councillor N Gilbert

1. MINUTES OF PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING, 4 OCTOBER 2022

The minutes were agreed as an accurate record of the meeting.

2. PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 22/00239/P: ERECTION OF POULTRY BUILDING AND ASSOCIATED WORKS, FIELD TO THE WEST OF HOWDEN WOOD, GIFFORD

A report was submitted in relation to Planning Application No. 22/00239/P. Ciaran Kiely, Planner, presented the report, summarising the key points. The report recommendation was to grant consent.

Officers responded to questions from Members. Mr Kiely advised that the revised Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) submitted with the application incorporated comments from SEPA. SEPA would be responsible for the site regulation under the PPC licensing regime, and were content the environmental impact on the site should be low.

Sederunt: Councillor Cassini joined the meeting.

Councillor McIntosh enquired about the concentration of ammonia, which was just over the critical threshold, and whether this took into account the cumulative effect from other farms. Mr Kiely said that the Planning Authority was guided by SEPA, who were content that the slightly exceeded threshold would not lead to a significant impact. He confirmed that the cumulative impact of all three hen sheds in the area would have been taken into account. He also advised that Policy NH9 was not deemed relevant because there was no direct outfall onto any adjacent watercourse.

Dave Anderson, agent, and Michael Scott, applicant, were present to speak to the application. Mr Anderson highlighted that there had been no consultee objections to the application, and that SEPA had been satisfied with how the site would be operated. Regarding ammonia thresholds, Mr Anderson said that data did not take into account modern farming operations including the drying of manure, but confirmed all sheds within an agreed radius with SEPA had been taken into account. Water quality had to be assessed on an ongoing basis under pollution prevention and control (PPC) regulations.

Responding to further Member questions, Mr Scott gave an account of security measures, including a CCTV system and security gates. Mr Scott also gave an account of waste management of hen manure. Five hundred tonnes of dried manure was exported to other farms in the area, who used best practice for litter storage. No spreading could occur on the site, which was on a nitrate vulnerable zone, and there could be no run-off into watercourses. Mr Anderson advised that vehicle movements would include food deliveries and egg collection by HGV lorries, and car movements as day-to-day checking of birds and egg collections were carried out. Mr Anderson advised that previous tree felling had been to fulfil requirements for sightlines at junctions, and thinning of wood had been for traffic safety after trees had fallen onto the road. Replanting had taken place as part of this operation, and the woodland was managed by the applicant's brother as part of a Woodland Management Plan.

Following questions from Councillor McGinn, discussion took place regarding measures following the avian flu outbreak. It was established that DEFRA guidance for Scotland was for poultry to be kept indoors; although this was only an advisory note at this stage, Mr Anderson highlighted that no insurances were available for farmers who chose to keep birds outdoors should there be an outbreak amongst their stock. Mr Scott advised that in the two sheds currently housing hens, the birds would not be allowed outside until such time as they were laying anyway, and said the business followed free range guidance.

Councillor McIntosh had been reassured in her areas of concern with air and water pollution. She commented that the Planning Authority should think strategically about intensive poultry operations in the area and the cumulative effect on the environment, referencing significant problems with algal blooms in watercourses in the Wye Valley caused by an excessive concentration of intensive poultry farming sites.

Councillor McLeod commented that the facility looked first class, and fitted well within the 'growing our economy' goal as part of the East Lothian Plan. Councillor McGinn would also be supporting the application, but said that animal welfare considerations had to play key role. He had been satisfied by answers regarding woodland management.

Councillor McMillan had been reassured by the quality of answers to Member questions. He commented that to fulfil economic development goals to become Scotland's leading food and drink destination, it had to be easy to set up and grow a business. He thought that sustainability and environmental considerations had been well covered by SEPA, and he would support the application

The Convener noted that although some of the issues discussed had not been planning considerations, they were still relevant, and constituents should know that Councillors considered these wider issues. He said that the countryside was protected through policy, but it was also a working environment and residents had to accept the noise and odours associated with farming. He noted Councillor McIntosh's concerns and said that the area must guard against any similar environmental problems as faced in the Wye Valley. He recommended that Members vote with the officer recommendation.

The Convener then moved to the vote on the report recommendation, to grant consent, taken by roll call. The report recommendation was supported unanimously.

DECISION

The Committee granted the planning application subject to the undernoted conditions.

1 The development hereby approved shall begin before the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission.

Reason: Pursuant to Section 58 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 as amended.

2 The area to be used for poultry free range roaming in association with the use of poultry shed hereby approved shall be solely limited to the free range area shown on the approved plan 'Appendix 5.8 - Supplementary Plan - Range Area' docketed to this planning permission.

A 1.2 metres high stock proof fencing around the range area shall be erected prior to the use of the shed hereby approved and retained and maintained for the duration of the operation of the poultry shed.

Reason: In order to conserve the biodiversity of Howden Wood ancient woodland.

3 Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development)(Scotland) Order 1992, or any subsequent Order amending, revoking or re enacting that Order, no external lighting shall be installed on site without the details first being submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority.

Thereafter, the lighting shall be installed as approved.

Reason:

To control the lighting on site in the interests of protecting the character of the rural area from light pollution.

4 Prior to the occupation of the poultry shed hereby approved a visibility splay of 2.5 metres by 160 metres shall be provided and maintained on each side of the proposed access onto the B6368 public road. There shall be no obstruction to visibility above a height of 1.05 metres measured from the adjacent carriageway level within the area defined below:-

a) A line 2.5 metres long measured along the access road from the nearside edge of the main road carriageway.

b) A line 160 metres long measured along the nearside edge of the main road carriageway from the centre of the access road in both directions.

c) A straight line joining the termination of the above two lines.

Reason:

To ensure there are sufficient sightlines for drivers of vehicles egressing from the site in the interest of road safety.

5 Prior to the shed hereby approved being brought into use, a turning area shall be provided and shall thereafter be maintained free of parked vehicles or other obstructions as shown stamped approved drawing 'Appendix 5.2 - Site Plan drawing No. COG2167/APP/019/e' dated 09.03.22 docketed to this permission.

Reason:

To ensure vehicles can enter the site and egress onto the main public road in forward gear, in the interest of road safety.

6 The first 15 metres of the access road hereby approved, as measured from the southern edge of the B6368 road, shall be hard formed for its full width.

Reason: To prevent loose material entering the public road in the interests of road safety.

7 The Rating Level, LArTr, of noise associated with the operation of the existing and proposed poultry buildings, including noise from associated plant/equipment, when measured 3.5m from the façade of any neighbouring residential property, shall be no more than 5dB (A) above the background noise level, LA90,T. All measurements to be made in accordance with BS 4142: 2014 "Methods for Rating and Assessing Industrial and Commercial Sound"

Noise arising from any plant or equipment associated with the existing and proposed poultry building shall not exceed Noise Rating Curve NR 20 at any Octave Band Frequency when measured within any neighbouring residential property assuming windows open at least 50mm.

Reason: To safeguard the residential amenity of neighbouring residential properties.

8 By no later than the planting season following the commencement of development of this poultry shed hereby approved, which would be October 2022 through to March 2023 the bund and planting all as approved by planning permission 21/01235/P shall be completed in accordance with the drawings docketed to that planning permission and to the satisfaction of the Planning Authority.

Reason:

In order to ensure the implementation of a landscaping scheme to enhance the appearance of the development in the interests of the amenity of the area.

9 Prior to the commencement of development, a report on the actions to be taken to reduce the Carbon Emissions from the build and from the completed development shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. This shall include the provision of

renewable technology for the new building, where feasible and appropriate in design terms. The details shall include a timetable for implementation. Development shall thereafter be carried out in accordance with the report so approved.

Reason: To minimise the environmental impact of the development.

3. PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 22/00681/AMM: APPROVAL OF MATTERS SPECIFIED IN CONDITIONS OF PLANNING PERMISSION IN PRINCIPLE 18/00485/PPM – ERECTION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL AND ASSOCIATED WORKS, LAND TO THE NORTH OF OLD CRAIGHALL VILLAGE, OLD CRAIGHALL ROAD, MUSSELBURGH

A report was submitted in relation to Planning Application No. 22/00681/AMM. Neil Millar, Planner, presented the report, summarising the key points. The report recommendation was to grant consent.

Officers responded to questions from Members. Responding to questions from Councillor McIntosh, Mr Millar said that the Energy Statement Report would provide steps taken to minimise the new school's energy footprint, but solar panels and air source heat pumps were planned. He also advised that there would be no designated drop-off point, and the School Travel Plan would identify safer appropriate routes for active travel. School design no longer crafted areas for children to be dropped off by car; there would be a number of cycle routes to school and the site was within walking distance of Musselburgh railway station. He also advised there would be a woodland trail within the southwest corner of the site to encourage nurturing of habitat and an interest in biodiversity.

Councillor Forrest welcomed the plans to build a school in the area. He hoped the safe routes to school would be well designed to encourage active travel, and that there would not be a way in which parents could stop at the side of the road to drop children off in cars. Councillor Yorkston also commended the amount of green space around the school to facilitate outdoor learning.

Councillor McMillan spoke of the pride afforded to a place from a well-designed building such as the school. He hoped it would be seen as an opportunity to build a sense of community and to encourage safe and active travel to school.

The Convener then moved to the vote on the report recommendation, to grant consent, taken by roll call. The report recommendation was supported unanimously.

DECISION

The Committee granted the planning application subject to the undernoted conditions.

1 No development shall take place on site unless and until final site setting out details have been submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority.

The above mentioned details shall include a final site setting-out drawing to a scale of not less than 1:200, giving:

a. the position within the application site of all elements of the proposed development and position of adjoining land and buildings;

b. finished ground and floor levels of the development relative to existing ground levels of the site and of adjoining land and building(s). The levels shall be shown in relation to an

Ordnance Bench Mark or Temporary Bench Mark from which the Planning Authority can take measurements and shall be shown on the drawing; and c. the ridge height of the proposed shown in relation to the finished ground and floor levels on the site.

Reason:

To enable the Planning Authority to control the development of the site in the interests of the amenity of the area.

2 A schedule of materials and finishes, including their colours, to be used on the exterior of the primary school building hereby approved shall be submitted to and approved in advance by the Planning Authority prior to their use in the development. The colour of the materials and finishes used shall accord with the schedule and samples of them so approved.

Reason:

To enable the Planning Authority to control the materials, finishes and colour to be used to achieve a development of good quality and appearance in the interest of the visual amenity of the area.

3 Prior to commencement of development hereby approved, confirmation of Scottish Water's technical approval of the surface water drainage proposals for the development shall be submitted to and approved in advance by the Planning Authority.

Reason:

To ensure that the drainage design can be vested by Scottish Water in the interest of flood prevention.

4 Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved a noise assessment shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. The Assessment shall identify any mitigation measures, including a timetable for their implementation, to ensure compliance with design criteria noise levels specified in Table 6 of BS8233:2014 "Guidance on sound insulation and noise reduction in buildings."

Therafter, any mitigation measures shall be fully implemented prior to occupation of the school building hereby approved and therafter retained.

Reason:

To ensure that noise levels are acceptable to the future users of the primary school building.

5 Prior to the installation of any artifical lighting or floodlights being erected to serve the two sports pitches hereby approved, a lighting assessment shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. The design and construction of any proposed floodlighting shall take account of the Guidance contained within Annex 1 to Appendix 2 of Scottish Government Guidance to Accompany the Statutory Nuisance Provisions of the Public Health etc (Scotland) Act 2008 to ensure that the following criteria be met prior to any external lighting becoming operational:

(i) Light Trespass (onto windows) of neighbouring residential properties, measured as Vertical Illuminance in Lux, (Ev), shall not exceed 10 between the hours of 0700-2300 and shall not exceed 2 between the hours of 2300-0700.

A Light Spill iso-contour plan shall be provided to ensure the above requirement can be met.

The lighting shall thereafter be maintained as approved unless the Planning Authority given written consent to any variation.

Reason:

To prevent lighting from spilling onto neighbouring land, in the interests of safeguarding the amenity of future occupants of neighbouring residential properties.

6 Noise associated with the operation of any plant and/or equipment associated with the operation of the school building hereby approved shall not exceed Noise Rating Curve NR25

at any octave band frequency between the hours of 0700 and 2300 within any neighbouring residential property, with all measurements to be made with windows open at least 50mm.

Reason:

In the interests of safeguarding the amenity of future occupants of neighbouring residential properties.

7 All new planting, seeding and turfing as detailed on drawing numbers 1953-RAF-XX-XX-D-L-01003-PLANTING PLAN-2131 Rev P06 titled 'Planting Plan' and 1953-RAF-XX-XX-D-L-01001-LANDSCAPE LAYOUT P1-2131 Rev P11 titled 'Landscape Layout Phase 1' docketed to this planning permission shall be carried out in the first planting season (between November and February) following the completion of the development hereby approved. Any new trees or plants which within a period of five years from the completion of the development die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar size and species, unless the Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation.

Reason:

In order to ensure the implementation of a landscaping scheme to enhance the appearance of the development in the interests of the amenity of the area.

8 Prior to the commencement of development, a Construction Method Statement which sets out how the impact of construction activity on the safety and amenity of the area will be mitigated shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. The Construction Method Statement shall include details of:

(i) mitigation measures to control noise, dust, construction traffic (including routes to/from site and delivery times);

(ii) hours of construction work;

(iii) routes for construction traffic;

(iv) how building materials and waste will be safely stored and managed on site; and

(v) wheel washing facilities or alternative facilities to prevent deleterious materials being carried onto the public road on vehicle tyres.

Thereafter, the Construction Method Statement shall be implemented and complied with in accordance with the approved details for the period of construction of the development hereby approved and the wheel washing facilities or any alternative facility so approved shall be provided and maintained in working order during the period of construction operations at the site.

Reason:

To minimise the impact of construction traffic in the interests of road and pedestrian safety in the locality and relative to school generated vehicle and pedestrian movements.

9 Prior to any use being made of the primary school building hereby approved, the proposed access roads, parking spaces, cycle parking and footpaths shall have been constructed on site in accordance with the docketed drawings.

Those areas of land shall not thereafter be used for any other purpose than for accessing and for the parking of vehicles in connection with the use of the primary school building and shall not be adapted or used for other purposes without the prior written approval of the Planning Authority.

Reason:

To ensure that adequate and satisfactory provision is made for access and for parking in the interests of road safety.

10 Prior to any use being made of the primary school building hereby approved, details, including a timetable for their implementation, showing compliance with the following off-site transportation requirements shall be submitted to and approved in writing in advance by the Planning Authority.

(i) a Toucan Crossing on the northern development frontage road;

(ii) a 'Copenhagen' style Crossing on the site's vehicular access;

(iii) bus stops and associated bus shelters on the B6145 public road; and

(iv) 'School Ahead' warning signage on the northern development frontage road.

These transportation requirements shall thereafter be carried out in accordance with the details and timetable so approved.

Reason:

In the interests of road and pedestrian safety.

11 Prior to the commencement of development hereby approved, details for the provision of a puffin crossing, bus stops/bus shelters and 'School Ahead' signage on the re-aligned distributor road to the east of the application site (which was approved by the grant of approval of matters specified in conditions permission 19/01321/AMM) shall be submitted to and approved in advance by the Planning Authority. The details shall include a timetable for the installation of the puffin crossing, bus stops/bus shelters and 'School Ahead' signage. The puffin crossing, bus stops/shelters and 'School Ahead' signage shall thereafter be installed in accordance with the details so approved and shall thereafter remain in place, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of road and pedestrian safety.

12 Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved a Stage 1 Road Safety Audit shall be undertaken for the preliminary design of all roadworks, footways and cycle paths to be formed. This process shall be completed through Stages 2, 3 & 4 which are Completion of Detailed Design, Completion of Construction & Post Opening Monitoring using 12 months of validated post scheme opening road traffic collision data - all in accordance with GG119 Road Safety Audit Rev1. The Road Safety Audit shall include; the proposed roads, junctions, footways, cycle paths and pedestrian crossings where provided. The findings of the Road Safety Audit shall be submitted for the approval of the Planning Authority prior to the implementation of any outcomes arising from them.

The outcomes of the initial Quality and Safety Audits shall be implemented (including the designers response) through the detailed design stages and the full audit processes (i.e. Safety Audit and Quality Audit) completed through the design and implementation stages - including post construction/opening in accordance with a timetable to be agreed with the Planning Authority in advance of the opening of the primary school building.

Reason:

In the interests of road and pedestrian safety.

13 Prior to the commencement of use of the primary school building hereby approved, a School Travel Plan shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. The School Travel Plan shall have particular regard to provision for walking, cycling and public transport access to and within the site, including the identification of appropriate Safer Routes to School, and will identify the measures to be provided, the system of management, monitoring, review, reporting and duration of the plan.

The approved School Travel Plan shall be implemented prior to the use of the primary school building.

Reason: In the interest of road safety.

14 The actions to be taken to reduce the carbon emissions from the building as detailed in the Energy Statement Summary docketed to this planning permission and the proposals for Electric Vehicle Charging provision as detailed on drawing number 1953-JMA-ZZ-ZZ-D-A-PL102 Rev P03 titled 'Proposed Site Plan' docketed to this planning permission shall be fully implemented on site prior to any use being made of the primary school building and thereafter shall be retained unless otherwise approved in writing by the Planning Authority. Reason: To minimise the environmental impact of the development.

4. PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 21/01289/P: ERECTION OF TWO RETAIL STORES (CLASS 1), CAR PARKING, SERVICING, ACCESS, AND ASSOCIATED WORKS, LAND EAST OF DUNBAR GARDEN CENTRE, SPOTT ROAD, DUNBAR

A report was submitted in relation to Planning Application No. 21/001289/P. Daryth Irving, Senior Planner, presented the report, summarising the key points. The report recommendation was to grant consent.

Officers responded to questions from Members. Mr Irving said that Roads Services were satisfied that the development could be accessed safely by pedestrians and cyclists, but recommended provision of more direct footpaths. The Planning Authority had to ensure that anything asked of applicants was feasible and deliverable, and there were significant level differences on either side of the site and could also be third party landowner issues; in such circumstances, a feasibility study was required.

Phil Pritchett, agent, spoke to the application. The proposal was for a Lidl and a B&M, which would employ around 80 local people. He noted that Dunbar was the only town in the county with no large discount stores, and over a third of residents travelled to other towns to access alternative provision. He said the proposed new stores would help Dunbar become more self-sufficient, would add to the attraction of the town, and support shoppers in a cost of living crisis. He highlighted Lidl's green credentials, including use of solar panels, Scottish suppliers, and as a carbon-neutral business. Lidl also paid £1.40 per hour over the living wage. He said the applicant was inclined to provide signage and tourist boards to direct visitors to the town centre, and this was common on these types of peripheral developments. He noted the low number of objections and positive comments received. He also advised that new junctions at Spott Road would be completed prior to development construction.

Jo Waddell spoke against the application. She owned a local hostel, The Dolphin Inn. She acknowledged some of the positives of the application, such as the creation of jobs and greater budget choice for consumers, but noted that businesses in the town centre were already struggling to fill vacancies. She felt there was no need for more supermarkets in Dunbar, which already had an Asda and a sizeable Co-op. She spoke of Dunbar as a gateway to Scotland; she felt that a giant retail part was a poor welcome, was not representative of the 'eco park' previously discussed, and was contrary to tourism strategies. She felt that the town centre was being sacrificed. The busier Spott Road became, the greater challenge faced in reaching the town centre. She highlighted that such developments were actively being discouraged in new Scottish Government retail and planning strategies. She felt that the developments did not enhance place-making and would be detrimental to Dunbar's town centre and local businesses.

Graeme Laing spoke against the application on behalf of his client, the Co-op. He described the Co-op as a key investor and stakeholder in East Lothian's town centres. The Co-op felt it should have had the opportunity to review and make comment on the Retail Impact Report and the applicant's response, neither of which were made publicly available. Mr Laing refuted comments that the Co-op had not invested in their Dunbar stores, citing the £1.5m investment in the Countess Crescent store in September 2021, and said this commitment to the town centre would be undermined by approval of the application. The development would reduce the reasons for visiting the town centre and have a detrimental impact on all businesses. Independent advice said that there could be an impact of up to 27% on the town centre, and Mr Laing had seldom seen such a high level of predicted impact. He said that

the proposals were contrary to Policy TC1 of the LDP, and the Co-op disagreed that the benefits of the development were of a significance to justify policy departure.

Jacquie Bell spoke against the application on behalf of Dunbar Community Council. They felt that the DunBear site could have offered an interesting gateway to the county. She noted that NPF4 did not support out-of-town retail, and said that the development would erode the town centre when the pandemic and cost of living had already made trade difficult. Should the application be approved, it was important that signage be erected to show visitors what the town centre had to offer. Dunbar Community Council felt the application should be delayed to consider traffic flow, air pollution, and noise. They felt the applicant should pay for improvements to the inadequate pavements on Spott Road, and highlighted the need for people to feed safe to engage in active travel. She noted the difficulties getting in and out of Brodie Road at peak times, to be made worse by the five sets of traffic lights proposed. They felt that developer contributions should be spent on improving access points on the A1. She highlighted that prime agricultural land was being covered by hard landscaping, which would not help flooding or biodiversity.

Jacquie Bell spoke against the application on behalf of West Barns Community Council, who echoed the concerns of Dunbar Community Council, and she also noted concerns of East Lammermuir Community Council. West Barns had been affected by traffic pressures of Dunbar developments, but dependence had also grown on Dunbar for shopping and services. Those who did not drive were more likely to use the high street, and there was concern about the development's threat to the town centre. She noted the badly designed Spott Road roundabout and the potential to add to congestion. The community council asked Members to reject the application because it was in opposition to the climate change strategy and counter to NPF4. They felt that something more exciting than a retail park should be developed on a site which was a gateway into East Lothian, overlooked by a statue which was meant to symbolise John Muir.

Responding to a question from the Convener, Ms Bell said that some people would welcome the development, but the community councils had concerns about the overall masterplan, issues caused for the town centre, and lack of opportunities for active travel.

Councillor Collins, Local Member, said she had called the application to Committee to allow the people of Dunbar to make their views heard. She said she often met Dunbar residents in the Haddington Retail Park, who were having to travel outside of Dunbar to shop at the discount retailers; she felt that Dunbar was losing out on this trade. She said that the local traders in the town centre offered superior quality goods which could not be replaced by stores on the development; she felt that custom pulled away temporarily would return, and gave an account of the many well-established traders in Dunbar able to provide specialised and personalised services. She thought it would be beneficial to the local businesses if the developers would erect signage to advertise the town centre.

Councillor McIntosh also acknowledged the specialised services offered in the town centre, but felt that vibrant town centre businesses were being put at risk by the development. She worried that the application was incompatible with the Climate Change Strategy, but noted that people were driving to other towns to access discounters in any case. She thought that the peripheral development would not serve those who did not have access to a car. She questioned why Lidl could not be in the town centre without parking, for people to access on public transport or using active travel, and felt that the assumption that a development required a large car park was problematic. She felt that something should be done with the pavements to secure active travel opportunities, and questioned whether a homogenous offer of stores across all the towns should be considered a positive argument.

Councillor Cassini echoed Councillor McIntosh's points. She felt that a discount retailer would be of use in an area of deprivation, but less helpful on a site where a car was required

for access. She felt that access would have to be improved to the site, and thought the eco park sounded a better idea than a group of discount retailers on the edge of town.

Councillor Forrest said that it had been useful to hear the objections, including from the Coop, and had also found the report from Roderick MacLean Associates convincing. He would support the application. Councillor McMillan felt that the risks highlighted by the objectors were outweighed by the potential benefits, including opportunities with good employers, and peripheral developments leading to more visitors; the challenge would be to ensure that visitors also made their way to the town centre. He felt that the development would be compatible with the concept of 20-minute neighbourhoods, and would help to sustain Dunbar's new housing. He thought there was an opportunity to show an increased number of visitors Dunbar's wider attractions.

The Convener said that Members were aware that Spott Road was a busy area, and issues with the narrow pavement needed to be resolved, but this burden could not be placed on one developer. He felt that transportation officers ought to look at improving pedestrian links to the area. He felt that taking away the mini roundabout and installing traffic lights would represent a major improvement. The masterplan indicated that the distributor road would provide another access into the town if it came forward at a later date. Impact on retail was the biggest concern, but he said that Dunbar was losing trade to other towns with discount retailers. Continued investment to enhance the town was needed, and local residents who would want to access a discount retailer locally had to be considered. He would do everything he could to ensure improvements were made to pedestrian routes in the area, and to make sure the high street retained its vibrancy.

Councillor McLeod welcomed the two well-known retailers to Dunbar and the creation of jobs. He would support the application.

Councillor Collins proposed that signage be erected to advertise town centre businesses, and this was seconded by Councillor Hampshire. Mr Dingwall provided a form of words to be added to the conditions.

The Convener then moved to the vote on the report recommendation, to grant consent, taken by roll call.

For:	8	(Councillors Hampshire, Cassini, Collins, Forrest, McGinn, McLeod, McMillan, and Yorkston)
Against: Abstentions:	1 0	(Councillor McIntosh)

DECISION

The Committee granted the planning application subject to the undernoted conditions.

1 The development hereby approved shall begin before the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission.

Reason: Pursuant to Section 58 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 as amended.

2 No development shall take place on site unless and until final site setting out details have been submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority.

The above mentioned details shall include a final site setting-out drawing to a scale of not less than 1:200, giving:

a. the position within the application site of all elements of the proposed development and position of adjoining land and buildings;

b. finished ground and floor levels of the development relative to existing ground levels of the site and of adjoining land and building(s). The levels shall be shown in relation to an Ordnance Bench Mark or Temporary Bench Mark from which the Planning Authority can take measurements and shall be shown on the drawing; and

c. the ridge height of the proposed shown in relation to the finished ground and floor levels on the site.

Reason:

To enable the Planning Authority to control the development of the site in the interests of the amenity of the area.

3 The retail unit hereby approved as shown as 'Unit 1' on the drawings docketed to this planning permission shall have a gross floor area no greater than 1900 square metres and a net sales floor area no greater than 1256 square metres. Of the net sales floor area no more than 1005 square metres shall be used for the sale of convenience goods. The retail unit shall not be subdivided to form more than 1 retail unit.

Reason:

In order to retain control over the format of retail development at the site and in the interests of safeguarding the vitality and viability of the retail function of Dunbar Town Centre.

4 The retail unit hereby approved as shown as 'Unit 2' on the drawings docketed to this planning permission shall have a gross floor area no greater than 2137 square metres and a net sales floor area no greater than 1923 square metres. Of the net sales floor area no more than 769 square metres shall be used for the sale of convenience goods. The retail unit shall not be subdivided to form more than 1 retail unit.

Reason:

In order to retain control over the format of retail development at the site and in the interests of safeguarding the vitality and viability of the retail function of Dunbar Town Centre.

5 Prior to the commencement of development a detailed specification and, if requested, samples, of all external finishes to be used in the proposed development shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. The external finishes used in the development shall conform to the details so approved.

Reason:

To ensure the development is of a satisfactory appearance in the interest of the amenity of the locality.

6 Prior to any use being made of the two retail units hereby approved, the proposed access roads, parking spaces and footpaths to serve them shall have been constructed on site in accordance with the docketed drawings.

Those areas of land shall not thereafter be used for any other purpose than for accessing and for the parking of vehicles in connection with the use of the retail units, and shall not be adapted or used for other purposes without the prior written approval of the Planning Authority.

Reason:

To ensure that adequate and satisfactory provision is made for access and for off-street parking in the interests of road safety.

7 Prior to any use being made of the two retail units hereby approved the infrastructure works, including paths and footways, which are the subject of planning permission 20/00916/P shall be implemented in full.

Reason:

To ensure the development can be safely accessed in the interests of road and pedestrian safety.

8 Prior to any use being made of either of the two retail units hereby approved the Spott Road/Kellie Road roundabout shall be upgraded to a fully signalised junction with pedestrian and cyclist crossing facilities on each arm. Details of the signalised junction, including a timetable for its implementation, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority and thereafter those works shall be implemented as so approved, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Planning Authority.

Reason:

To ensure the development can be safely accessed in the interests of road and pedestrian safety.

9 Prior to the commencement of development the applicant shall:

(i) investigate whether or not it is feasible to form direct active travel path links from the application site to the west towards Dunbar Garden Centre, and to the east to the road the subject of planning permission 20/00916/P; and

(ii) details of this investigation and of any feasible footpath routes shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. If there is a feasible route then the details shall include a timetable for the formation of the footpaths.

Development shall thereafter be carried out in accordance with the details so approved.

Reason:

In the interests of promoting sustainable modes of transport.

10 Notwithstanding that which is shown on the drawings docketed to this planning permission and prior to commencement of development, details of revised proposals for cycle parking, including a timetable for their provision, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. Thereafter the cycle parking shall be provided in accordance with the details so approved, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of promoting sustainable modes of transport.

11 A Travel Plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority prior to any use being made of the two retail units hereby approved. The Travel Plan shall have particular regard to provision for walking, cycling and public transport access to and within the site, shall include local bus and train timetables, local cycling and walking maps, information on bike hire / car sharing, and shall include details of how it will be distributed to residents. It shall also include a timetable for its implementation, details of the measures to be provided, the system of management, monitoring, review, reporting and duration of the Plan.

Reason: In the interests of ensuring sustainable travel patterns in respect of the development.

12 A Construction Method Statement to minimise the impact of construction activity on the amenity of the area, including from the effects of noise and dust, shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority prior to the commencement of development. The Construction Method Statement shall recommend mitigation measures to control construction traffic, shall include hours of construction work and routes of construction traffic to/from the site. It shall also include any temporary measures to be put in place to control surface water drainage during the construction of the SuDS, and state that the existing route to school path from the railway underpass to Spott Road must remain open at all times. It shall also make recommendations in respect of how building materials and waste will be safely stored and managed on site.

The Construction Method Statement shall also include details of wheel washing facilities to be provided, and that these facilities shall be maintained in working order during the period of operation of the site. All vehicles must use the wheel washing facilities to prevent deleterious materials being carried onto the public road on vehicle tyres.

Thereafter, the Construction Method Statement shall be implemented and complied with in accordance with the approved details for the period of construction of the development hereby approved.

Reason:

To minimise the impact of construction activity in the interests of the amenity of the area.

13 Prior to commencement of development, confirmation of Scottish Water's technical approval of the surface water drainage proposals for the development hereby approved shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority.

Reason:

To ensure that the drainage design can be vested by Scottish Water in the interest of flood prevention.

14 No development shall take place on the site until the applicant has undertaken and reported upon a programme of archaeological work (Metal Detecting Survey and Archaeological Evaluation by Trial Trench) in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant (or their agent) and approved by the Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of archaeological and natural heritage.

15 Prior to the commencement of development, to ensure that the site is clear of contamination, a Geo-Environmental Assessment shall be carried out and the following information shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority:

1. (i) A Preliminary Investigation incorporating a Phase I Desk Study (including site reconnaissance, development of a conceptual model and an initial risk assessment); and

(ii) A Phase II Ground Investigation (if the Desk Study has determined that further assessment is required), comprising the following:

o A survey of the extent, scale and nature of contamination, and reporting on the appropriate risk assessment(s) carried out with regards to Human Health, the Water Environment and Gas Characteristic Situation as well as an updated conceptual model of the site;

o An appraisal of the remediation methods available and proposal of the preferred option(s).

The Desk Study and Ground Investigation must be undertaken by suitably qualified, experienced and competent persons and must be conducted in accordance with the relevant guidance and procedures.

If it is concluded by the Reporting that remediation of the site is not required, then Parts 2 and 3 of this Condition can be disregarded.

2. Prior to any works beginning on site (and where risks have been identified), a detailed Remediation Statement should be produced that shows the site is to be brought to a condition suitable for the intended use by the removal of unacceptable risks to all relevant and statutory receptors. The Statement should detail all works to be undertaken, proposed remediation objectives and remediation criteria, timetable of works and site management procedures. It should also ensure that the site will not qualify as contaminated land under Part2A of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 in relation to the intended use of the land following development; and

3. Following completion of the measures identified in the approved Remediation Statement, a Verification Report should be submitted that demonstrates the effectiveness of the remediation carried out.

Reason:

To ensure that the site is clear of contamination and that remediation works are acceptable.

16 In the event that unexpected ground conditions (contamination) are encountered at any time when carrying out the permitted development, work on site shall cease and the issue shall be reported to the Planning Authority immediately. At this stage a Site Investigation and subsequent Risk Assessment may have to be carried out, if requested by the Planning Authority. It may also be necessary to submit a Remediation Strategy should the reporting determine that remedial measures are required. It should also be noted that a Verification Report would also need to be submitted confirming the satisfactory completion of these remedial works.

Reason:

To ensure that the site is clear of contamination.

17 Prior to the commencement of development, detail of the red sandstone wall and red sandstone pillars to be erected on the application site shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. The detail shall include a timetable for its provision. Thereafter the red sandstone wall and red sandstone pillars shall be erected on the application site in accordance with the approved details prior to any use being made of either of the two retail units hereby approved.

Reason: In the interests of achieving an appropriate landscaped setting for the development.

18 Notwithstanding that which is shown on the drawings docketed to this planning permission and prior to the commencement of development, a revised detailed scheme of landscaping shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. The revised scheme of landscaping shall show the replacement of slate chips on the south side of the car park with turf or low planting, and the planting of feature trees such as fastigiated oaks along the south side of the site, both on the south side of the stone feature wall and at either side of the vehicular accesses to each of the buildings hereby approved.

All planting, seeding or turfing comprised in the approved details of landscaping shall be carried out in the first planting and seeding season following the occupation of any of the buildings or the completion of the development, whichever is the sooner. Any trees in the approved scheme of landscaping which die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased within ten years of completion of the development shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar species and final size, unless the Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation. All new planting comprised in the scheme of landscaping shall be retained and maintained unless the Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation.

Reason: In the interests of achieving an appropriate landscaped setting for the development.

19 Notwithstanding that which is shown on the drawings docketed to this planning permission and prior to the commencement of development, a revised scheme for the provision of car charging points and associated infrastructure for them, where feasible and appropriate in design terms, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. The scheme shall include a timetable for implementation. Development shall thereafter be carried out in accordance with the charging points scheme so approved.

Reason:

To minimise the environmental impact of the development.

20 Prior to the commencement of development, a report on the actions to be taken to reduce the Carbon Emissions from the build and from the completed development shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. This shall include the provision of renewable technology for all new buildings, where feasible and appropriate in design terms. The details shall include a timetable for implementation. Development shall thereafter be carried out in accordance with the report so approved.

Reason:

To minimise the environmental impact of the development.

21 Prior to the commencement of the development, details of an advertisement sign or signs, promoting Dunbar Town Centre, to be displayed within the site, shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. Neither of the retail stores shall be opened for trade unless and until the sign or signs are being displayed on site in accordance with the details so approved. The sign or signs shall not thereafter be altered or removed unless otherwise approved in advance by the Planning Authority.

Reason:

In the interests of promoting the viability and vitality of Dunbar Town Centre.

5. PLANNING APPLICATION NO. 22/00021/P: ERECTION OF COFFEE SHOP (CLASS 3), WITH OUTDOOR SEATING AREA, DRIVE THRU FACILITIES (SUI GENERIS), AND ASSOCIATED WORKS, LAND EAST OF MCDONALD'S, SPOTT ROAD, DUNBAR

A report was submitted in relation to Planning Application No. 22/00021/P. Daryth Irving, Senior Planner, presented the report, summarising the key points. The report recommendation was to grant consent.

Phil Pritchett, agent, spoke to the application. A local business, Mungo Park Ltd., would operate the premises as a Starbucks franchise. They already operated a number of coffee shops on the east coast; this would be their first in East Lothian, and the coffee shop would employ up to 20 members of staff. A number of infrastructure improvements were to be made before the coffee shop would open for trade, and Mr Pritchett said that the proposal was therefore important to help justify and pay for those infrastructure works. He said that conditions for infrastructure improvements were welcomed. He highlighted that officers had assessed the proposals to be in line with planning policy. He said that the coffee shop had the potential to divert trade from the A1 into Dunbar, and said the commercial developments would help the overall economy of the town.

Jacquie Bell spoke against the application on behalf of Dunbar Community Council. She asked, should the application be granted, that an additional condition for the erection of signage to advertise local businesses also be applied to this application. Concerns had been raised by Dunbar, West Barns, and East Lammermuir Community Councils, Dunbar Traders' Association, and some residents. The concerns for road and pedestrian safety previously noted also applied to this application, with the drive-thru encouraging the use of cars. She raised concern about signage, which was poor and saw people making U-turns on Brodie Road and Kelly Road. It was also expected that the proposed traffic lights would cause congestion on the feeder roads. There was concern that noise and air pollution would be caused by traffic build-up to enter and exit the retail park, and the community council felt money would be better invested in cycleways. She noted that NPF4 did not support out-of-town retail. It was also felt that a Starbucks was not needed when there were many coffee shop options in the town centre, and these businesses were already struggling to find staff.

Councillor Collins, Local Member, said she had called the application to Planning Committee to allow local businesses and residents a say in the debate and opportunity to ask questions.

Councillor McIntosh felt that the risks posed to the town centre outweighed the benefits brought by the developments, and could see no positive reason to open a Starbucks. She thought it seemed ridiculous to approve a drive-thru, thus normalising car culture when the council had made commitments to reducing car kilometres. She highlighted that benefit from job creation would be lost should businesses in the town fold due to lost custom. She was

also concerned about traffic queues coming off the A1, and could not support the application.

The Convener spoke about a study of A1 traffic, where the destination for most of the traffic was Edinburgh, with few vehicles stopping in Dunbar. With greater use of electric vehicles, people needed to be able to plan journeys; the development would offer a number of EV charging points, and the opportunity to stop for a coffee. He welcomed the proposals and the increase in visitors to Dunbar, some of whom would also decide to visit the town centre.

Councillor Cassini had been surprised to see an application for a drive-thru. She felt there was an overabundance of Starbucks branches, which took custom away from local businesses who could offer a more personalised service. After discussion of the offer of EV charging points, the Convener confirmed that this application did offer a number of charging points.

The Convener then moved to the vote on the report recommendation, to grant consent, taken by roll call.

For:7(Councillors Hampshire, Collins, Forrest, McGinn, McLeod, McMillan
and Yorkston)Against:2(Councillors Cassini and McIntosh)Abstentions:0

DECISION

The Committee granted the planning application subject to the undernoted conditions.

1 The development hereby approved shall begin before the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission.

Reason: Pursuant to Section 58 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 as amended.

2 No development shall take place on site unless and until final site setting out details have been submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority.

The above mentioned details shall include a final site setting-out drawing to a scale of not less than 1:200, giving:

a. the position within the application site of all elements of the proposed development and position of adjoining land and buildings;

b. finished ground and floor levels of the development relative to existing ground levels of the site and of adjoining land and building(s). The levels shall be shown in relation to an Ordnance Bench Mark or Temporary Bench Mark from which the Planning Authority can take measurements and shall be shown on the drawing; and

c. the ridge height of the proposed shown in relation to the finished ground and floor levels on the site.

Reason:

To enable the Planning Authority to control the development of the site in the interests of the amenity of the area.

3 Prior to the commencement of development a detailed specification and, if requested, samples, of all external finishes to be used in the proposed development shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. The external finishes used in the development shall conform to the details so approved.

Reason:

To ensure the development is of a satisfactory appearance in the interest of the amenity of the locality.

4 Prior to any use being made of the coffee shop building hereby approved, the proposed access roads, parking spaces and footpaths to serve them shall have been constructed on site in accordance with the docketed drawings.

Those areas of land shall not thereafter be used for any other purpose than for accessing and for the parking of vehicles in connection with the use of the coffee shop, and shall not be adapted or used for other purposes without the prior written approval of the Planning Authority.

Reason:

To ensure that adequate and satisfactory provision is made for access and for off-street parking in the interests of road safety.

5 Prior to any use being made of the coffee shop building hereby approved the infrastructure works, including paths and footways, which are the subject of planning permission 20/00916/P shall be implemented in full.

Reason:

To ensure the development can be safely accessed in the interests of road and pedestrian safety.

6 Prior to any use being made of coffee shop building hereby approved the Spott Road/Kellie Road roundabout shall be upgraded to a fully signalised junction with pedestrian and cyclist crossing facilities on each arm. Details of the signalised junction, including a timetable for its implementation, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority and thereafter those works shall be implemented as so approved, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Planning Authority.

Reason:

To ensure the development can be safely accessed in the interests of road and pedestrian safety.

7 Prior to any use being made of the coffee shop building hereby approved, the EV charging spaces and infrastructure for them, and the cycle parking stands shall have been provided on site in accordance with the docketed drawings.

Those areas of land shall not thereafter be used for any other purpose than for EV car charging and cycle parking in connection with the use of the coffee shop, and shall not be adapted or used for other purposes without the prior written approval of the Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of promoting sustainable modes of transport.

8 A Travel Plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority prior to any use being made of the two retail units hereby approved. The Travel Plan shall have particular regard to provision for walking, cycling and public transport access to and within the site, shall include local bus and train timetables, local cycling and walking maps, information on bike hire / car sharing, and shall include details of how it will be distributed to residents. It shall also include a timetable for its implementation, details of the measures to be provided, the system of management, monitoring, review, reporting and duration of the Plan.

Reason: In the interests of ensuring sustainable travel patterns in respect of the development.

9 A Construction Method Statement to minimise the impact of construction activity on the amenity of the area, including from the effects of noise and dust, shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority prior to the commencement of development. The Construction Method Statement shall recommend mitigation measures to control construction traffic, shall include hours of construction work and routes of construction traffic to/from the

site. It shall also make recommendations in respect of how building materials and waste will be safely stored and managed on site.

The Construction Method Statement shall also include details of wheel washing facilities to be provided, and that these facilities shall be maintained in working order during the period of operation of the site. All vehicles must use the wheel washing facilities to prevent deleterious materials being carried onto the public road on vehicle tyres.

Thereafter, the Construction Method Statement shall be implemented and complied with in accordance with the approved details for the period of construction of the development hereby approved.

Reason:

To minimise the impact of construction activity in the interests of the amenity of the area.

10 Prior to commencement of development full details of the proposed Sustainable Drainage System (SuDS) scheme and drainage strategy for the site, which must be in accordance with the Council's Supplementary Planning Guidance 'Sustainable Drainage Systems (SuDS)', shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. The details shall include a timetable for the implementation of the SuDS scheme and site drainage strategy. The development shall thereafter be carried out in strict accordance with the details so approved, unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Planning Authority.

Reason:

To ensure that development is not at risk from flooding, there is no increase in flood risk elsewhere and appropriate long-term maintenance arrangements are in place.

11 No development shall take place until there has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority a scheme of landscaping. The scheme shall provide details of: the height and slopes of any mounding on or re-contouring of the site including SuDS basin/ponds details; tree and shrub sizes, species, habitat, siting, planting distances and a programme of planting. Non-thorn shrub species should be located adjacent to pedestrian areas. The scheme shall include indications of all existing trees and hedgerows on and adjacent to the application site, details of any to be retained, and measures for their protection in the course of development.

In addition to that shown on docketed drawing no. PL-SP-02 Rev B, the scheme of landscaping shall include:

- (i) large species shrubs to the northwest corner of the site;
- (ii) a line of feature trees of medium fastigiate species to the west side of the site; and (iii) hornbeam hedge planting to the north and east boundaries of the site.

All planting, seeding or turfing comprised in the approved details of landscaping shall be carried out in the first planting and seeding season following the completion of the development or occupation of the building hereby approved, whichever is the sooner, and any trees which within a period of ten years from the completion of the development die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar size and species, unless the Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation. All existing and new planting comprised in the scheme of landscaping shall be retained and maintained unless the Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation.

Reason:

In order to ensure the implementation of a landscaping scheme to enhance the appearance of the development in the interests of the amenity of the area.

12 Prior to the commencement of development, the existing fencing and landscape planting along the north side of the A1 trunk road boundary adjacent to the full length of the south boundary of the application site shall be protected during construction of the development hereby approved in accordance with detail to be submitted to and approved in advance by the Planning Authority.

If the existing fencing or landscape planting along the north side of the A1 trunk road boundary adjacent to the full length of the south boundary of the application site is damaged during construction works it shall be repaired and/or reinstated in accordance with detail to be submitted and approved in advance by the Planning Authority following consultation with Transport Scotland.

Any replacement hedge shall be of a similar species in the same location and planted in the planting season (October to March) immediately flowing the damage/death of existing hedging. In the event that any such replacement hedge dies, is removed, or becomes seriously damaged or diseased within a period of 10 years following its planting it shall be replaced in the next planting season with another of similar species and final size, unless the Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation.

Reason:

In the interests of the landscape character of the area.

13 Prior to the commencement of development, a report on the actions to be taken to reduce the Carbon Emissions from the build and from the completed development shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. This shall include the provision of renewable technology for all new buildings, where feasible and appropriate in design terms. The details shall include a timetable for implementation. Development shall thereafter be carried out in accordance with the report so approved.

Reason:

To minimise the environmental impact of the development.

Signed

Councillor Norman Hampshire Convener of the Planning Committee